# LEARNING OUTCOMES ASSESSMENT

2023 – 2024 ANNUAL REPORT

COMPILED BY: LAURA J. CRIPPS, Ph.D. Assistant Dean of Curriculum and Assessment INTRODUCTION

COURSE-LEVEL LEARNING OUTCOMES ASSESSMENT (LOA)

GENERAL EDUCATION OUTCOME ASSESSMENT ANNUAL REPORT

CONTINUING EDUCATION LEARNING OUTCOMES ASSESSMENT REPORT

INSTITUTIONAL OUTCOMES ASSESSMENT

2023-2024 TEACHING & LEARNING/CENTER FOR PROFESSIONAL & ORGANIZATIONAL LEARNING

#### INTRODUCTION

Laura J. Cripps, Ph.D. Assistant Dean for Curriculum and Assessment

#### June 2024

The Community College of Baltimore County (CCBC) conducts intentional, systematic, and collaborative assessments of student and employee learning at course, program, general education curriculum, and institutional levels. The framework of assessment incorporates staff and faculty stakeholders in both the design, delivery, and internal evaluation of learning outcomes.

Assessment at CCBC is guided by the philosophy that all members of the institution share the responsibility for student learning and continuous improvement. Assessment is also pivotal to CCBC's strategic goal of Transformational Academics and the commitment to applying outcome-driven assessments 'to facilitate student achievement of core competencies, general education requirements and successful program outcomes, attending to equity for all students' (<u>CCBC Strategic Plan, 2024-2026</u>: 11).

Assessment practices for academic year 2023-2024 were reflective of CCBC's philosophy of shared responsibility, deriving from the work of various faculty driven committees including the annual cycle of program review and the work of the Program Review committee, the submission and approval of Program Outcomes Assessment Proposals (POAPs), the work of the General Education Review Board (GERB) and the General Education Assessment Team's (GrEAT's) in scoring and data evaluation of Common Graded Assignments (CGAs), and the work of the Learning Outcomes Assessment Advisory Board (LOAAB) and course-level outcomes assessment (LOA). CCBC's structure of assessment is cyclical, comprehensive, integrated, and student-centered. In academic year 2023-2024 the Program Review Committee evaluated eleven program review submissions, covering 31 distinct associate degrees and certificates. Led by the strategic priorities of enrollment growth, economic prosperity and transformational academics, the Program Review committee developed a new evaluation rubric which focused on equity in learning outcomes, program enrollment, student completions, workforce alignment and academic innovation. One program received the committee's approval with no changes, and ten programs were approved with mandatory changes within the next three years. These changes identified some common opportunities; strengthening collaboration with other offices within the college to increase and diversify program enrollments, and adding or expanding student success initiatives to increase completion rates.

General education courses in the Biological and Physical Science disciplines assessed outcomes in Fall 2023, and general education courses in Arts and Humanities assessed outcomes in Spring 2024. Overall, courses in the Biological and Physical Sciences scored in the 2 (*Approaches Expectations*) range for the majority of General Education outcomes. Courses scored in the 3 (*Meets Expectations*) range for Written & Oral Communication. Courses scored in the 1 (*Falls Below Expectations*) range for Local & Global Diversity. Detailed analysis of the Biological and Physical Sciences data is provided in the General Education section of this report. In addition to the continuous cycle of assessment, in academic year 2023-2024 the General Education Review Board (GERB), Learning Outcomes Assessment Advisory Board (LOAAB) and the Curriculum and Instruction Committee (CIC) participated in a decennial evaluation of General Education outcomes language and the structure of General Education assessment. After presentations on General Education assessment structures at neighboring Maryland community colleges, a proposal of three options for a future General Education assessment structure were identified, for implementation in academic year 2026-2027. These options will be shared with all faculty in academic year 2024-2025 for wider discussion and feedback, prior to a final selection.

The Center for Excellence in Teaching and Learning (CETL) also underwent change in academic year 2023-2024, becoming part of a new larger organizational unit; the Institute for Transformational Teaching, Learning and Leadership. This new organization was created to bring together under one umbrella programs and services that serve faculty, staff and students but have historically been siloed across academic and student affairs areas.

In the following pages, detailed reports covering course-level outcomes assessment, General Education assessment, institutional assessment, assessment in continuing education and workforce development and evaluation from the Center for Excellence in Teaching and Learning offers testimony of the comprehensive and robust outcomes assessment in place at CCBC. None of this work is possible without student and faculty engagement and the efforts of a team of dedicated staff and faculty. I am grateful to our faculty assessment coordinators, Dr. Beth Shrader and Dr. Fernando Paniagua, to Dr. Glenda Breaux, Heidi Barth and Sarah Young from the Office of Planning, Research and Evaluation (PRE) and to Don Elliot and Jack Boeve from the School of Continuing Education for their guidance and contributions to learning outcomes assessment at CCBC. These individuals are leaders of assessment at the college, and their efforts and expertise are responsible for driving forward the comprehensive assessment efforts that distinguish CCBC as a national leader in the field.

## COURSE-LEVEL LEARNING OUTCOMES ASSESSMENT (LOA)

Fernando Paniagua, Ph.D.

## June 2024

### A. Overview

The course-level assessment process utilizes externally validated assessments that directly measure student learning of course objectives. All assessment projects begin with the development of a Request for Proposal (RFP) and flow through the five stages listed below. Throughout the process, faculty teams adhere to basic research design. The Planning, Research, and Evaluation Office conducts data analyses and provides a detailed report at stages 2 and 4.

Before launching a project, the academic dean selects a team of faculty leaders to serve as the primary researchers. In orientation meetings, the team leaders are briefed on LOA policies and procedures and begin framing the learning outcomes to be measured and the research design to be employed. The faculty group selects or designs an assessment instrument, ensures external validation, and outlines a timeline for the completion of each stage listed below.

- Stage 1: Designing and Proposing a Learning Outcomes Assessment Project
- Stage 2: Implementing the Design and Collecting and Analyzing the Data
- Stage 3: Redesigning the Course to Improve Student Learning
- Stage 4: Implementing Course Revisions and Reassessing Student Learning
- Stage 5: Final Analysis and Reporting Results

## B. LOA Project Status

## 1. Projects in Progress:

*SOCL 101: Introduction to Sociology* – The RFP was received and approved. The external evaluation was completed successfully; the assessment project was implemented during spring 2024. Data collection and analysis is scheduled for fall 2024.

## Stage 2: Implementing the Design and Collecting and Analyzing the Data

*MNGT 105: Introduction to Management* – The RFP for this project was received and approved during spring 2022. It took several months for the project to be externally evaluated. Implementation and assessment of student learning occurred during the fall of 2023. The faculty committee is currently developing interventions to improve student learning.

## Stage 4: Implementing Course Revisions and Reassessing Student Learning

ALHL 115: Medical Terminology – The assessment implementation and data collection for this project occurred in two consecutive semesters: summer 2020 and fall 2020. During the spring 2021 semester, the data was analyzed by PRE and presented to the faculty involved in the project. During fall 2021, they developed strategies to improve student learning. Those strategies were implemented during spring 2022, and data was collected. It took time to format the data downloaded from Brightspace, because of the way that the different scenarios were developed (multiple fill-in-the-blank questions, multiple choice, matching). The Office of PRE has transformed the data for four of the six sections. The remaining data sets will be available for analysis by the end of the summer 2024 semester.

*HLTH 126: Introduction to Holistic and Complementary Health* – The implementation of the assessment instrument and the data collection took place during fall 2020. The data was analyzed and presented to the faculty involved in the project during spring 2021. The analysis showed a strong achievement of all the learning objectives with a significant difference in the performance between males and females. As a result, the faculty decided to brainstorm ways to close this gender gap. They decided to run a survey during spring 2022, so they have more information to plan their strategies. They analyzed the results of this survey and designed the intervention plan for fall 2022 implementation.

## Stage 5: Final Analysis and Reporting Results

*HLTH 101: Health and Wellness* – The RFP for this project was received and approved during spring 2021. During fall 2022, the assessment instrument was implemented, and data was collected and presented to the faculty involved in the project. During winter 2023, they developed strategies to improve student learning. These strategies were implemented during spring 2023, and data was collected, analyzed, and presented. The final report was also submitted and approved.

# 2. New Projects:

*PSYC 101:Introduction to Psychology* – The RFP for this project was received and approved in the spring of 2024. The faculty are awaiting comments from the external evaluator. Once the report is received, they can move to the next stage in the process.

# C. LOA Status Report Summary

# Learning Outcomes Assessment Projects

# Status Report Summary

# June 2024

Beginning year	Dean	Team Leader(s)	Stage of Completion
2019			
ALHL 115	Shawn McNamara	Virginia Foster	Stage 4: Implementing Course Revisions and Reassessing Student Learning
2020			
HLTH 126	Timothy Davis	Claire Colclough	Stage 4: Implementing Course Revisions and Reassessing Student Learning
2021			
HLTH 101	Timothy Davis	John Reed	Stage 5: The final report was received and approved
2022			
MNGT 105	Jane Mattes	Brian Hagen	Stage 2: Implementing the Design and Collecting and Analyzing the Data
2023			
SOCL 101	Timothy Davis	Ann Merck MacLellan Nina Brown Nelda Nix-McCray Danielle James Myron Strong	Stage 1: Request for proposal submitted, approved, external Evaluation done. They just Implemented and assessed student learning in the Spring of 2024.
2024			
PSYC 101	Timothy Davis	Parita Vithlani Jason Spiegelman Josephine Lewis Jessica Carroll	RFP received and approved. Waiting on External Evaluation Report of the Assessment Instrument.

# D. Executive Summary Documents HLTH 101

Executive Summary

Course: Health 101 Faculty Leaders: John P. Reed, Professor Craig Newton

## STAGE 1: DESIGNING AND PROPOSING A LEARNING OUTCOMES PROJECT

Briefly describe the LOA project, including the assessment instrument that was used and the rubric if you developed one. In addition, please list the Outcomes that this project evaluates.

The Health 101 LOA is a comprehensive final exam, which gauges student understanding of common course objectives. Understanding the comprehension of the course objectives by students will help course instructors implement best practices to improve student learning. Students will complete the Health 101 LOA Final Exam. The questions on the exam are designed to test student's knowledge of the course objectives. The exams will be collected and analyzed for questions/objective accuracy.

The following course objectives were assessed:

1. develop and implement a plan appropriate for promoting personal wellness;

3. demonstrate effective oral, written, and critical thinking skills as they relate to health behaviors contributing to a wellness lifestyle;

- 6. interpret technical and medical language as it relates to health and wellness;
- 9. determine how personal decisions influence community and environmental health;
- 11. demonstrate knowledge of current wellness information and issues.

## STAGE 2: IMPLEMENTING THE DESIGN AND COLLECTING AND ANALYZING THE DATA

# Briefly describe the major results of this stage. You might include summaries tables and/or charts when appropriate.

Overall students were successful in meeting the objectives for the Health 101 LOA. The results for each learning objective are as follows; 96% of students scored over 60% on Objective 1, 85% on Objective 3, 86% on Objective 6, 84% on Objective 9, and 68% on Objective 11. For objective 11, questions 7, 35, and 43 were the lowest performing questions.

## STAGE 3: DESIGNING AND INTERVENTION TO IMPROVE STUDENT LEARNING

Summarize the strategies implemented to improve student Learning. Identify clearly the outcomes that the intervention plan was focused on.

1. Provide a comprehensive review - The majority of the content for objective 11 is covered at the beginning of the semester. A comprehensive review of course material prior to the exam may help students to better recall course content in regards to objective 11 and questions 7, 35, and 43.

2. Clarification of language for questions 7, 35, and 43. Students struggled with these three (3) questions impacting the successful completion of objective 11. The language used for these questions seemed to have confused students. These questions will be adjusted to clarify their intended understanding of class content and course objectives.

## STAGE 4: IMPLEMENTING THE INTERVENTION AND REASSESSING STUDENT LEARNING

Briefly describe the results of this second assessment cycle, and compare the results with Stage 2. You might include summaries tables and/or charts when appropriate.

Students were very successful after the implementation of the intervention strategy. Students performed better on all objectives as compared to stage 2; 98% of students scored over 60% on Objectives 1 (S2 96%); 88% of students scored over 60% on Objectives 3 (S2 85%); 92% of students scored over 60% on Objectives 6 (S2 86%); 87% of students scored over 60% on Objectives 9 (S2 84%); 84% of students scored over 60% on Objective 11 (S2 68%).

The goal of stage 2 was to improve objective 11 by 10% was met. Students improved objective 11 by 16%. Also, Comparing Stage 4 with Stage 2, all groups of students who earned different course grades earned higher LOA mean scores in Stage 4 than in Stage 2. Stage 4 students scored a mean score of 78% as compared to stage 2, where student's scored a mean score of 72%.

# STAGE 5: FINAL ANALYSIS AND EXECUTIVE SUMMARY OF THE PROJECT:

*Provide a final analysis for the entire project. You might highlight the most important achievements of the project, and might include also tables and/or charts when appropriate.* 

Overall, the Health 101 LOA was successful across many categories. All course objectives measured improved from stage 2 to 4, as well as, students' grades on the LOA exam and students' overall grades in the course. The academic achievements of our students are a result of the professionalism and collaboration between, wellness faculty and staff, as well as, CCBC's PRE department. Working together we were able to *create a valuable learning assessment tool and pedogeological strategy to create real academic change for student success. Collaborations such as these are an institutional success for all of the CCBC community.* 

## E. RFP Received

## PSYC 101 REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL

The goal of the project is to design a course project built upon CCBC's assessment model and embodies best practices. The project will help to identify areas of strength and weakness in student accomplishment of learning outcomes and encourage innovation to improve student learning. Projects must include all the sections from all campuses at which the course is offered.

Faculty members should begin by discussing the basic ideas of the project with their Department Chair and Academic Dean and gain preliminary approval of the project. Once preliminary approval is received, faculty members will develop the full proposal in consultation with the Learning Outcomes Associate, Fernando Paniagua.

## **PROJECT DESCRIPTION:**

Briefly describe the project and explain how it will strengthen and improve student learning. Indicate which course will be involved in the study.

This Learning Outcomes Assessment Project involves PSYC101 – Introduction to Psychology. A final exam consisting of 50 multiple choice test questions measuring course topics including contemporary fields in psychology, research methods, memory, learning, sensation and perception, motivation and emotion, stress and health, social psychology, personality, lifespan development, thinking and intelligence, biopsychology, and disorders and treatment.

The questions included in the assessment tool were either extracted from the OpenStax Psychology test bank or written by psychology faculty at CCBC. Correct answers are included in the document along with the specific CCO measured by the question. Questions are measured by multiple faculty members across the discipline for content and structural validity.

Collecting and analyzing data on student performance will direct faculty towards necessary revisions to instruction methods to improve student learning and achievement.

# **PROJECT OBJECTIVES:**

Make sure that Common Course Outline (CCO) is current and up to date before starting this project. List the specific objectives (outcomes) from the CCO to be measured as part of this project.

## CCO#s 1, 4, 7

- 1. define the fundamental concepts associated with each of the course's major topics;
- 4. apply major theoretical perspectives with data derived from psychological research;
- 7. find, evaluate, use, and cite research pertaining to psychology topics;

## METHODOLOGY:

*Explain the method and instrument(s) that will be used to collect data to measure the learning outcomes identified in the previous section.* 

The PSYC101 LOA project will be presented to all students enrolled in PSYC101 in the form of a final exam consisting of 50 multiple choice questions worth one point each. The questions included in the assessment tool were either extracted from the OpenStax Psychology test bank or written by psychology faculty at CCBC. Correct answers are included in the document along with the specific CCO measured by the question. Questions are measured by multiple faculty members across the discipline for content and structural validity.

This exam must account for at least 10% of the final grade.

## ASSESSMENT INSTRUMENT:

Please provide as an Appendix the assessment instrument(s) to be used as well as the rubric(s), if needed.

## ADMINISTRATION OF THE ASSESSMENT:

Please explain clearly how you are going to administer the assessment instrument to all the sections of the course (face-to-face, blended, and online) and how you are going to collect the data.

Type of Section	Administration and Data Collection
	All students will be required to take a practice quiz to ensure that Respondus software works for their devices.
Face-to-face	The assessment will be administered via Brightspace using Respondus Lockdown Browser and Monitor and scored automatically by Brightspace.
	Final exam; 10% of the final grade; 90-minute (1 and a half hours) time limit.
	No book; can use one (double-sided) printed or hand-written notes; will be provided with a list of suggested study topics.
	Suggest: instructors schedule final exam or a class in the last week of classes in a computer lab.
	All students will be required to take a practice quiz to ensure that Respondus software works for their devices at least 2 weeks before the assessment.
Blended	The assessment will be administered via Brightspace using Respondus Lockdown Browser and Monitor and scored automatically by Brightspace.
	Final exam; 10% of the final grade; 90-minute (1 and a half hours) time limit.
	No book; can use one (double-sided) printed or hand-written notes; will be provided with a list of suggested study topics.
	All students will be required to take a practice quiz to ensure that Respondus software works for their devices.
Online	The assessment will be administered via Brightspace using Respondus Lockdown Browser and Monitor and scored automatically by Brightspace.

Final exam; 10% of the final grade; 90-minute (1 and a half hours) time limit
No book; can use one (double-sided) printed or hand-written notes; will be
provided with a list of suggested study topics.

## EXTERNAL VALIDATION:

*Explain how external validation of the assessment instrument(s) will be achieved. Provide the name, institution, and credentials of the external evaluator.* 

Name: William Altman Institution: SUNY Broome Community College Credentials:

- Professor of Psychology and Human Services department at SUNY Broome Community College.
- Background in Educational Psychology and Measurement; research interests: effective teaching and learning, creativity, and intelligence.
- Earned Ph.D. and M.S. degrees in Educational Psychology and Measurement; M.P.S. in Communication Arts (Organizational Communication) from Cornell University; B.A. in History from the University of Pennsylvania.
- Dr. Altman has been heavily involved in the Introductory Psychology Initiative (IPI) with the Society for the Teaching of Psychology (STP) and has been a Vice President for STP for years. His term recently ended, and he's now an STP representative to the American Psychology Association Council.

## TIMELINE:

Stage	Name	Timeline (semester / year)
1	Designing and Proposing an Outcomes Assessment	Spring 2024
	Project	
2	Implementing the Design and Collecting and Analyzing	Fall 2024
	the Data	
3	Designing an Intervention to Improve Student Learning	Spring 2025 and Fall 2025
4	Implementing the Intervention and Reassessing Student	Spring 2026
	Learning	
5	Final Analysis and Executive Summary of the Project	Fall 2026

*State the timeline for each of the stages in the project. These stages include:* 

## **RESOURCES NEEDED:**

*List and justify all resources necessary to conduct the project. Include consultant fees, test fees, or any other costs.* 

Resource	Justification
Consultant Fees - \$150	William Altman will be externally validating the
	assessment tool and will need to be compensated
	for the time spent reviewing the test and making
	comments.

# FACULTY PARTICIPANTS:

Identify all faculty who will participate in the project and define the scope of their roles and responsibilities, as well as their percentage over the total stipend for the project.

Faculty	Roles and Responsibilities	Stipend (%)
Parita Vithlani	Project Leader: review and edit assessment tool; complete necessary paperwork; schedule and lead meetings, communicate between all required stakeholders, provide input for administration and assist with administration, assist with obtaining data from faculty, provide input for data-informed revision to instruction	28
Jason Spiegelman	<ul> <li>method, and any additional duties as necessary.</li> <li>Committee member: compile, review, and edit assessment tool; provide input for administration of tool and data-informed revision to instruction methods; and any additional duties as necessary.</li> </ul>	24
Josephine Lewis	Committee member: review and edit assessment tool; provide input for administration of tool and assist with administration, provide data-informed revision to instruction methods; and any additional duties as necessary.	24
Jessica Carroll	Committee member: review and edit assessment tool; provide input for administration of tool, assist with obtaining data from faculty, provide data-informed revision to instruction methods; and any additional duties as necessary.	24

SIGNATURES:

Learning Outcome Assessment Associate:

		//
Name	Signature	Date
Academic Dean:		
		//
Name	Signature	Date
Dean of Curriculum and Assessment:		
		//
Name	Signature	Date

## GENERAL EDUCATION OUTCOME ASSESSMENT ANNUAL REPORT

## Elizabeth Shrader, Ph.D. Assessment Coordinator, General Education

### June 2024

The following report includes an overview of the general education goals, the assessment process and project implementation including the data outcomes and subsequent interventions, and a conclusions section that reflects on current conditions and looks forward.

General Education Assessment Team (GrEAT) projects discussed in this report pertain to the Spring 2023, Fall 2023, and Spring 2024 assessment semesters. General education assessment occurs over a three-year cycle, published on the college website. In any individual semester, courses prepare assessment tools, assess, and implement interventions.

	Spring 2023	Fall 2023	Spring 2024
Intervention Plans Social & Behavioral Sciences		Mathematics	Biological & Physical
			Sciences (due 8/2024)
Assignment Preparation	Biological & Physical	cal & Physical Arts & Humanities	
	Sciences		
Assessment Mathematics		Biological & Physical	Arts & Humanities
		Sciences	

## GENERAL EDUCATION GOALS AND ASSESSMENT

The purpose of the GrEAT project is to assess the extent to which students acquire and demonstrate college-level proficiency in essential general education outcomes across disciplines in approved general education courses. The project is conducted through the implementation of Common Graded Assignments (CGAs) and accompanying scoring rubrics. Each assignment and rubric is designed by content expert faculty teams and then reviewed and approved by the General Education Review Board (GERB). The General Education Assessment Coordinator (GEAC) supports faculty through meetings with faculty teams and assisting with revisions; facilitating training workshops on the assessment process and assessment tool design, coordinating scoring and data review sessions, and providing sample intervention strategies. The GEAC is also the Chair of GERB and participates in CCBC's Learning Outcomes Assessment Advisory Board (LOAAB).

The general education program assesses the following outcomes:

- 1. Written and Oral Communication—develop effective skills in written, oral, and/or signed communication for a variety of audiences and situations, including active listening, the creation of well-organized messages, and critical analysis of others' messages.
- 2. **Critical Analysis and Reasoning**—evaluate information by identifying the main concept, point of view, implications, and assumptions in order to come to well-reasoned conclusions and solutions, testing them against relevant criteria and standards.

- 3. **Technological Competence**—use contemporary technology to solve problems, validate information, and to meet challenges as a member of an evolving technological society.
- 4. **Information Literacy**—identify, find, and evaluate appropriate resources for research as well as incorporate the information effectively and ethically for lifelong educational, professional and personal use.
- 5. Scientific, Quantitative or Logical Reasoning—apply basic mathematical, scientific, and/or logical concepts and theories to analyze data, solve problems and make decisions.
- 6. Local and Global Diversity—use knowledge and skills effectively in dynamic, evolving multicultural environments to address the challenges in building just, equitable, and productive communities and societies.
- 7. **Personal and Professional Ethics** identify, examine, evaluate, and resolve personal and professional ethical issues and their ramifications using a variety of ethical perspectives and problem-solving approaches.

## **GREAT PROJECT ASSESSMENT PROCESS**

## Common Graded Assignments

During the semester prior to assessment, faculty teams design CGAs to be used in all sections of the participating courses. Each assignment must address at least five of the seven General Education Program objectives. Once assignments are approved by GERB, these CGAs are distributed to faculty teaching the assessed courses, along with submission guidelines and an overview for use when assigning the project to students.

Students complete the assignment to be submitted between the 10<sup>th</sup> and the 14<sup>th</sup> week of the semester. Starting in Fall 2020, all students were required to submit assignments electronically through the Learning Management System (LMS) with their student ID number as the document file name. Faculty then upload the assignments to CCBC's OneDrive and share the assignments by Course Registration Number (CRN) with the GrEATs Coordinator for inclusion in the sample. Student ID numbers are associated with each file and used to collect demographic information and disaggregate the data.

A variety of strategies for retention and engagement of students were put in place during the 2022 – 2023 academic year and an increase in participation was seen in many courses. During the Social & Behavioral Sciences assessment (Fall 2022) submission rates as high as 78% were seen in some courses. The average submission rate for Mathematics (Spring 2023) was 57%. The average for Biological & Physical Sciences (Fall 2023) was considerably higher with submission rates as high as 84% and an average submission rate of 70%. The average for Arts & Humanities (Spring 2024) was 60%. In all cases, general education courses with only a single section offered, were not assessed or included in the submission rate calculations.

## Scoring Rubrics

During the semester prior to assessment, faculty teams design a rubric used for scoring the CGAs. The rubric for each CGA is designed to align to the desired general education outcomes. The CGA and rubric templates were revised in 2021 to provide clarity in alignment between the general education outcomes, course objectives and rubric criteria through which student assignments are evaluated in the general education assessment process.

See **Appendix 1** for the 2021 templates and a sample CGA and rubric for BIOL 109: Human Anatomy and Physiology.

## Scoring and Sample Size

Full- and part-time college faculty are recruited and trained to score the CGAs at the close of the assessment semester. A random, representative sample of CGAs is scored.

The goal sample sizes provide, on average, a confidence level of 95% and a confidence interval of  $\pm$ 6%. For example, after scoring BIOL 110 courses, 85% of scored sheets demonstrate competency. With a confidence level of 95% and a confidence interval of 6% we would state 'with 95% confidence, between 79-91% of the population would demonstrate competency".

#### SCORING SAMPLE SIZE:

Students Enrolled	1-37	38 - 100	101 – 185	186 - 345	346 – 599	600 +
Sample Size	100%	80%	65%	50%	35%	25%

The results cannot be generalized to other courses, disciplines, or even future semesters of the same course taught by the same teacher.

The college-wide assessment cycle organizes the assessment of general education courses by discipline groups. Some disciplines offer more general education courses and sections than other disciplines. Therefore, scoring costs and impact varies from semester to semester. Scoring faculty report that remote synchronous scoring via Microsoft Teams enables greater participation than would have happened for inperson scoring because of the flexibility of scheduling.

A Microsoft Team is created for each discipline group. Within each Team, individual breakout rooms (Channels) are created for each course to be scored. Within each Channel, the necessary documents for scoring are posted in the Files area so that all members can equally access that information. These included copies of the assignment (CGA) and rubric. To facilitate collaborative work, faculty used the Meet function to video conference throughout the scoring sessions.

To reduce inter-rater variability, a randomly selected example of student work is designated as the norming sample. All faculty scoring for the course are required to initially score the norming sample and work collaboratively to come to a consensus about how to interpret the rubric. These normed scores were recorded on the norming sheet, providing a record of norming. In many cases, additional notes about how and why scores were assigned are included in these materials.

Once scoring faculty have completed norming, the sample to be scored is provided via the Files section of each Channel. Faculty recorded consensus scores on a Scoring Sheet. At the close of scoring, these data sheets are provided to Planning, Research, and Evaluation (PRE) for data analysis. Having the data in this format is one factor in the improved data reporting efficiency of this process.

## Outcomes Data Reports and Intervention Reports

The college's PRE office processes scoring results and compiles reports on the data outcomes, which are reviewed and discussed with course and discipline stakeholders in a dedicated half-day data retreat. Based

on these assessment outcomes, GrEAT project faculty teams, in consultation with department faculty and leadership, develop intervention plans formalized in reports submitted to the GrEAT Coordinator and housed on the GERB SharePoint site.

This collaborative strategy combines data reporting with time for faculty to start work on interventions. Work continues to provide support for effective implementation of continuous improvement interventions for all general education courses. The Intervention Plan Report (IPR) template provides specific guidance for this process.

All courses, even those which were not able to generate data in the formal assessment, must file an IPR. This provides a framework to address challenges such as low enrollment and limited faculty support for a specific course in the general education curriculum. In addition, the template asks faculty to provide S.M.A.R.T. goals and a specific timeline for intervention stages. It continues to be a goal of GERB to provide effective follow-up with faculty teams to provide support for interventions at least once in each semester following Assessment.

See **Appendix 2** for the 2024 Intervention Plan Report template and sample intervention plan for MATH 125.

## PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION

The General Education SharePoint area <u>http://www.ccbcmd.edu/loa/great.html</u> contains all the background information, forms, procedures, and data summary reports related to general education assessment at the Community College of Baltimore County. Elizabeth Shrader serves as the college's General Education Assessment Coordinator. The coordinator assists faculty through all stages of the general education assessment process. School representatives to GERB assist with the review and revision of the assessment tools.

General education courses in the Mathematics discipline assessed outcomes in Spring 2023.

- MATH 125: Finite Mathematics and Modeling
- MATH 135: Applied Algebra and Trigonometry
- MATH 153: Introduction to Statistical Methods
- MATH 163: Pre-Calculus I

Note that MATH 132: Concepts of Mathematics II: Geometry & Measurement was not assessed because there were only two sections and a total of 32 enrolled students all taught by a single faculty member. Additional mathematics courses are designated as general education courses (MATH 165, MATH 243, MATH 251, MATH 257, MATH 259), however, these courses are considered 'second in a series' and therefore do not participate in the formal assessment as students in these courses would have been part of the formal assessment in a required prior course.

General education courses in the Biological & Physical Sciences disciplines assessed outcomes in Fall 2023.

- ASTM 101: Astronomy
- BIOL 100: Exploring Biology
- BIOL 104: Introductory Botany
- BIOL 108: Investigating the Living World

- BIOL 109: Human Anatomy and Physiology
- BIOL 110: Biology I: Molecules and Cells
- BIOL 160: Body Structure and Function
- CHEM 107: Fundamentals of Chemistry
- CHEM 131: General Chemistry
- ENVS 101: Introduction to Environmental Science
- ERSC 101: Earth Science
- ERSC 131: Introduction to Meteorology
- ERSC 141: Introduction to Oceanography
- ERSC 121: Physical Geology
- GEOG 101: Introduction to Physical Geography
- GEOG 102: Introduction to Cultural Geography
- PHYS 101: Fundamentals of Physics I

Note that some courses were not assessed because they did not meet the necessary enrollment requirements. Courses with one section or only one instructor are not included in the formal assessment process. Courses that did not assess for these reasons were:

- ARSC 103: Natural Science
- ARSC 104: Great Perspectives in Science
- BIOL 106: Zoology
- BIOL 107: Human Biology
- CHEM 100: Chemistry and its Role in Society
- GEOG 111: World Regional Geography
- PHYS 105: How Things Work

Additional Biological & Physical Sciences courses are designated as general education courses (ASTM 102, BIOL 111, BIOL 220, BIOL 221, CHEM 102, CHEM 108, ENVS 102, ERSC 122, ERSC 142, PHYS 111, PHYS 251), however, these courses are considered 'second in a series' and therefore do not participate in the formal assessment as students in these courses would have been part of the formal assessment in a required prior course.

General education courses in the Arts & Humanities disciplines assessed outcomes in Spring 2024.

- ARTD 104: Art Appreciation \*
- ARDT 105-106: History of Art \*
- ASLS 101: American Sign Language I
- ASLS 102: American Sign Language II
- ASLS 121: Introduction to Deaf Culture \*
- CMNS 101: Fundamentals of Communication
- DANC 135: Dance Appreciation \*
- DANC 147: History of Hip Hop Dance \*
- ENGL 201: British Literature I
- ENGL 203: American Literature I
- ENGL 204: American Literature II
- ENGL 206: World Literature II \*
- ENGL/NAST 207: Native American Literature \*

- ENGL 219: African American Literature II \*
- ENGL 224: Literature by Women \*
- FAPA 101: Introduction to Fine and Performing Arts
- MCOM/CMNS/HIST 150: Movies: History & Art
- MCOM 111: Introduction to Mass Communications
- MUSC 101: Music Fundamentals
- MUSC 102: Mustic Appreciation
- PHIL 101: Introduction to Philosophy
- PHIL 240: Ethics \*
- THTR 101: Introduction to the Theatre \*
- World Languages 101-102: Introductory I and II \*
- World Languages 201: Intermediate I \*

Note that some courses were not assessed because they did not meet the necessary enrollment requirements. Courses with one section or only one instructor are not included in the formal assessment process. In addition, some courses in this discipline are not taught in the Spring and so were not included in the assessment. Courses that did not assess for these reasons were:

- ENGL 202: British Literature II
- ENGL 205: World Literature I \*
- ENGL 218: African American Literature I \*
- ENGL 243: Contemporary Literature
- ENGL 250: Shakespeare \*\*
- ENGL 260: Holocaust Literature \*\*
- ENGL 262: Introduction to Modern Arab Literature in Translation \*\*
- MUSC 109: Survey of World Music \*
- PHIL 103: Critical Thinking
- World Languages 202: Intermediate II \*

## \* indicates a course which also meets CCBC's Diversity designation.

\*\* indicates courses which are slated for removal from the General Education program.

Summary of Participation and Scoring

**Social & Behavioral Sciences** assessed outcomes in Fall 2022, however, the data reports were not complete until May 2023 and the data retreat was held on June 8, 2023, so the intervention plans will be discussed here.

Students achieved a rubric score of '2' (*Approaches Expectations*) in all general education outcomes except Scientific & Logical or Quantitative Reasoning where students achieved a rubric score of '3' (*Meets Expectations*). Technological Competence was not assessed in any courses within the Social & Behavioral Sciences group. All courses in this group were assessed for the Written & Oral Communication, Critical Analysis & Reasoning, and Information Literacy Outcomes. Fourteen courses assessed for Local & Global Diversity. Twelve Courses assessed for Personal & Professional Ethics. Eleven courses assessed for Scientific, Logical, or Quantitative Reasoning. Careful review of each individual discipline is warranted, however, because of the large number and varied assessment tools used in this group. SOCL 102: Social Problems are notable as exemplary across many General Education Outcomes with students achieving at the 4 (Exceeds Expectations) level in four of the five outcomes assessed. Similarly, other courses demonstrated excellent outcomes. However, there are clear targets for interventions across the discipline. For example, seven courses showed students achieving at the 1 (*Falls Below Expectations*) or 2 (*Approaches Expectations*) levels for the Personal & Professional Ethics Outcome.

Intervention Plan Reports were submitted by faculty in Fall 2023 for most courses in this area. GERB continues to work with faculty in this area to support appropriate interventions. In many cases this includes reviewing and revising Common Course Outlines (CCOs). It is considered a best practice that CCOs be reviewed and revised once every five years. Several courses in this discipline completed that process in the 2023 – 2024 academic year including HIST 111-112 and ECON 201-202. There are notable exceptions, however, and these un-revised courses will be a focus in the 2024-2024 academic year.

## Social & Behavioral Sciences Intervention Plans 2023

**Mathematics** assessed outcomes in Spring 2023. These courses had previously assessed general education outcomes in Fall 2020. The last assessment was shifted by one semester due to the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic which made assessment of general education outcomes untenable. All courses at CCBC were transitioned to fully remote learning in the Spring of 2020 so meaningful assessment of outcomes was considered unlikely. Comparisons between Fall 2020 and Spring 2023 are challenging due to differences in student experience and teaching modalities. In addition, Common Course Outlines and the Common Graded Assignments for these courses have changed significantly. Mathematics courses scored in June 2023. Over 550 items of student work were evaluated for Mathematics courses. The data report was published in December 2023 and is discussed here.

## Mathematics Spring 2023 Data Report

There are four (4) courses that were part of the assessment in Mathematics with a total of 1,436 students enrolled. MATH 132 was not included in the assessment because there were only two (2) sections with only one instructor.

MATH 153 is the highest enrolled mathematics course with over 600 students in the Spring 2023 semester.

Confidence intervals were sufficient for useful inferences from all assessed courses at  $\pm 6 - 7\%$ . Student submissions were fewer than the number of enrolled students. The percentage of submitted work varied among the courses with an average of 57%.

Overall, students achieved in the 2 (*Approaches Expectations*) range for most general education outcomes. Students in this discipline achieved 4 (*Exceeds Expectations*) for the Information Literacy outcome. Courses assessed for the Written & Oral Communication, Critical Analysis & Reasoning, Technological Competence, Information Literacy, Scientific, Quantitative or Logical Reasoning, and Personal & Professional Ethics. Local & Global Diversity was not scored in this assessment.

**Biological & Physical Sciences** assessed outcomes in Fall 2023. These courses had previously assessed general education outcomes in Fall 2020. Many courses in this discipline were held in hybrid/blended formats where laboratory was taught in-person but socially distanced while the lecture components of the courses were taught in online settings, both synchronous and asynchronous formats. For this reason,

comparisons between Fall 2020 and Fall 2023 are challenging as the differences in student experience, teaching modalities, Common Course Outlines and the Common Graded Assignments for these courses have changed significantly.

While these courses assessed in the same semester, for length and clarity, data reports were generated for the Biological Sciences and Physical Sciences separately. Information about sampling and outcomes achievement was completed for the entire group of courses, but aspects of special analyses and individual course outcomes achievement are divided into two separate reports.

Overall, courses in this area generally scored in the 2 (*Approaches Expectations*) range. Courses scored in the 3 (*Meets Expectations*) range for Written & Oral Communication. Courses scored in the 1 (*Falls Below Expectations*) range for Local & Global Diversity. Scores for Local & Global Diversity and for Personal & Professional Ethics should be considered cautiously as only four (4) courses within this discipline included these outcomes in their Common Graded Assignments.

## Biological Sciences F2023 Data Report

Six (6) courses in the Biological Sciences assessed general education outcomes with 1,209 students enrolled. BIOL 106 was not included in the assessment as it is only taught in the Spring semester. BIOL 107 was not included in the assessment because there was only one (1) section taught in Fall 2023. BIOL 104 was included despite having only one (1) section taught with the permission of the course instructor and the necessity of collecting data about this course which had not been assessed since prior to 2017. BIOL 110 is the highest enrolled Biological Sciences course with 500 students, while BIOL 109 is second with over 360 students in the Fall 2023 semester.

Confidence intervals were sufficient for useful inferences from most assessed courses at  $\pm 6 - 7\%$ . Notable exceptions include BIOL 104 (CI  $\pm 14\%$ ) and BIOL 160 (CI  $\pm 15\%$ ). These courses are part of career programs (Horticulture and Health Informatics respectively). Student submissions were fewer than the number of enrolled students. The percentage of submitted work varied among the courses with an average of 68% for courses in Biological Sciences.

Several notable special analyses were requested by the Biological Sciences faculty. When achievement of general education outcomes was evaluated based on student reported race/ethnicity. Biology courses showed no statistically significant differences between groups in any outcome. Statistical differences were seen in Physical Science courses and will be discussed later in this document. When achievement was evaluated based on course modality, varied results were found across outcomes. Students in online sections scored higher for the Information Literacy, Scientific Reasoning, and Diversity outcomes. Students in onsite sections scored higher for the Technological Competence outcome. Additional exploration of this data on a course-by-course basis is recommended as variations exist among courses. For all outcomes except Critical Analysis, students taught by full-time faculty scored better than those taught by adjunct faculty. Most courses in the Biological Sciences participate in the Great Science Symposium where students present scientific posters as a group. Those posters are the Common Graded Assignment for participating courses. Outcomes data was analyzed to see if participation in this group activity impacted achievement of general education outcomes. Only BIOL 104 and BIOL 160 do not participate. Recall that as stated previously, these are courses in career programs. The data in this analysis indicates that students did better across a host of outcomes when they worked individually as opposed to in collaboration. Because the groups of students are distinctly different in educational goals, the data about collaboration should be considered carefully. Further evaluation and collaboration with CCBC's High Impact Practice workgroup is advised.

An analysis of the outcomes of achievement by students who received Library instruction was also undertaken. Students who had library instruction did statistically significantly better than those that did not with respect to Written & Oral Communication and Critical Analysis. BIOL 100 and BIOL 104 were the only courses in the Biological Sciences with sections reported to receive instruction from the library. It is a strong recommendation to faculty that Library support is beneficial to achievement of general education outcomes.

### Physical Sciences F2023 Data Report

Eleven Physical Sciences courses assessed general education outcomes with 1,264 students enrolled. ARSC 103 and ERSC 121 were not taught in Fall 2023. ARSC 104, CHEM 100, and PHYS 105 were not included in the assessment because there was only one section taught in Fall 2023. GEOG 102 was scored with the Physical Sciences although it is a Social Sciences course because the faculty teaching it are part of Physical Sciences. CHEM 107 is the highest enrolled Physical Sciences course with 325 students. ENVS 101 is second with 269 students in the Fall 2023 semester.

Confidence intervals were sufficient for useful inferences from most assessed courses at  $\pm 5 - 7\%$ . Notable exceptions include ERSC 131, ERSC 141, GEOG 101-102, and PHYS 151. These are generally due to lower enrollment in these specialized courses. Relatively few ERSC 131 assignments were scored due to lack of scoring faculty availability. Additional sections of ERSC 141 were taught in Spring 2024. The percentage of submitted work varied among the courses with an average of 72.5% for courses in Physical Sciences.

Several notable special analyses were requested by the Physical Sciences faculty. When achievement of general education outcomes was evaluated based on student reported race/ethnicity. Physical Sciences courses showed several statistically significant differences between groups. White students had better outcomes achievement than African American students in Written & Oral Communication, Technological Competence, Information Literacy and Scientific Reasoning. Nuances exist in this data especially at the course level for CHEM 107, ERSC 101, and GEOG 102. Faculty are encouraged to explore actions for addressing these differences.

Achievement was evaluated based on course modality; varied results were found across outcomes. Students in online sections scored higher for the Information Literacy, Scientific Reasoning, and Diversity outcomes. Students in onsite sections scored higher for the Technological Competence outcome. Additional exploration of this data on a course-by-course basis is recommended as variations exist among courses.

For all outcomes except Critical Analysis, students taught by full-time faculty scored better than those taught by adjunct faculty.

An analysis of the outcomes of achievement by students who received Library instruction was also undertaken. Students who had library instruction did statistically significantly better than those that did not with respect to Written & Oral Communication and Critical Analysis. ASTM 101 and ERSC 101 were the only courses in the Physical Sciences with sections that were reported to receive instruction from the library. It is a strong recommendation to faculty that Library support is beneficial to achievement of general education outcomes.

Data Retreats were held on June 4, 2024 (Physical Sciences) and June 6, 2024 (Biological Sciences). Individual Biological and Physical Sciences courses are asked to submit Intervention Plans by August 30,

2024. These intervention plans will be reviewed and supported by GERB throughout the 2024-2025 academic year.

Intervention Plans

# Social & Behavioral Sciences:

Individual courses submitted Intervention Plans in Fall 2023. Scheduling did not allow for specific review and recommendations from GERB on these interventions, however they were posted to the GERB Teams site.

The following courses did **not** submit Intervention Plans:

- AASD 101: Introduction to African American Studies \*  $\psi$
- ARSC 121: American Pluralism \*  $\psi$
- ECON 163: Issues in Environmental Economics \*  $\psi$
- GLBL 101: Introduction to Global Studies  $\psi$
- HIST 116: African American History \*  $\psi$
- HIST/NAST 127: Native American History \*  $\psi$
- HUSC 104: Developing Cultural Proficiency in a Diverse World
- HUSC/SOCL 122: Aging in a Global Society \*  $\psi$
- LGST 101: Introduction to Law
- POLS 101: American Government & Politics
- POLS 105: State & Local Government & Politics \*  $\psi$
- POLS 111: Introduction to Political Science \*
- POLS 131: Comparative Government \*
- SOCL 141: The Sociology of Race, Ethnicity, and Culture
- SOCL 230: The Holocaust and Global Racism \*  $\psi$
- SSCI 112: Civic & Community Engagement \* ψ

\*indicates a course which did not assess in Fall 2022.

 $\psi$  indicates a course which has a CCO older than 2019 (5yr review cycle)

These courses <u>could</u> be candidates for evaluation in September 2024 to be retired from the General Education curriculum.

# Social & Behavioral Sciences Intervention Plans 2023

From the Intervention Plans submitted for Social & Behavioral Sciences courses, there is a focus on addressing challenges in three outcomes in particular: Information Literacy, Local & Global Diversity and Personal & Professional Ethics during the next assessment period.

# Mathematics:

Individual Mathematics courses submitted Intervention Plans for review by the General Education Review Board in January 2024. The majority of these courses are planning to address increased achievement in the Scientific, Quantitative or Logical Reasoning outcome for the next assessment cycle.

## Mathematics Intervention Plans 2024

## General Education Outcomes and Assessment Process Revision

Starting in Fall 2023, a series of new processes were introduced to the general education course update and approval process. This new workflow will be transferred to the Curriculum system, part of the newly adopted Catalog system for automating workflows, through the Registrar's Office. Course documents are proposed by faculty and reviewed by the GERB Chair before forwarding to a Dean's Council agenda. Once approved by Dean's Council and the Assistant Dean for Curriculum, Assessment & Accreditation, the documents are added to a GERB agenda for review. Once GERB has reviewed and approved the course documents, they are forwarded to the Curriculum & Instruction Committee of the Senate for additional approval.

Revised templates and tracking documents can be found on SharePoint in the <u>General Education area</u> <u>here</u>.

CCBC has maintained a robust and comprehensive General Education Assessment program for many years. In 2015, the general education outcomes and the overarching assessment process were reviewed and revised. As we look ahead to the 2024 – 2025 academic year, substantive preparation for a 10-year review and revision of CCBC's general education outcomes and assessment process with the goal of creating and maintaining a truly sustainable assessment practice, has begun.

The process by which courses are vetted for inclusion in the general education curriculum is careful, deliberate, and stringent. Courses are proposed by faculty, application includes review and oversight from the Dean's Council, the General Education Review Board, the Curriculum & Instruction Committee of the college Senate, and the most senior staff of the institution. Care is taken to ensure that course objectives are aligned to general education outcomes and discipline-specific goals. Assessments by which achievement of the general education outcomes will be measured are also evaluated as is alignment of course content to the college's main transfer partners.

Informal evaluation was in place to review and evaluate courses that might not be best serving our students and identifying interventions or retirement plans to remove those courses from the general education curriculum. However, a major accomplishment of the General Education Review Board (GERB) in AY 2023-2024 was to create a process to evaluate existing general education courses and provide appropriate supports or off-ramps to ensure a curriculum that continues to be relevant and appropriate for our diverse and changing student population. This process was reviewed and ratified by the members of GERB, was presented to and approved by the Dean's Council, and the Assistant Vice President for Academic Affairs, Dr. Jennifer Kilbourne, and will go into effect in AY 2024-2025.

# Step 1: Course Identified for Examination

GERB will review the list of General Education courses at the **September** meeting. If a course meets <u>at least two (2)</u> of the following criteria it will be identified for evaluation as part of the General Education curriculum:

- Course is not connected to any Programs of Study, Major Requirements, or Pathways outside of <u>General Studies</u>
- Course has a CCO which has not been updated within the last 5yrs
- Course has not been assessed within the last assessment cycle (3yrs)
- Course has not run in last 4 semesters (2yrs)

• Course has less than 18 students registering per semester

## Step 2: Notification

The Dean, Department Chair/Coordinator, and Faculty Convener are notified of the Examination status by **October 1.** The criteria which have initiated the Evaluation status is/are included in the notification.

## Step 3: Intervention

If a course will be retired from the general education curriculum, Deans will notify GERB by the end of Fall semester (**December 15**), so that edits to the next college catalog may be made.

If interventions are made to address course status, Deans will notify GERB by the end of the Fall semester with a summary of the criteria that will be addressed.

Individuals that will be responsible for implementing interventions will be identified.

Specific milestones are indicated.

A comprehensive intervention plan will be submitted to GERB by **February 1**.

## Step 4: Retirement

If a course, after 1yr of examination, has not addressed the intervention criteria listed, GERB will recommend retirement to the Deans Council. Ongoing review and evaluation will occur.

## General Education Assessment Process Review:

In addition, GERB and our faculty partners have begun the process of reviewing and revising both the process for General Education Assessment and CCBC's General Education Outcomes criteria. This process will continue in parallel throughout the 2024 -2025 academic year with the intention of fully implementing the new process and Outcomes criteria in Fall 2026.

As preparation for this comprehensive review, assessment professionals from other Maryland community colleges were invited to share their approaches to General Education assessment with GERB. The committee participated in presentations from Howard Community College (Debra Greenberg, Assistant Director of Learning Outcomes Assessment) and Montgomery College (Cassandra Jones, Director of Assessment). GERB members discussed at length possible options for alternative approaches to CCBC's assessment process that would be both comprehensive and sustainable. At the end of these discussions, three options will be presented to leadership and the faculty in Fall 2024, for further review.

**Option A:** Continue to use the current general education Assessment model where all General Education courses are aligned to the current seven (7) General Education Outcomes, and formal assessment is completed for 5 of the 7 on a three-year basis.

**Option B:** General Education courses are aligned to the current seven (7) General Education Outcomes, and formal assessment is completed for 3 of the 7 on a three-year basis. All courses in a COMAR category [Arts & Humanities, Social & Behavioral Sciences, Biological & Physical Sciences, Mathematics, English Composition] must choose the same three Outcomes to assess which will necessitate revision of the Common Graded Assignments for alignment.

**Option C:** General Education courses are aligned to the current seven (7) General Education Outcomes, and formal assessment is completed for 3 of the 7 on a three-year basis. All courses in a *discipline* must choose the same three Outcomes to assess which will necessitate revision of the Common Graded

Assignments for alignment. In this case, discipline alignment documentation would be required as part of the revision process.

These options will be presented to faculty in multiple formats throughout Fall 2024 including Fall Focus, School & Department meetings, Campus Forum, and focus groups. A survey to gather feedback from faculty is also planned.

## General Education Outcomes Language Review:

In a process parallel to review of the assessment process, the language of the current General Education Outcomes will be reviewed and revised with the goal of providing clear, measurable criteria for each so that well aligned rubrics can be created that are applicable across disciplines. Starting in Fall 2024, workgroups composed of members of the General Education Review Board and additional faculty from across the disciplines will convene to review and revise the language of each of the 7 General Education Outcomes. Best practices will be applied in the creation of these Outcomes statements to best reflect the needs of students and the mission and goals of CCBC.

## CONCLUSIONS:

## Assessment:

Direct comparisons between assessment years are not always possible as many of the assessment tools (CGAs) and course objectives are revised in the intervening period. Participation is good across assessment periods. Of note is that the average number of assignments submitted per section averaged fewer than of the total number of students enrolled at the third week of classes. This is an observation that is common across all disciplines assessed since 2019 and additional investigation is warranted. Current registration data does not enable accounting for students who have withdrawn or are no longer attending a course. The ability to identify enrollment more accurately in the later part of the semester may also enable a more relevant statistical sampling model. College-wide retention efforts should continue to examine student engagement with an individual semester and between semesters.

Students in **Social & Behavioral Sciences** courses achieved in the 2 (Approaches Expectations) all General Education Outcomes except Scientific or Logical and Quantitative Reasoning where students earned 3 (Meets Expectations). All courses in this group were assessed for the Written & Oral Communication, Critical Analysis & Reasoning, and Information Literacy Outcomes. Fourteen courses assessed for Local & Global Diversity. Twelve Courses assessed for Personal & Professional Ethics. Eleven courses assessed for Scientific, Logical or Quantitative Reasoning. It was of note that the Personal & Professional Ethics Outcome was particularly challenging for students in some courses. It is important to note that many courses in this area did not submit an Intervention Plan (16) many of which also did not assess in Fall 2022. A significant number of courses (10) in this discipline also have CCOs which are slated for review and revision. This will be an important focus prior to the next formal assessment semester, Fall 2025.

Students in **Mathematics** courses achieved in the 2 (Approaches Expectations) range for most General Education Outcomes. Students in this discipline achieved 4 (Exceeds Expectations) for the Information Literacy outcome. Courses assessed for the Written & Oral Communication, Critical Analysis & Reasoning, Technological Competence, Information Literacy, Scientific, Quantitative or Logical Reasoning, and Personal & Professional Ethics. Local & Global Diversity was not scored in this assessment. All courses that assessed in this discipline submitted Intervention Plans and several revised Common Course Outlines in the 2023-2024 academic year. Several 200-level Mathematics courses have CCOs which are slated for review and revision. It is possible that with changes in COMAR and the Transfer with Success Act that

several of these courses will no longer need to be a part of the General Education curriculum enabling faculty to more easily revise the Common Course Outlines for course specific content.

Students in **Biological & Physical Sciences** courses achieved in the 2 (Approaches Expectations) range. Courses scored in the 3 (Meets Expectations) range for Written & Oral Communication. Courses scored in the 1 (Falls Below Expectations) range for Local & Global Diversity. Scores for Local & Global Diversity and for Personal & Professional Ethics should be considered cautiously as only four (4) courses within this discipline included these Outcomes in their Common Graded Assignments (CGAs).

Robust intervention plans are a good step to achieving General Education Outcomes success. The next step in fully implementing these plans is the development of a practice to routinely check back with faculty teams in the process of intervention and to provide support for their efforts between formal assessment semesters. Building on the success of individual assessment activities, it is vital that integration of assessment at all levels is expanded. Specific touchpoints to connect General Education Outcomes Assessment (GrEATs) with Learning Outcomes Assessment (LOAs) and Program Outcomes continues to be an important goal.

## APPENDIX 1: Templates & Sample CGA-rubric

### General Education Common Graded Assignment: [INSERT course name and year] [INSERT assignment title]

*[INSERT course name]* is a general education course designed to assist students in the development of critical life skills. One of the goals of this assignment is to assess student competence for each of these objectives:

- 1. Written and Oral Communication develop effective skills in written, oral, and/or signed communication for a variety of audiences and situations, including active listening, the creation of well-organized messages, and critical analysis of others' messages.
- II. **Critical Analysis and Reasoning** evaluate information by identifying the main concept, point of view, implications, and assumptions in order to come to well-reasoned conclusions and solutions, testing them against relevant criteria and standards.
- III. **Technological Competence** use contemporary technology to solve problems, validate information, and to meet challenges as a member of an evolving technological society.
- IV. **Information Literacy** identify, find, and evaluate appropriate resources for research as well as incorporate the information effectively and ethically for lifelong educational, professional and personal use.
- V. **Scientific and Quantitative or Logical Reasoning** apply basic mathematical, scientific, and/or logical concepts and theories to analyze data, solve problems and make decisions.
- VI. **Local and Global Diversity** use knowledge and skills effectively in dynamic, evolving multicultural environments to address the challenges in building just, equitable, and productive communities and societies.
- VII. **Personal and Professional Ethics** identify, examine, evaluate, and resolve personal and professional ethical issues and their ramifications using a variety of ethical perspectives and problem-solving approaches.

[The above are the definitions for each competency. Replace with course-specific CCO objectives (CCO#). Any CCO objective may only be used <u>once</u> in the above section. Choose only those CCO objectives that are specifically assessed in this assignment to assure clear alignment between objectives and rubric criteria.]

In addition to the above general education objectives, this assignment assesses students' understanding and application of the following skills and knowledge specific to *[INSERT course, unit, or chapter name]*:

• [INSERT relevant CCO topics that are not used in the above section but are relevant to the assignment]

# <u>ASSIGNMENT</u>: [INSERT assignment description of 1-2 sentences that focus on what students are doing in the assignment.]

Purpose:

Audience:

Directions: [When possible, provide a summary here and attach specific directions that will be given to students below.]

## ASSIGNMENT SPECIFICATIONS:

- Minimum *[INSERT]* pages typed in Times New Roman 12-pt font, double-spaced with 1" margins. The **[Works Cited/References]** page is not included in the assigned page length.
- [MLA/APA/Chicago] style format and documentation for parenthetical citations and a Works Cited/References page.

- Minimum of *[INSERT]* academically appropriate sources in addition to assigned primary source/s.
- Utilize library databases to locate appropriate sources. [Insert link to CCBC Library Research Guide if applicable.]

## GRADING:

- This assignment will account for [\_\_\_\_% (must be at least 10%)] of the total course grade.
- See attached rubric for details about how your essay will be graded

# SUBMISSION GUIDELINES:

- [INSERT DUE DATE]
- [INSERT COURSE SPECIFIC SUBMISSION DETAILS]
- Electronic submissions must be made with the student's ID number (900 or 901#) as the file name through Brightspace. Student and instructor names should not appear on electronic submissions.

General Education Competency	Assignment/ Question	4 Exemplary: Exceeds Expectations	3 Accomplished: Meets Expectations	2 Developing: Approaches Expectations	1 Beginning: Falls Below Expectations	0 Missing content/task required for evaluation
Written & Oral Communication CCO# state the CCO objective(s) for this GenEd outcome	In this column, list the specific parts of the Assignment that address each competency.					Use this score when it is not possible to evaluate for this competency because the submission is incomplete
Critical Analysis & Reasoning CCO# state the CCO objective(s) for this GenEd outcome		Work of a quality that should earn an A				
Technological Competence CCO# state the CCO objective(s) for this GenEd outcome			Work of a quality that should earn a B or high C.			
Information Literacy CCO# state the CCO				Work of a quality that should earn a low C or D.		

General Education Competency	Assignment/ Question	4 Exemplary: Exceeds Expectations	3 Accomplished: Meets Expectations	2 Developing: Approaches Expectations	1 Beginning: Falls Below Expectations	0 Missing content/task required for evaluation
objective(s) for this GenEd outcome						
Scientific and Quantitative or Logical Reasoning					Poor, failing work.	
CCO# state the CCO objective(s) for this GenEd outcome						
Local & Global Diversity						
CCO# state the CCO objective(s) for this GenEd outcome						
Personal & Professional Ethics						
CCO# state the CCO objective(s) for this GenEd outcome						

Note: Remove rubric rows for GenEd Outcomes not assessed in the Assignment.

Whenever possible, choose specific, quantitative language in describing positively what students have achieved to meet the criteria (as opposed to

standards students have failed to meet).

Avoid counting errors.

Alignment between stated CCO objective and rubric criteria should be clear.

# General Education Common Graded Assignment: **BIOL 109: Human Anatomy and Physiology Fall 2023** Writing a Scientific Poster

Human Anatomy & Physiology is a general education course designed to assist students in the development of critical life skills. One of the goals of this assignment is to assess student competence for each of these objectives:

- I. Written and Oral Communication— explain homeostasis (CCO3), describe the roles that the integumentary, skeletal, muscular, nervous, endocrine, cardiovascular, lymphatic, respiratory, digestive, urinary, and reproductive systems play in maintaining homeostasis and (CCO4)
- II. **Critical Analysis and Reasoning** integrate knowledge of the functioning integumentary, skeletal, muscular, nervous, endocrine, cardiovascular, lymphatic, respiratory, digestive, urinary, and reproductive systems of the body in order to explain how the body functions as a whole (CCO6)
- IV. Information Literacy— find, evaluate, use, and cite sources of information (such as advertisements, testimonials, scientific articles, or medical journals) to distinguish between scientific and non-scientific information as it applies to the human body (CCO12)
- V. Scientific and Quantitative or Logical Reasoning— determine the impact that physiological and anatomical changes will have on the human body (CCO9)
- VI. **Local and Global Diversity** discuss how the anatomy and physiology of the human body is similar in all racial and cultural groups and give examples of disease prevalence between various cultural, ethnic, or racial groups (such as sickle cell anemia, heart disease, obesity, or diabetes) (CCO8)

# ASSIGNMENT:

Students will research a particular disease or disorder affecting human anatomy and physiology and then construct a scientific poster presentation to detail the causes, physiological effects, treatments, and further details of the disease or disorder studied. Posters will be created collaboratively and presented to peers and instructors.

# Purpose:

A scientific research poster is a visual way for researchers to present information about new findings in their fields. Scientific posters are often found at research and clinical conferences where they can be used to quickly disseminate new findings that may not have been developed enough for a stand-alone research article but are still novel and will help advance the field. Because posters are limited in space and scope, scientists and clinicians must crystallize their thoughts about the research and focus on its essence. The poster you create must efficiently communicate the required information and appropriate visuals in a very confined space.

# Audience:

The traditional audience for a scientific poster is highly specialized. While there are a few notable exceptions, most scientific posters are created for presentation to specific societies and groups of scientists. For the purposes of this assignment, assume the audience is other BIOL 109 students. Expect this audience to have a basic understanding of organ system physiology. Please keep in mind that these are scientific posters, and not treatment pamphlets; avoid the use of second person and casual language.

# **Directions**: Your poster must have the following parts:

• <u>Title</u>: A descriptive title (usually as a banner) with the names of the participating students and their affiliation.

- <u>Introduction</u>: The introduction contains a very brief (1-2 sentences) summary of the disease or disorder.
- <u>Cause(s)</u>: This section contains a brief description of normal anatomy and physiology of the organ systems involved in the disease or disorder. Also describe the cause(s) and/or risk factors associated with the development of the disease or disorder. The demographics of those who suffer from the disease or disorder should be mentioned here as well, including any specific racial, ethnic, or socio-economic factors.
- <u>Physiologic Effects:</u> This section describes the specific effects that the disease or disorder has on human physiology (and potentially on the anatomy as well). Be specific in describing the disease process, drawing clear connections between the mechanism of the disorder and the observed symptoms.
- <u>Treatments:</u> This section should be used to describe methods of treatment, whether they be curative or therapeutic. Be clear about the purpose of the treatment, relating to a physiologic effect if possible.
- <u>Further Details and Application</u>: This section can contain additional information relating to historic, cultural, or medical implications in modern society. Emphasis can be given to the global impact of the disease or disorder, or to solutions of inequity of care.
- <u>Sources cited:</u> This section presents an alphabetic listing of all the sources that were cited in your poster. For this assignment, you must cite at least three (3) sources. You must use academically appropriate sources (no popular sources, Wikipedia, dot com web sites, dictionaries, social media, class presentations and/or PowerPoints). Sources must be cited in APA 7 format.

# General considerations:

- Posters are visual by nature, and so the poster must have a clear and logical order and flow. Readers should be able to follow the information on the poster easily.
- The poster layout should utilize all the available space on the poster. Each section (excluding the title) should be separated by a heading.
- Visual aids (such as figures and photographs) are an important part of a poster, but the visuals that you add should enhance understanding of some aspect of the poster and should not be used as space filling or jokes. All images should be properly cited. Credit should be given to any student generated photos.
- In addition to general images, you must include at least one graph or table on your poster; for example, you might include a table of demographic information, or a graph detailing the effectiveness of a particular treatment. All graphs and tables must be computer generated; hand drawn graphs and tables will not be accepted. Graphs and tables can be reproduced from cited sources, or computer generated in software such as Microsoft Excel. All graphs and tables presented should have clearly labeled categories and/or axes, as well as units of measure.
- Figures (including graphs) must be consecutively numbered and titled (i.e., Figure 2: Time to symptoms onset compared to force of blow). Tables should be consecutively numbered and titled (i.e., Table 2: Time to symptom onset in student athletes hit with concussive blow).
- Poster should have a professional aesthetic to them. Glitter, joke figures, and other embellishments should be avoided.
- All visuals and font on the poster must be easily viewed from 5-feet away (the font sizes should be a minimum of 48pts).

[Note for Faculty – Acceptable list of diseases/disorders: Alzheimer's disease, celiac disease, chronic obstructive pulmonary disorder, coronary heart disease, diabetes mellitus, gastro-esophageal reflux disease, Hashimoto's thyroiditis, leukemia, multiple sclerosis, muscular dystrophy, osteoporosis, Parkinson's disease, and sickle cell anemia.]

# ASSIGNMENT SPECIFICATIONS:

- *Digital submission on Brightspace*. An optional digital template will be provided for students.
- APA 7 style format and documentation for parenthetical citations and a References section.
- Minimum of three (3) academically appropriate resources.
- Utilize library databases to locate appropriate sources specifically the CCBC Library Guide for <u>Anatomy & Physiology</u>

# GRADING:

- This assignment will account for 10% of the total course grade.
- See attached rubric for details about how your poster will be graded.

## SUBMISSION GUIDELINES:

- **[INSERT DUE DATE]** Project must be collected within the last 1/3<sup>rd</sup> of the course.
- Poster must be submitted for grading. Please submit TWO copies of the assignment.
  - For grading:
    - Include student names in Title.
      - File name should include student last names and topic. For example, if students Jones and Smith researched celiac disease, naming the file Jones\_Smith\_Celiac.pptx would be appropriate.
  - Anonymous submission:
    - Replace student names in Title with student ID numbers. All student and faculty names should be omitted.
    - File name should include student ID numbers and the course ID number only. For example, 900123456\_901987654\_BIOL109EB1.pptx would be in the correct format.
## BIOL 109 General Education Assessment Rubric 2023

General Education Competency	Assignment/ Question	4 Exemplary Exceeds Expectations	3 Accomplished Meets Expectations	2 Developing: Approaches Expectations	1 Beginning: Falls Below Expectations	0 Missing content/task required for evaluation
Written & Oral Communication CCO3 explain homeostasis	Title; Cause; Physiologic Effects; Treatments sections	Title is descriptive and appropriate for the disease/disorder presented	Title encompasses the topic but may not be specific to the disease/disorder presented	Title addresses overall topic theme but does not include the disease/disorder presented	Title is overly simplistic and does not address the disease/disorder presented	Title is not included on the poster.
CCO4 describe the roles that the integumentary, skeletal, muscular, nervous, endocrine,		Ideas are presented with a logical organization in the appropriate section.	Ideas are presented with a logical organization of ideas with only minor lapses in paragraph structure.	Ideas are presented in an organizational structure with some errors that impede meaning.	Ideas are presented in an illogical manner.	Sections are missing OR
cardiovascular, lymphatic, respiratory, digestive, urinary and reproductive play in maintaining		Clear use of sufficient and appropriate evidence to support statements.	Appropriate evidence to support statements; minor lapses in usage only.	Limited evidence is given to support statements; one major or several minor lapses exist.	Evidence is lacking for some statements; significant lapses exist.	Connection between physiology and treatments lacking.
nomeostasis		Writing is free of errors in usage/mechanics.	Writing is free of errors in usage/mechanics, except for minor errors which do not impede meaning.	Writing contains some major grammatical or usage errors or many minor errors	Writing contains many major grammatical or usage errors.	Writing impedes meaning.
		Professional aesthetic and presentation for a scientific audience to include appropriate fonts,	Professional aesthetic and presentation for a scientific audience to include appropriate fonts, colors, and images.	Aesthetic and presentation for a scientific audience may include some lapses in appropriate	Aesthetic and presentation are not appropriate respect to font, color, and images.	Aesthetic is inappropriate to a professional setting.

		colors, and images.		font, color, and images.		
Critical Analysis and Reasoning CCO6 integrate knowledge of the functioning integumentary, skeletal, muscular, nervous, endocrine, cardiovascular, lymphatic, respiratory, digestive, urinary	Cause; Physiologic Effects;	Students have specifically and effectively described the effects of the disease/disorder to human physiology (and anatomy if applicable); includes brief description of normal function versus disease state. Clear connections are	Students have identified the effects of the disease/disorder to human physiology.	Students identify that there are effects of the disease/disorder to human physiology but have not identified what that is.	Students imply that there are effects of the disease/disorder to human physiology but do not identify those.	Section is absent
and reproductive systems of the body in order to explain how the body functions as a whole		made between the mechanism of disorder and the symptoms.	between the mechanism of disorder and the symptoms.	mechanism of disorder and symptoms are implied; disease process is unclear.	between mechanism of disorder and symptoms are lacking	
Information Literacy <u>CCO12</u> find, evaluate, use, and cite sources of information (advertisements, testimonials, scientific articles, medical journals) to distinguish between	Cause; Physiologic Effects; Treatments; Further Application sections	Resource materials are appropriate to the disease/disorder Resource materials are selected for the greatest understanding given the experiences of entry level student research	Resource materials are appropriate to the disease/disorder Resource materials are selected for the greatest understanding given the experiences of entry level student research	Resource materials are appropriate to the disease/disorder Resource materials demonstrate lack of appropriate choice based on reading level, journal specificity, and article content.	Resource materials are present but may not be appropriate in the context of the disease/disorder	Resource materials are inappropriate, or citations are incomplete.
scientific and non- scientific information as it		Source information is smoothly integrated and paraphrased in	Source information is generally integrated into the appropriate	Source information is integrated into all sections; use of		

applies to the human body		appropriate sections with limited use of direct quotes All referenced sources are cited properly APA format in-text and in the reference section.	sections with limited use of direct quotes. All referenced sources are cited in APA format in-text and in the reference section; minor errors may exist.	quotations is excessive or inappropriate. All referenced sources are cited in APA format in-text and in the reference section; many minor or some major errors exist.		
Scientific and Quantitative or Logical Reasoning <u>CCO9</u> determine the impact that physiological and anatomical changes will have on the	Physiologic effects, Treatments sections	Clearly states how the disease/disorder impacts specific physiological and/or anatomical systems.	States how the disease/disorder impacts physiological and/or anatomical systems.	Identifies that the disease impacts physiological and/or anatomical systems but does so in general terms only.	Description of disease/disorder impacts to physiological and/or anatomical systems has errors which indicate oversimplification or misunderstanding.	Impacts of disease/disorder to physiological/ana tomical systems are not discussed.
human body		Students use <u>and apply</u> appropriate academic resources for the evaluation of impacts and therapies. Students have clearly identified both the purpose of the treatment and the physiologic targets;	Students use appropriate academic resources for the evaluation of impacts and therapies. Students have identified both the purpose of the treatment and the physiologic targets;	Information used to evaluate impacts and therapies is non- academic in nature. Students have identified the treatment and the physiologic targets; supporting evidence may be flawed	Information used to evaluate impacts and therapies is from general or simplified resources. Students have identified the treatment or the physiologic targets; supporting evidence	
		curative versus therapeutic nature is discussed with appropriate supporting evidence.	supporting evidence is included.		flawed or insufficient.	

Local & Global Diversity <u>CCO8</u> discuss how the anatomy and physiology of the human body is similar in all racial and cultural groups including examples of disease prevalence (such as sickle cell anemia, heart disease, obesity or diabetes) between various cultural, ethnic or racial groups	Causes; Further Details & Application sections	Describes causes and/or risk factors for the disease/disorder with special recognition of racial, cultural, <b>and</b> socio-economic factors that may contribute to disease and/or availability of effective treatments. Explores historical, cultural and medical implications of disease/disorder and its prevalence in specific racial or cultural groups. Creative possible solutions to inequalities of care and/or prevention are provided.	Identifies causes and/or risk factors for the disease/disorder with recognition of racial, or cultural, or socio-economic factors that may contribute to disease and/or availability of effective treatments. Identifies historical, cultural and medical implications of disease/disorder and its prevalence in specific racial or cultural groups. Potential solutions to inequalities of care and/or prevention are mentioned.	Mentions causes and/or risk factors for the disease/disorder with recognition of racial, or cultural, or socio-economic factors that may contribute to disease and/or availability of effective treatments. Identifies historical, or cultural or medical implications of disease/disorder AND Identifies impact in specific racial or cultural groups.	Provides anecdotal accounts of causes and/or risk factors for the disease/disorder with recognition of racial, or cultural, or socio-economic factors that may contribute to disease and/or availability of effective treatments. Identifies historical, or cultural or medical implications of disease/disorder OR Identifies impact in specific racial or cultural groups.	Fails to recognize causes and/or risk factors for the disease/disorder with recognition of racial, or cultural, or socio- economic factors. Does not discuss historical or cultural or medical implications of the disease/disorder.

# APPENDIX 2: Intervention Plan Report Template (2024) and sample Intervention Plan: MATH 125

## INTERVENTION PLAN REPORT

Date: Course:

Ι.	Current Data
	<ul> <li>In this section, summarize the data/ outcomes of this most recent assessment.</li> <li>Identify the GenEd Outcomes assessed in the CGA and the degree of proficiency found in the assessment.</li> <li>If student work was not evaluated, describe why. For example, because only one section was taught or that no faculty were available for scoring, etc.</li> </ul>
II.	Previous Cycle's Intervention Strategy
	<ul> <li>In this section, summarize the intervention strategy plan and implementation from the previous assessment cycle, and evaluate the effectiveness of that intervention in the context of the most recent data.</li> <li>If no Intervention plan is on file, acknowledge that; if this was due to lack of scoring note that as well.</li> </ul>
III.	Intervention Target Area and Rationale
	In this section, identify the target intervention area, including relevant CCO course objectives and major topics and relevant General Education Outcomes, and explain the rationale for this focus. <i>This is possible even if no student work was scored</i> .
IV.	Intervention Strategy and Implementation Plan
	<ul> <li>In this section, summarize the proposed strategy and implementation plan.</li> <li>Interventions may be facilitated through a wide variety of methods, including addition of <u>High Impact Practices</u>, <u>professional development</u> for faculty, revised instructional methods, revised instructional materials (textbooks, <u>Library Guides</u> etc.), revised assessment tools (CGA and rubric), course requirements, and much more.</li> <li>Implementation plans must include specific dates for implementing interventions, as well as identifying specific individuals who will implement those interventions.</li> </ul>
V.	Intervention Goals and Expected Outcomes
	<ul> <li>In this section summarize the goals and expected outcomes of the intervention.</li> <li>Goals should be S.M.A.R.T. (specific, measurable, achievable, relevant, and timely)</li> <li>Align each goal with the expected improvement in student outcomes</li> </ul>
VI.	Implementation Timeline
	Describe specific actions that will be taken in each semester before the next Assessment. Semester 1 post Assessment Spring 2024 Semester 2 post Assessment Fall 2024 Semester 3 post Assessment Spring 2025 <b>Next assessment semester: Fall 2026</b>

# INTERVENTION PLAN REPORT

## Date: 11/23/24

# Course: MATH 125 – Finite Mathematics & Modeling

Ι.	Current Data
	N=114
	Percentage of students who got 3 (meets expectations) or 4 (exceeds expectations) for
	each Learning Outcome:
	Written & Oral Communication: 45%
	Critical Analysis & Reasoning: 59%
	Technological Competence: 47%
	Information Literacy: 76%
	Scientific & Quantitative or Logical Reasoning: 50%
	Percentage of students who got 1 (below expectations) or 0 for each outcome:
	Written & Oral Communication: 25%
	Critical Analysis & Reasoning: 21%
	Technological Competence: 29%
	<ul> <li>Information Literacy: 16%</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>Scientific &amp; Quantitative or Logical Reasoning: 25%</li> </ul>
11.	Previous Cycle's Intervention Strategy
	Provide all instructors with information on the numerous library resources that will
	directly help students with information literacy.
	<ul> <li>Outcome: Implemented, but not entirely faithfully.</li> </ul>
	• Rephrase project question #4 to replace "consider using more than one method" to
	"must use more than one method"
	<ul> <li>Outcome: Not implemented</li> </ul>
	• Develop new prompt to better address student ability to evaluate cultural and social
	applications and approaches to statistical analysis
	<ul> <li>Outcome: The proposed change to question #5 was approved. Written &amp; Oral</li> </ul>
	Communication saw a massive boost in scores (the average moved from 1.71 to
	2.38, the mode from 1 to 2, and the percentage of students Exceeding
	Expectations moved from 7% to 25%). By any metric, this was a success.
	Rewrite the rubric for Written and Oral Communication Skills to closer match
	expectations and allow a wider range of acceptable student responses to be accepted.
	(for example: currently a clear explanation with a singular grammatical error does not fit
	into any category, but perhaps is best scored as a 2).
	o Outcome: Implemented. See above for the marked success of the committee's
	ability to intervene with Written & Oral Communication.
111.	Intervention Target Area and Rationale
	• Scientific & Quantitative or Logical Reasoning: MATH 125 is the perfect place to imbed
	students with Scientific & Quantitative or Logical Reasoning (levering CCOs 2, 8, and 14 at
	a minimum), and yet our scores continue to drop (over the last 3 GrEAT cycles, the

	percent of students achieving scores of 3 or 4 on this category has gone from 69% to
	50%). Interventions have been proposed twice, but never implemented.
	• Rubric: The rubric needs to be updated to reflect the new CCO for the updated MATH 125
	course (effective MATH 125). Also, across the board, the rubric has too much allowance
	for students to score differently than scorers expected based on curious, inflexible, or
	unintended wording in the rubric. This may account for Technology Competence,
	Information Literacy, and Scientific & Quantitative or Logical Reasoning (three out of five
	categories!) all decreasing by a statistically insignificant amount.
IV.	Intervention Strategy and Implementation Plan
	Provide all instructors with information on the numerous library resources that will
	directly help students with information literacy.
	Reframe project question #4
	Edit rubric
	• Develop means to verify all instructors are distributed the correct version of the GrEATs
	assessment.
۷.	Intervention Goals and Expected Outcomes
	• Scientific & Quantitative or Logical Reasoning: at least 70% of all students should score a 3
	(meet expectations) or 4 (exceeds expectations)
	<ul> <li>All instructors should distribute the correct version of the GrEATs assessment.</li> </ul>
VI.	Implementation Timeline
	Provide all instructors with information on the numerous library resources that will
	directly help students with information literacy. Sp2024
	• MATH 125 committee provides input on how to best leverage our CCO objectives 2, 8, or
	14 to align with project question #4. Committee weighs in on what edits are necessary to
	other questions to bring the question in-line with the new CCO objective 10. F2024
	• Rubric is edited to reflect the new questions #1 and #4 as well as incorporate rubric-
	related notes from previous grading cycle Sp2025
	All instructors made aware of the current revisions and correct documents Fa2025
	Next assessment semester: Spring 2026

#### CONTINUING EDUCATION LEARNING OUTCOMES ASSESSMENT REPORT

Jack Boeve Director, Continuing Education Learning Outcomes

#### June 2024

#### Overview

CCBC's Continuing Education (CE) division offers a wide variety of noncredit courses and programs providing workforce development and lifelong learning opportunities for citizens of Baltimore County and its surrounding regions. Learning outcomes assessment activities are infused at both the course and program levels through multiple channels. These include student demonstration of skills, portfolio assessment, external standardized testing, internships and clinical placements, and external professional certifications.

#### Licensure and Certification

Highlights of Continuing Education's FY23 licensure and certification activities include:

Program Area	FY23 Licensure Course and Program
Applied Technology	6,577
Business and Management	367
Health and Human Services	3,386
Information Technology	72
Other	2,041
Transportation	906
Total	13,349

## Student Internship & Clinical Work

Internship and clinical placements provide excellent opportunities for students to demonstrate skills learned in real-world workplace settings, working with professionals in their respective fields. In FY23, up to 350 students completed an internship, externship, practicum, or clinical placement as part of their course of study. Students learned experientially in such areas as: Medical Assistant; Central Service Technician; Dental Assistant; Polysomnographic (Sleep) Technician; Nurse and Nursing Assistant; Phlebotomist; Patient Care Technician; Community Health Worker; and Food Works Basic Culinary Worker. Additionally, among students completing an internship or practicum, 70 individuals with disabilities did so in such areas as: Professional Animal Worker; Child Care Provider (Lead Teacher, Child Care Assistant/Classroom Aide); Infant and Toddler Care Provider; Warehouse Technician; and Office Skills.

## **Program Review**

Building on its successful pilot review of four education programs in FY22, Continuing Education engaged in a formal program review process for eight programs for the period FY21-FY23:

- Automotive Safety Inspector (Maryland)
- Central Service Technician
- Certified Apartment Maintenance Technician
- English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL)
- Entry Level Bookkeeper
- Network+ Certified Technician
- Pharmacy Technician
- Special Police Officer

Continuing Education refined its program review report template and modelled the review process to parallel, where appropriate, existing credit processes. Program staff completed the report templates for their programs, and a review committee consisting of Credit and Continuing Education staff met with each program's leaders to review the data and make recommendations and suggestions. The review forms and panel feedback are included after this summary.

Overall recommendations and suggestions among different programs included:

- Review program outcomes to ensure they capture what the student can demonstrate upon completion of the program (i.e., outcomes are specific, measurable, and achievable within the parameters of the program).
- Evaluate expanding online/hybrid/remote formats (*as appropriate*).
- Develop and/or enhance partnerships/collaboration within CCBC to align and integrate with CCBC Pathways and Credit programs (*as appropriate*).
- Explore strategies for increasing program enrollments, such as:
  - developing current and new external partnerships in the community and region to support student progress and success beyond CCBC;
  - marketing in alignment with partners and contract employers, as well as pursuing grassroots approaches;
  - o identifying and recruiting additional instructors;
  - offering CEUs and other professional development opportunities (*as appropriate*).
- Explore strategies to drive higher retention and completion rates, including development of improved systems and mechanisms to track and benchmark student progress and retention.
- Develop improved systems to track success rates of achieving capstone activities and external credentials after students complete their programs.
- Capture employment outcomes and hire rates, including from practicum/internship/clinical opportunities (*as applicable*); and
- Provide explanations for variances in rates/numbers year over year (e.g., applications, enrollments, completions, revenues, sections, etc.).

## Goals for Next Year

Continuing Education anticipates expanding its assessment activity by returning to course-level assessment projects and expanding our program review efforts. Initiatives in view include establishing a

program review schedule for FY25 and FY26; iterative improvement of the program review and program review feedback forms; incorporating diversity, equity, inclusion, and belonging (DEIB) elements into program review processes; and developing a learning outcomes assessment plan for Continuing Education.

## Summary of Continuing Education FY 2024 Program Reviews Automotive Safety Inspector (Maryland)

## Strengths

- Impressive hands-on program that prepares students to take the state exam and be certified as MD Safety Inspector by MD State Police. Program is accountable to and monitored by a MD State Police governing body.
- Strong employer and State Police connections.
- Possibility of collaboration with MD State Police to become a third-party tester and lead community college with other community college partners.
- Nice partnership with Credit and alignment to CCBC strategic directions.
- Few competitors / very little regional competition.
- Excellent financial margins.

#### Concerns

• Vacancy of the FT Coordinator position presents challenges for program operation and growth.

#### Assessment

- The program has "a lot of opportunity." Areas of potential growth might be recertification of inspectors, developing customized topics, reaching out to automotive-related shops for students, promotion through advisory boards and targeted advertising.
- Encouragement to "keep developing partnerships and braiding academic and workforce strategies." Leverage youth and WIOA funding opportunities.
- This is a "niche program and relatively small but has had strong growth over last 2 years."
- While aspects of the program must be conducted in the automotive building, consider whether a hybrid or blended approach might be possible for other elements.
- Consider if this could be a stackable credential with another program (e.g., diesel mechanic) or within the Out of School Youth area.
- Consider possibilities of leveraging contract programs to help with growth and recruiting.

- Program continues as currently designed.
- To improve completion rates, review prior learning for the course sequence.
- Evaluate how individuals with various levels of experience, including current inspectors seeking renewal/recertification, might be served by the program.

## Summary of Continuing Education FY 2024 Program Reviews Central Service Technician

## Strengths

- Program prepares students to take the national Certified Registered Central Service Technician (CRCST) certification exam administered by the Healthcare Sterile Processing Association (HSPA), which is a strong group nationally; the certification is required by many hospitals.
- Program provides solid classroom instruction by excellent instructors who are subject matter experts in their field.
- Program includes placing students in hospitals across the Baltimore region for clinical hours and on-site training.
- Program has a positive reputation and good relationships with surgical tech managers and clinical coordinators in recent years.
- Programs are in high demand, and the career forecast for program completers is very strong.

#### Concerns

• Evaluate program completion requirements and consider whether current requirements for clinical hours (400) in hospital setting for completion might be revised or removed.

#### Assessment

- Suggestion to explore opportunities for gaining external review and accountability for this program that aligns with healthcare and hospital employment; perhaps add program to a larger advisory board.
- Suggestion to differentiate between "interest" and "applications" to derive more accurate application and acceptance rates. (This may refer more to historic application processes in FY21-FY23 when applications were selective, and interest was high due to availability of DOL grants. As noted, after March 2023, the program shifted to open enrollments.)
- Suggestion to explore greater alignment with CCBC pathways (health professions) and credit programs (Surgical Technologist AA). Investigate whether credit in the surgical tech program may be given for CE course completion.

- Program continues with minor adjustments; determine whether 400 hours of clinical practice is required for successful completion.
- Explore an alternative to the current requirements of 400 hours of clinical practice.
- Look for opportunities for program leadership to serve on the Surgical Tech and/or Allied Health advisory board(s).

## Summary of Continuing Education FY 2024 Program Reviews Certified Apartment Maintenance Technician (CAMT)

#### Strengths

- Well-rounded, solid technical program.
- Curriculum aligned to National Apartment Association Education Institute (NAAEI) and that while curriculum delivery has been adjusted over the years, actual skills are the same.
- Partnerships with external partners.
- Three certificates/certifications available. National certifications. The CE certificate will land students a job. Completers can receive an industry certification after 1 year of field experience.
- Opportunity to add additional HVAC training for upskilling.
- Avenue for articulation to credit; possibilities for maintenance technicians wishing to advance in property maintenance industry include project management or construction management.
- Lab component that competitor programs lack.
- An entry-level program, after which completers can take specific training courses to further their chosen specialization. Many opportunities for advancement in the field.
- Program completers have strong employment opportunities, or they can work for themselves.
- Coordinator provides strong support to students through regular meetings, test-taking strategies, employment leads; students from internal customers (e.g., LEAP) are assigned a student case worker and job developer.
- Excellent financial margins.
- Recognition from Lowe's with recent \$100,000 grant.

#### Concerns

• Significant weaknesses/challenges are physical space constraints that hamper growing enrollments and larger class sizes (current cap is 7 students/section); no staff backup; limited instructors; instructor turnover; heavy administrative work.

#### Assessment

- Program is strategic based on the development of practical skills that lead to employment, employment growth projections in MD, and the current/future stock of apartments requiring CAMT skills.
- Space and staffing will grow enrollment. Need to build more alignment to credit. Very nice program.
- Excellent analysis and nice presentation of a program that is beneficial to students and provides entry level into the field.

- Program continues as currently designed.
- To increase enrollment, increase and enhance lab space and upgrade equipment.

## Summary of Continuing Education FY 2024 Program Reviews English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL)

## Strengths

- Beyond formal accountability to MD Labor, program curriculum and delivery is undergirded by an impressive and detailed list of additional evidence-based theories and standards.
- Program consistently demonstrates ability to meet and exceed outcomes goals/targets set by state funder (MD Labor).
- Thorough, detailed curriculum maps for all course levels.
- Highly qualified staff and high instructor retention rate.
- Appropriate technology integration.
- Although there is not yet a direct transition from this ESOL program to the Credit academic ESOL program, there is strong alignment and regular dialogue/partnership between CE and Credit program staff regarding curricular choices, rationale, and a more seamless transition from CE to Credit programming.
- Program strengthens local communities and workforce (i.e., direct correlation between higher English proficiency, full-time employment, and higher wages).
- Effective and efficient promotion through CCBC channels, word-of-mouth, and referrals from core Baltimore County WIOA partners.

#### Assessment

- Program description thoroughly covers multiple points of the program, including intake and placement, supporting research, content, class offerings, and cost.
- Dedicated staff for valuable program that strongly impacts about 1,300 learners from nearly 80 different countries each year.
- While 80% of program format is in classroom and 20% remote (Zoom), the program could consider whether additional content could be delivered online (e.g., practice sessions, skills practice).
- Suggestion in future program review submission to provide more information on accountability and reporting requirements for MD Labor and their external review process.
- Encouragement to continue pursuing opportunities and investigating solutions to the challenges identified in the program review submission (e.g., scheduling and delivery, intake processes, communications and signage, planning, hiring instructors, etc.).

- Program continues as currently designed.
- Continue exploring avenues of partnership with Credit programming, especially in light of the Spring 2024 pilot effort to understand better the education levels of students who "test out" of CE ESOL in relation to the placement requirements for Credit ESOL.

## Summary of Continuing Education FY 2024 Program Reviews Entry Level Bookkeeper

## Strengths

- Easily accessible program that does not require higher education.
- Multi-modal opportunities and flexible schedules to attain a CE workforce certificate in 5 months.
- Partnership with Credit programming as represented by recent curriculum update by long serving Credit instructor for online asynchronous format and that the Credit instructor has been teaching the curriculum.
- Instruction by CPAs and CCBC Credit faculty.
- Development of CE-Credit crosswalk course map (in progress).

#### Concerns

- Review committee members acknowledge the program leadership's reported concerns:
  - competition from other free/low-cost online education providers decreases ability to attract students;
  - o cost of CE courses and rising textbook costs present challenges/barriers for students;
  - o difficulty finding qualified instructors who are also a good fit for the program; and
  - increasing use of accounting software and automation may reduce demand for manual bookkeeping skills and thus impact enrollments.

#### Assessment

- Suggestion to figure out how to track completers more effectively.
- Suggestion to capitalize on CCBC program as affordable, flexible, and the only community college program in the area taught by qualified instructors in synchronous classes.
- Encouragement to include more industry feedback in future program reviews.
- Improving timelines and intake approach may increase retention and completion rates.
- Suggestion for program staff to assess how program addresses evolving needs for students to understand the administration of health care programs / health insurance (i.e., the administrator for a small business needs to know bookkeeping + health care insurance + human resource information system functions).
- Suggestion to consider opportunities of adding a course for off-site/remote bookkeepers.
- Explore articulation and prior learning opportunities.
- Consider how to serve students who may not have access to software (perhaps via lab time).

- Program continues as currently designed.
- Investigate external credentials.
- Complete CE-Credit crosswalk course map.

## Summary of Continuing Education FY 2024 Program Reviews Network+ Certified Technician

## Strengths

- An internal certification that provides the ability to sit for an external exam.
- Solid curriculum.
- Good growth opportunities for enrollments and through potential relationships with employers.
- Strong integration with Credit programs: alignment with Credit via shared courses and credit by certification; shared format; connection to Credit program's advisory board.
- Program offered in multiple formats and with a mix of staff.
- Program promotion strategy includes multiple methods at little/no cost.
- Retention and completion strategy includes strong instructor and coordinator support; student events; goal-oriented approach.

## Concerns

- Review committee members noted the high number of cancelled sections (and cancel rate). Suggestion to examine factors behind these figures and provide explanations. Also, consider identifying goals for increasing ran/decreasing cancelled sections.
- Review committee members view the program as valuable, while also expressing concern that the number of completers seems low compared to enrollments.
- Committee members concurred as to the challenges of overcoming the perception of community college as providers of IT courses.
- Review committee members concur that the program would benefit greatly from having a new FT Coordinator—and that this vacancy represents a weakness and staffing it an opportunity, as the coordinator would be able to focus energy and grow programming.

## Assessment

- Encouragement to explore opportunities to increase enrollments and completion rates (e.g., developing partnerships).
- Encouragement to leverage employer groups for accountability and for growth opportunities.
- Suggestion to pursue more opportunities for contract training.
- Encouragement to add advisory board input.
- Suggestion to look at suitability of program and to create employer networks and improve intake processes (in response to low completion rates).
- Encouragement to enhance and expand retention and completion strategies:
  - assess current strategies for how they could support students more effectively (e.g., instructor-coordinator roles; goal-oriented approach).

- Program continues as currently designed.
- Explore an alternative format in addition to sharing with Credit program.

## Summary of Continuing Education FY 2024 Program Reviews Pharmacy Technician

## Strengths

- Multiple modes and times of delivery: combo of asynchronous and face-to-face class sessions and online student work; plus, campus sites with pharmacy labs.
- Nice alignment with Credit programs and exploration of efforts to integrate with AAS Allied Health. Students with national health certificates can receive credit for prior learning and an AA without duplication of content.
- Program is favorably positioned to prepare students for certification and employment with good wages within 6 months in a region and sector in which there is a strong need and strong growth.
- Program includes an outcome on strategies for taking multiple choice exams. Students will complete a practice exam to prepare for the real exam.
- Program currently offers national certification...and is pursuing an opportunity to become certified to offer MD exam certifications.
- Current promotion strategy and costs are cost-effective.
- Current reappraisal of orientation and onboarding approaches to improve success rates.
- Current review of communications plan between faculty and students throughout program.
- Adjunct faculty are proficient in the subject matter and often still work in the field.
- Strong program compared to other providers (e.g., Ed2Go).

#### Concerns

• Difficulty with advanced math for many students contributes to low completion rates.

## Assessment

- Encouragement to keep developing and building on current strong foundation.
- Suggestion to consider expanding program to offer optional pathways for specialized training in medication history reconciliation or compounding sterile preparations (since the program submission form mentions these).
- Suggestion to collect and provide information on PTCB pass rates and attempts.
- Suggestion to add/highlight the PTCB recertification.
- Encouragement to leverage contract braided funding for tuition/fees.
- Suggestion to consider outreach to pharmacies for potential students.
- Encouragement to partner more closely with Allied Health program.

- Program continues as currently designed.
- Investigate having external review/accountability, such as an advisory board.
- Consider mechanisms and tools that might mitigate challenges and better prepare students for success: suitability test and basic skills assessment; math placement as part of application/intake; program orientations; and evaluation of math course and collaborative brainstorming with other programs.

## Summary of Continuing Education FY 2024 Program Reviews Special Police Officer

## Strengths

- CCBC is a leader in this valuable program area for being able to offer certification/recertification.
- Solid, structured curriculum approved through MPCTC.
- Program has external review/accountability with State of MD Police.
- Program has a solid reputation with MD State Police and with employers. Exceptional name recognition and historical client satisfaction.
- All instructors have very strong background in various facets of law enforcement. Use of in-house faculty and staff for instruction. MDTA and BCPA instructors in proximity.
- Good relationships with law enforcement agencies in the region for help in finding expert instructors.
- Good facilities with ready access.
- High number of clients in proximity.
- Alignment and connections between Credit and CE with materials created to explicate this to students. Integration between Credit and CE via PLA credits; industry articulation agreement; credits for CRJU courses; collaboration with Credit (program development, instruction, marketing, coordinator presence on advisory boards); students' joint participation in pathway events and resources; shared courses; and credit by certification.
- SPO completers can be awarded 6 credits PLA through industry articulation agreement.
- Good integration of open enrollment and contract training; nice source of braided revenue and braided students (CCBC, open enrollment, contract).
- Retention and completion strategy highlights communication plan with students prior to and at start of program so they know—and agree/commit to—attendance and participation requirements.

#### Concerns

- Committee members expressed mixed assessment of the strength of program enrollments (and revenues) for what some termed a somewhat small yet important and needed program. Some reviewers considered enrollments in the 20s to be low/moderate and thought enrollments in the 40s seemed more reasonable.
- Committee members shared program leadership's concern for the difficulty of finding qualified, MPCTC-approved instructors who are available to teach certain courses. It was suggested that additional instructors might help grow enrollments and revenues.

#### Suggestions/Comments / Assessment

- Suggestion to explore growing enrollments through CEUs and other professional development opportunities.
- Suggestion to consider program promotion through more employers/partnerships; grassroots approaches, upbeat program videos on new website.
- Encouragement to explore further reasons open enrollment students appear to be struggling. Consider whether suitability assessments for open enrollment and additional support resources could help.

#### Recommendations

• Program continues as currently designed.

• Consider whether portions of program/curriculum could be delivered effectively in remote, blended, online formats along with already strong face-to-face format.

## The Community College of Baltimore County School of Continuing Education FY24 Program Review for: Automotive Safety Inspector (Maryland)

Continuing Education Workforce Development Certificate Program

#### Contents

- 1. Program Information Sheet
- 2. Review Committee Narrative and Recommendations

#### Supplemental

- A. Curriculum Outlines (Syllabus) for Program Courses
- B. CC10s for Program Courses

Program Name: Automotive Safety Inspector (Maryland) Program Review Period: FY21-FY23

# Program Review Date: January 16, 2024

#### Program Review Committee Members:

Name	Title
Dean CE and Workforce Development	Louise Slezak
CE Assistant Dean Workforce and Literacy	Matt Bernardy
CE Assistant Dean Applied Technology and	Jay Bouis
Logistics	
CE Assistant Dean Health and Business Services	Lynette Higgins
CE Senior Director of Compliance & Outcomes	Don Elliott
CE Director of Instruction & Learning Outcomes	Jack Boeve
CE Director of Budget & Finance	Paul Blair
Industry or Faculty SME	On-hold until more programs in content area to
	review
LOAAB Member #1	Lynn Mason
LOAAB Member #2	Sara Young
CCBC Online Senior Instructional Designer	Eileen Hardin

Submitted by:	Title	Date
Kipp Snow	Director, TDML	11/28/2023
Reviewed and approved by:	Title	Date
Jay Bouis	Assistant Dean	1/2/2024

# Program Information Sheet

Program Title	Automotive Safety Inspector (Maryland)
Program Description	Maryland Safety Inspectors work in an automotive repair or service facility.
Describe the program,	They inspect and monitor transportation equipment, vehicles or systems to
including a focus on	ensure compliance with state regulations and safety standards. Automotive
student outcomes, and	technicians can get multiple certifications and become master technicians
how the program	or world-class technicians. Technicians can also become supervisors,
contributes to the public	owners, inspectors and instructors.
or private good.	
	CCBC offers two classes to help experienced automotive technicians
	prepare for Maryland's written and hands-on safety inspection exams.
	These classes are not required for the exam but are offered to help
	technicians prepare for the exams. Written test preparation reviews the
	applicable Code of Maryland Regulations (COMAR) focusing on the
	administrative responsibilities of an inspector and test taking strategies.
	Hands on test preparation focuses on inspection skills including identifying
	critical equipment status and demonstrating inspection methods consistent
	with COMAR; tool and equipment calibration, usage, and readings; and
	recording findings.
	Skills for success include high work ethic, attention to detail, ability to work
	with heavy machinery, and mechanical aptitude.
	Upon completion of the program, students will be prepared to apply and
	take the Maryland Vehicle Safety Inspector Exam. Students will also be
	prepared to conduct vehicle safety inspections on behalf of the Maryland
	State Police and complete the related inspection documentation.
Credential(s) Offered	CCBC Credential: Students will be awarded a Continuing Education
(include CE Workforce	Workforce Certificate and will have access to a Continuing Education
Development Certificate,	academic record (transcript).
and credentials from any	
certifying organizations)	External Credential: Students will be prepared to apply to take the state
	exam to become a Maryland Safety Inspector.
	Certifying Organization: Maryland State Police Automotive Safety
	Enforcement Division www.mdsp.org
External	No specialized program accreditation.
Review/Accountability	
(Accreditation, advisory	
board, etc.)	
Program Hours:	22 hrs.
	Course Series
	• ARP 294 Preparation for MD State Safety Inspection Test (6 hrs.)
	• ARP 732 Maryland State Inspection Hands-On Test Preparation (16
	hrs.)
	Alternately:

	• VOA 778 Safety Inspection Test Preparation for Maryland – Written &
Drogram Format(c)	Hands-Off (22 firs.)
(classroom online	Classicolli 100%
(Clussroom, omme,	Remote Classroom (20011)
Dienaea)	Deline Institutional
	Online Institutional
	Other
Application Process and	Onen V
Application Process and	Dravisional
Results	
Dragram Quitaamaa	1 property to page Manuland Vahiala Safety Increation Written and Hands
Program Outcomes	an Tests
	On resis,
	2. use the code of Maryland Regulations handbook to find information, and
	3. property perform the administrative and inspection duties of a safety
Summer of Outcomes	Inspector.
Summary of Outcomes	Continuing Education Workforce Certificate
Achievement	Tests
outcomes assessment,	
completions,	
O*Not Code	40 2022 00
CIR Codo	49-3023.00
Cir Coue	47.0099
	automotive service technicians and mechanics is projected to decline 2%
	from 2020 to 2030 in Maryland, Projected annual job openings in Maryland
	are 1 240. Median wages in Maryland are \$49.060
Curriculum Summany	The Automative Safety Inspector (Maryland) program consists of two
(Highlights attach	nrogram courses
Acaloa naae as	Course Series
addendum A curriculum	Preparation for MD State Safety Inspection Test
man may be required )	<ul> <li>Maryland State Inspection Hands-On Test Preparation</li> </ul>
Alignment to CCBC	Enrollment Growth:
Strategic Directions	Targets lifelong learning
	Economic Prosperity:
	<ul> <li>Strengthens collaboration with employers.</li> </ul>
	Credit and Continuing Education Integration:
	<ul> <li>Taught by credit faculty.</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>Provides stackable credentials for automotive technicians.</li> </ul>
	Transformational Academics:
	Workplace credential.
Alignment of Program	Currently Aligned with the <i>Business Pathway</i> . Previously it was aligned with
with CCBC Pathways and	Technology and Engineering Pathway.
Credit Programs	

Summary of Changes	mary of Changes to No major changes to curriculum during the review period.			<i>r</i> period.		
Curriculum During						
Program Indicators						
			Du	nlicated		Undunlicated
Brogram Enrollmont		Du	plicated		ondupileated	
Last Vear (EV22)			40		22	
Two Vears Prior (EV22)		28			20	
Three Vears Prior (EV2	/ 1)		18			1/
Program Revenue	±/		10			14
Last Year (EY23)			<u>\$9.980</u>			\$14,060
Two Years Prior (FY22)	)			9 980		\$7 772
Three Years Prior (FY2	/ 1)		<del>ب</del>	5,500		\$6.602
Sections Offered	±)			Ran		Cancelled
Last Year (FY23)			7	(64%)		4 (36%)
Two Years Prior (FY22)	)		5	(33%)		10 (67%)
Three Years Prior (FY2	, 1)		5	(26%)		14 (74%)
Open Enrollment Vers	us		Open	Enrollment		Contract
Contract Training			open.			Contract
Last Year (FY23)			7			N/A
Two Years Prior (FY22)	)		5			N/A
Three Years Prior (FY2	1)		4			1
FTE						
Last Year (FY23)			1.52		N/A	
Two Years Prior (FY22)			0.74		N/A	
Three Years Prior (FY21)			0.36		0.30	
Program Completers						
Last Year (FY23)			24			
Two Years Prior (FY22)	)			11		
Three Years Prior (FY2	1)			5		
Prior Learning Assessment						
Total program hours a	vailabl	е	N/A			
for prior learning waiv	er:					
Number of hours waiv	red		Not ye	et available		
Updated (If Needed)	N/A					
Program Outcomes						
3-Yr. Projected	r. Projected Projected		Enrollment	Projected FTE		Projected Revenue
Enroll., FTE,						
Revenue						
FY24		40	1.52		\$14,060	
FY25		44	1.67		\$15,466	
FY26	<u> </u>		44	1.67	1	\$15,466
Promotion Strategy ar	nd	Prog	ram advertised	on CCBC website a	nd in Cor	ntinuing Education catalog
Costs	Costs (Flex		(I). SBIL Automotive faculty promotes programs directly to network			ams directly to network
		от ра	arther employe	rs.		

Delivery Costs (supplies,	Adjunct instruction is the primary cost other than three ring binders for
space rental, lab costs)	printed material.
	Class typically runs with four to eight students per section.
	Four students at \$598 = \$2,392
	Typical Expenses: \$1,180
	Typical Revenue: \$1,212
	Instructor @ \$50hr x 22hrs: \$1,100
	Materials @ \$20 per student x 4 students: \$80
Retention and Completion	Instructor and/or Coordinator Support. Goal-oriented approach for
Strategy	certification.
Program Delivery Strategy	Program is delivered on-site in a classroom/laboratory environment
(physical sites, online)	within the Automotive Department, and benefits from the specialized
	equipment available.
Partnerships with Credit	Taught and promoted by credit faculty. In some cases, credit students
	may enroll in a program to receive this certification. Participation in
	SOBTL advisory board.
List Competitors – pricing,	Little local competition to deliver this program. Local competition
location, etc.	includes Secure Streets (https://www.securestreets.com/) at an
	approximate price of \$1200/per person.
Identify Strengths,	STRENGTHS – Strong employer and State Police connections support SBTL
Weaknesses,	Automotive brand.
Opportunities, Threats.	WEAKNESSES – Vacant coordinator position.
Incl. needed resources	OPPORTUNITIES – Develop more contract sections and possible
(staff, technology,	customized topics. Further collaboration with Maryland State Police to
facilities)	become a 3rd Party Tester and lead community college with other
	community college partners.
	THREATS – There is no direct threat to the program running at its current
	capacity.
Notes or comments to	Planning to end the use of VOA 778, the combined written and hands-on
provide further insight or	course title. The use of this course in the past was confusing and has
info	financial aid issues.
	FT Coordinator for Automotive and related programs is vacant.

Program Coordinator:	Vacant
Program Director:	Kipp Snow
Program Assistant Dean:	Jay Bouis
Dean:	Louise Slezak
Additional Staff:	Margie Anne Bonnett, ASA

## The Community College of Baltimore County School of Continuing Education FY24 Program Review for: Central Service Technician

Continuing Education Workforce Development Certificate Program

## Contents

- 1. Program Information Sheet
- 2. Review Committee Narrative and Recommendations

#### Supplemental

A. Curriculum Outlines (Syllabus) for Program Courses
B. CC10s for Program Courses
Program Name: Central Service Technician
Program Review Period: FY2023

#### Program Review Date: January 16, 2024 Program Review Committee Members:

Name	Title
Dean CE and Workforce Development	Louise Slezak
CE Assistant Dean Workforce and Literacy	Matt Bernardy
CE Assistant Dean Applied Technology and	Jay Bouis
Logistics	
CE Assistant Dean Health and Business Services	Lynette Higgins
CE Senior Director of Compliance & Outcomes	Don Elliott
CE Director of Instruction & Learning Outcomes	Jack Boeve
CE Director of Budget & Finance	Paul Blair
Industry or Faculty SME	On-hold until more programs in content area to
	review
LOAAB Member #1	Lynn Mason
LOAAB Member #2	Sara Young
CCBC Online Senior Instructional Designer	Eileen Hardin

Submitted by:	Title	Date
Silke Elsner	Program Coordinator	11/27/2023
Reviewed and approved by:	Title	Date
Lynette Higgins	Program Assistant Dean	

# Program Information Sheet

Program Title	Central Service Technician (CST)
Program Description	The Central Service Technician works in hospitals and surgical centers and
Describe the program,	plays a critical role in preventing and controlling infection by sterilizing,
including a focus on	cleaning, processing, assembling, and storing surgical instruments, as well as
student outcomes,	distributing these and general medical supplies throughout the facility.
and how the program	
contributes to the	The CST program prepares the student to sit for the national Certified
public or private good.	Registered Central Service Technician (CRCST) certification exam administered
	by the Healthcare Sterile Processing Association (HSPA).
	The CST Theory class's curriculum is based on the current Sterile Processing
	Technical Manual published by the HSPA. The program's focal point is the
	student's placement in a hospital's sterile processing department to gain 400
	hours of practical training required for full certification.
	Full certification has become an almost universal requirement for
	employment with some nospitals not hiring uncertified technicians at all
	whereas others still hire uncertified technicians but require certification
	Central Service Technicians are in high demand: many students are hired
	during their practical training. There are efforts of facilities to organize
	classroom training for uncertified incumbents.
Credential(s) Offered	Upon completion of the program students will earn a CCBC Continuing
(include CE Workforce	Education Workforce Certificate.
Development	
Certificate, and	They will be eligible to sit for the CRCST certification exam administered by
credentials from any	the HSPA to become a Certified Registered Central Service Technician.
certifying	
organizations)	
External	N/A
Review/Accountability	
(Accreditation,	
advisory board, etc.)	
Program Hours	502 hours (102 classroom hours + 400 hours of practical training)
Program Format(s)	Classroom 92 - 100% (only Med. Terminology can be taken online; all other
(classroom, online,	classes are in person)
blended)	Remote Classroom (Zoom)
	Blended
	Online Institutional 0 – 8%
	Unline Vendor
Annlingtion Durants	
Application Process	Upen <u>x</u>
and Results	Provisional
	Selective

Program Outcomes	<ol> <li>meet the eligibility requirements to sit for the certification exam administered by the HSPA (Healthcare Sterile Processing Association) to become a Certified Registered Central Service Technician (CRCST);</li> <li>pursue employment options in all states of the US that require certification for Central Service Technicians; and</li> <li>perform standard duties in all areas of a hospital's sterile processing</li> </ol>
	department including decontamination, sterilization, inspection, and packaging of surgical instruments.
Summary of Outcomes	Students will earn a CCBC Continuing Education Workforce Certificate.
Achievement:	They will be eligible to sit for the CRCST certification exam administered by
assessment,	
completions,	
certifications, licenses)	21.0002.00
U*Net Code	31-9093.00
CIP Code:	51.1012
Career Forecast/Analysis:	Central Service Technicians have an excellent career outlook. With Maryland being a national hub for healthcare and the location of renowned and large hospitals, projected growth for Maryland (2020-2023) is 16%, above the national average of 6%.
	Central Service Technicians can progress from CST I to CST III, to team leads, group managers and department directors. Central Service Technician is also viewed as a steppingstone towards becoming a Surgical Technologist (AA degree).
Curriculum Summary (Highlights, attach Acalog page as addendum A curriculum map may be required.)	<ul> <li>The Central Service Technician program consist of three classroom classes which are prerequisites for clinical placement:</li> <li>Medical Terminology – co-requisite class to CST Theory, strongly recommended as first class. This course teaches students the composition of medical terms - root words, prefixes and suffixes - so that they gain a basic understanding of the terminology used in health care settings.</li> <li>CPR for Healthcare Provider – co-requisite to CST Theory, required for clinical placement. This course is approved by the American Heart Association and teaches students the skills to perform CPR in health care settings.</li> <li>CST Theory The course gives the students basic knowledge of microbiology; it teaches</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>The course gives the students basic knowledge of microbiology; it teaches methods to prevent the spread of microorganisms, sterilization methods, processing surgical instruments and equipment, and equipment and supply management.</li> <li>Four clinical classes - 400 hours of practical training in the sterile processing department of a local hospital. The training is divided into 120 hours of Decontamination, 120 hours of Preparing &amp; Packaging Instruments, 96 hours of Sterilization &amp; Disinfection, 24 hours of Storage</li> </ul>

	& Distribution, 24 hour	rs of Quality Assurance Proce	sses, and 16 hours of	
Alignment to CCBC	The Central Service Techni	nrollment goals of		
Strategic Directions	CCBC as well as caters to a	critical demand in the local health care industry		
Alignment of Program The Central Service Technic		cian program is aligned with the Health Professions		
with CCBC Pathways Pathway Central Service Te		echnicians are positioned well to progress to the		
and Credit Programs		ram (AA degree) since they acquire intensive		
	knowledge about surgical i	instruments. The CST program	n. however. is not a	
	prerequisite for admission	to the Surgical Technologist	program. The Surgical	
	Technologist program now	gives no credits for classes t	aken within the CST	
	program.			
Summary of Changes	Updated PowerPoints and	quiz and exam questions to a	align with new HSPA's	
to Curriculum During	9 <sup>th</sup> edition textbook and w	orkbook.		
Review Period:				
Performance	Data covers Central Service	e Technician classes only since	e students don't	
Indicators	declare a major when enro	olling in Medical Terminology	and CPR first.	
Program Enrollment		Duplicated	Unduplicated	
Last Year (FY2023)		139	68	
Two Years Prior (FY2022	2)	107	51	
Three Years Prior (FY202	21)	106	37	
Program Revenue		Budgeted	Actual	
Last Year (FY2023)		est. \$56,000	\$54,331.00	
Two Years Prior (FY2022)		est. \$ 52,000	\$39,388.00	
Three Years Prior (FY2021)		est. \$34,000	\$32,268.00	
Sections Offered		Ran	Cancelled	
Last Year (FY2023)		77 (100%)	0	
Two Years Prior (FY2022)		65 (100%)	0	
Three Years Prior (FY2021)		39 (100%)	0	
Note: Section numbers look large due to each				
clinical student being enrolled in four separate				
sections.				
Cancellation numbers are zero since Theory classes				
naa guaranteed enrollment and clinical classes are				
Created for each individual student after the fact.		Open Enrollment	Contract	
Lact Voar (EV2022)		1 section – 9 enrollments	76 sections – 59	
		OF's first section after	undunlicated · 130	
		DOI Grant ended	dupl enrollments	
Two Years Prior (FY2022)		No sections	65 sections – 51	
			unduplicated: 107	
			dupl. enrollments	
Three Years Prior (FY2021)		13 sections – 4	26 sections – 33	
		unduplicated.; 18	unduplicated; 88	
		unduplicated enrollments	dupl. enrollments	
		OE sections/students		
		were OE remnants		

	shadowing DOL Grant	
	sections	
FTE		
Last Year (FY2023)	1.7	30.9
Two Years Prior (FY2022)	0	25.40
Three Years Prior (FY 2021)	4.7	21.8
Program Completers:		
Last Year (FY2023)	0	15
Two Years Prior (FY2022)	1	18
Three Years Prior (FY2021)	5	7

Prior Learning Assessment	
Total program hours available for prior learning waiver.	37 (Med. Term. & CPR)
Number of hours waived:	Not yet available
Updated (If Needed) Program Outcomes	N/A

3-Year Projected Enrollment, FTE, and Revenue	Projected Enrollment	Projected FTE	Projected Revenue
FY24	66 (unduplicated)	28.42	\$54,696.00
FY25	57 (unduplicated)	18.82	\$70,176.00
FY26	57 (unduplicated)	18.82	\$70,176.00

Promotion Strategy and	CST should be promoted within the promotions for all Allied Health
Costs	programs (Flexi, website). Word of mouth seems to be sufficient for this
	program.
Delivery Costs (supplies,	CST program utilizes a regular classroom; no lab material is needed.
space rental, lab costs)	Books at \$120 per student are included in tuition and fees, as is the
	certification exam fee of \$140 per student.
Retention and Completion	CST program partners with CCBC's SNAP for Success program to remove
Strategy	barriers.
Program Delivery Strategy	The CST program is delivered in-person only to include the instructors'
(physical sites, online)	wide experience. Classroom instructions include discussions and
	conversations to deliver the content.
	Additionally, the CST program has a large administrative component
	(clinical placement) which is greatly facilitated by in-person contact.
Partnerships with Credit	N/A
List Competitors – pricing,	Purdue University: online class; endorsed by the certifying organization
location, etc.	HSPA. \$285 without books, no placement for clinical training.
	Anne Arundel CC: \$2,436; includes two classroom classes and clinical
	placement.
	Frederick CC: \$1,612; three classroom classes; NO clinical placement.
	Carroll CC: \$1,474; two classroom classes; NO clinical placement.
	For comparison: CCBC: \$2,195; three classroom classes and clinical
	placement.

Identify Strengths,	Strength:		
Weaknesses,	<ul> <li>Program is in high demand.</li> </ul>		
Opportunities, and Threats.	<ul> <li>Program has excellent instructors who are subject matter experts in</li> </ul>		
Include needed resources	their field (SP managers, Surgical Technologists)		
(staff, technology, facilities)	<ul> <li>Program places students with most hospitals in Baltimore region.</li> </ul>		
	<ul> <li>Good relationships with the SP managers and clinical coordinators</li> </ul>		
	have been in place through consistent contact throughout the last		
	four years		
	<ul> <li>Limited predictable program costs: no lab supplies (books only)</li> </ul>		
	<ul> <li>Entriced, predictable program costs, no lab supplies (books only).</li> <li>Brogram can serve students who don't have a high school degree.</li> </ul>		
	Weaknesses:		
	<ul> <li>Program doesn't have subject matter expert at hand who could</li> </ul>		
	rewrite/modify curriculum.		
	<ul> <li>Program not a suitable candidate for online classes.</li> </ul>		
	• Program dependent on hospitals' willingness to accept students for		
	training.		
	• Open enrollment programs cannot grow since it is limited by the		
	number of students hospitals are willing to accept.		
	<ul> <li>Certifying org. (HSPA) doesn't require completion of college</li> </ul>		
	program.		
	• Target population is dependent on financial aid; therefore,		
	enrollment will very much depend on availability of financial aid.		
	• Completion rates are low (around 40%) due to students not being		
	able to commit to the time-consuming schedule of the practical		
	training.		
	<ul> <li>Maryland does not (yet) mandate the certification of the SP</li> </ul>		
	workforce.		
	• Clinical placement of students is labor intensive.		
	Opportunities:		
	<ul> <li>Hospitals signal interest in setting up system-wide training</li> </ul>		
	programs. The contract side of CST has room to grow.		
	CST is an apprenticeship program run by BACH with potential for		
	growth.		
	Inreats:		
	<ul> <li>variable willingness of SP departments and the frequent turnover in heapitals' SD leadership makes student alagement warst distall.</li> </ul>		
	In nospitals SP leadership makes student placement unpredictable.		
	<ul> <li>Hospitals nire uncertified trainees; once hired students will not sign up for clinical classes on more unchanging the students.</li> </ul>		
	up for clinical classes anymore, potentially resulting in a high		
Natas and Carry	number of non-completers.		
Notes and Comments to	Starting in FY2U25 the clinical portion (AHLU46-U49) of the program will		
provide further insight or	become optional. Students will receive a CCBC Continuing Education		
mormation	workforce Certificate after finishing the three classroom classes (Med.		
	Terminology, CPK, CST Theory). The CST Clinical I-IV Will be available if		
	the students choose to register.		

After receiving their CCBC Continuing Education Workforce Certificate,
students can find entry-level employment in Sterile Processing and/or sit
for the provisional CRCST certification exam administered by the HSPA.

Program Coordinator:	Silke Elsner
Program Director:	Denise Lindley
Program Assistant Dean:	Lynette Higgins
Dean:	Louise Slezak
Additional Staff:	Wendy Patten (administrative assistant for CST)

## The Community College of Baltimore County School of Continuing Education FY24 Program Review for: Certified Apartment Maintenance Technician (CAMT)

Continuing Education Workforce Development Certificate Program

## Contents

- 1. Program Information Sheet
- 2. Review Committee Narrative and Recommendations

#### Supplemental

- A. Curriculum Outlines (Syllabus) for Program Courses
- B. CC10s for Program Courses

**Program Name**: Certified Apartment Maintenance Technician (CAMT) **Program Review Period:** FY21-FY23

## Program Review Date: January 16, 2024

#### Program Review Committee Members:

Name	Title
Dean CE and Workforce Development	Louise Slezak
CE Assistant Dean Workforce and Literacy	Matt Bernardy
CE Assistant Dean Applied Technology and	Jay Bouis
Logistics	
CE Assistant Dean Health and Business Services	Lynette Higgins
CE Senior Director of Compliance & Outcomes	Don Elliott
CE Director of Instruction & Learning Outcomes	Jack Boeve
CE Director of Budget & Finance	Paul Blair
Industry or Faculty SME	On-hold until more programs in content area to
	review
LOAAB Member #1	Lynn Mason
LOAAB Member #2	Sara Young
CCBC Online Senior Instructional Designer	Eileen Hardin

Submitted by:	Title	Date
David Frey	Coordinator, Tech. Training	9/15/2023
Reviewed and approved by:	Title	Date
Jay Bouis	Assistant Dean	1/2/2024

# Program Information Sheet

Program Title	Certified Apartment Maintenance Technician (CAMT)
Program Description	Certified Apartment Maintenance Technicians are responsible for repairing
Describe the program,	and maintaining different parts of an apartment complex, including the
including a focus on	interior and exterior of the apartments and the grounds of the property.
student outcomes,	
and how the program	This program features training that will provide basic tool usage skills to
contributes to the	perform tasks associated with the work of an entry-level maintenance
public or private good.	technician. Basic plumbing, rough carpentry, introduction to HVAC concepts, and basic electrical skills are all covered throughout this course. Maintenance technicians can take further classes and specialize in fields such as electrical, plumbing, HVAC, and boiler operations. With experience, technicians can become lead technicians, supervisors, and building engineers. They may also transition into related fields such as equipment sales representatives, property managers, and leasing agents.
	Students entering this program should want to work with their hands and learn to perform multiple maintenance tasks. Students should also enjoy working with people such as apartment residents and have a strong sense of customer service.
	Employment can be found with property maintenance companies, apartment complexes, multi-family unit owners and other general maintenance providers.
<b>Credential(s) Offered</b> (include CE Workforce Development	CCBC Credential: Students will receive a Continuing Education Workforce Certificate and have access to a Continuing Education academic record (transcript).
credentials from any certifying organizations)	External Credential: Completers will receive a letter and provisional certificate from the National Apartment Association Education Institute (NAAEI) and will be eligible for a certificate from NAAEI upon completion of one year of field work. Students who pass the EPA 608 Type I test will receive certification from the EPA.
	Certifying Organization: National Apartment Association Education Institute (NAAEI) www.naahq.org - NAAEI's curriculum has been accredited by the American National Standards Institute (ANSI): www.ANSI.org United States Environmental Protection Agency, EPA: www.epa.gov
External	No specialized program accreditation.
Review/Accountability	
(Accreditation,	
advisory board, etc.)	
Program Hours	100 hrs.
	Course Series
	VOA 556 Certified Apartment Maintenance Technician with HVAC Certification
Program Format(s)	Classroom (95%)
	Remote Classroom (Zoom)

(classroom, online,	Blended
blended)	Online Institutional
	Online Vendor (5%)
	Other
Application Process	Open X
and Results	Provisional
	Selective
Program Outcomes	1. prepare to pass the EPA 608 (refrigerant) CORE/Type I exam and the
	National Apartment Association CAMT exam;
	2. perform basic carpentry, plumbing, electrical, appliance, and HVAC
	maintenance tasks associated with apartments, multifamily housing, and
	similar facilities: and
	3. demonstrate effective skills to work as an entry-level apartment
	maintenance technician.
Summary of	Continuing Education Workforce Certificate
Outcomes	Provisional CAMT designation from the NAAFI
Achievement	FPA 608 CORE/Type L certification
loutcomes	
assessment.	
completions.	
certifications.	
licenses)	
O*Net Code	49-9071.00
CIP Code:	46.0401
Career	According to the U.S. Department of Labor, overall employment of
Forecast/Analysis	maintenance and repair workers, general is projected to grow 11% from 2020
	to 2030 in Maryland. Projected annual job openings in Maryland are 2.540.
	Median wages in Maryland are \$47,150.
	O*Net suggests a "Bright Outlook" as the field is expected to grow rapidly in
	the next several years, will have large numbers of job openings, or are new
	and emerging occupations.
Curriculum Summary:	The Certified Apartment Maintenance Technician (CAMT) program consists of
(Highlights, attach	one program course.
Acalog page as	Course Series
addendum A	Certified Apartment Maintenance Technician with HVAC Certification
curriculum map may	
be required.)	
Alignment to CCBC	Enrollment Growth:
Strategic Directions	<ul> <li>Hands-on laboratory-based learning.</li> </ul>
Ū	<ul> <li>High need, growth industry with many entry level openings.</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>Accommodating schedule – day, and evening</li> </ul>
	Affordable pricing and financial aid opportunities
	Fronomic Prosperity:
	Strengthens collaboration with employers
	Transformational Academics:
	Worknlace credential

Alignment of	This course is associa	ted with the Technology and Eng	ineering Pathway.		
Program with CCBC	Maintenance technicians wishing to advance in the property maintenance				
Pathways and Credit	industry might consider a credit or CE project management certificate or				
Programs:	construction management certificate. Additionally, successful CAMT program				
	completers may choo	completers may choose to focus on residential or commercial HVAC.			
Summary of Changes	No major changes to	curriculum during the review per	riod.		
to Curriculum During	The curriculum is pro	ovided by The National Apartmen	t Association. Additional		
Review Period:	study materials are p	rovided by Mainstream Engineer	ing (EPA certification).		
Performance Indicators	5				
Program Enrollment		Duplicated	Unduplicated		
Last Year (FY23)		N/A	32		
Two Years Prior (FY22)		N/A	30		
Three Years Prior (FY21	.)	N/A	48		
Program Revenue		Budgeted	Actual		
Last Year (FY23)		\$40,000	\$56,169		
Two Years Prior (FY22)		\$46,000	\$45,168		
Three Years Prior (FY21)		\$32,000	\$60,067		
Sections Offered		Ran	Cancelled		
Last Year (FY23)		8 (80%)	2 (20%)		
Two Years Prior (FY22)		7 (70%)	3 (30%)		
Three Years Prior (FY21)		10 (67%)	5 (33%)		
Open Enrollment Versus Contract Training		Open Enrollment	Contract		
Last Year (FY23)		5 (25 Enrollment)	3 (7 Enrollment)		
Two Years Prior (FY22)		3 (18 Enrollment)	4 (12 Enrollment)		
Three Years Prior (FY21	.)	5 (22 Enrollment)	5 (26 Enrollment)		
FTE		Open Enrollment	Contract		
Last Year (FY23)		5.09	1.42		
Two Years Prior (FY22)		4.34	2.44		
Three Years Prior (FY21)		4.95	6.38		
Program Completers		Open Enrollment	Contract		
Last Year (FY23)		30			
Two Years Prior (FY22)		27			
Three Years Prior (FY21	.)	44			

Prior Learning Assessment				
Tot. prog. hrs. avail. for prior learning		N/A		
waiver				
Nbr. Of hrs. waived. (Data not yet available.)		N/A		
NOTES		Relocated program to Dundalk from Randallstown in		
		FY22.		
Updated (If Needed) Program Outcomes		N/A		
3-Year Projected	Projected Enro	llment	Projected FTE	Projected Revenue
Enrollment, FTE, Revenue				
FY24	32		6.82	\$54,368
FY25	35		7.4	\$59,465
FY26	35		7.4	\$59,465

Promotion Strategy and	Program is advertised on the CCBC website and in the Continuing
Costs	Education catalog (Flexi). Occasional CCBC social media packages.
	Additionally, CCBC remains one of the few providers of the CAMT
	program, and we are listed on the National Apartment Association (NAA)
	website as an affiliate.
Delivery Costs (supplies,	Course typically runs between 80hrs-100hrs. Min. of four students
space rental, lab costs)	required for course. Due to space restrictions, the max. number of
	students is capped at seven. Class typically runs with four to five
	students per section.
	Five students at \$1699 = \$8,495
	Typical Expenses: \$4,925. / Typical Revenue: \$3,570.
	Instructor @ \$35hr x 80hrs: \$2,800. / Text @ \$275 per student – 5
	students per class: \$1375. / Materials @ \$150 per student x 5 students:
	\$750
Retention and Completion	Coordinator meets with CAMT students' multiple times throughout
Strategy	course. Students are offered test-taking strategies, employment leads,
	and encouraged to contact the coordinator if any issue arises. CAMT
	students from internal customers (e.g., LEAP) are assigned a student
	case worker and job developer.
Program Delivery Strategy	Program delivered on-site in classroom/laboratory environment.
(physical sites, online)	Specialized equipment/training aids were developed for the program.
	Students are offered hands-on training and exam prep classwork with
	curriculum provided by NAA.
Partnerships with Credit	Participation in SOBTL advisory board.
List Competitors – pricing,	Maryland Multi-Housing Association (MMHA): Est. \$1,450 Member
location, etc.	\$1,650 Future Member. MMHA typically offers 3 CAMT classes annually
	at Owings Mills facility (classroom) but MMHA training does not include
	lab components.
	The NAA has been experiencing technical issues with their website for
	several years. We believe this is why other workforce development
	organizations and community colleges have stopped offering this
	program.
Identify Strengths,	STRENGTHS- Ease of finding entry-level employment within the multi-
weaknesses, Opportunities,	family maintenance sector for program completers. The Baltimore
and Inreats. Include	County/City region is saturated with multi-family units that require
needed resources (staff,	maintenance statt.
technology, facilities)	WEAKNESS- The CAWT program suffers from consistent instructor
	turnover, NAA technical issues, and limited classroom size.
	OPPORTONITIES- Add additional HVAC training. Inroughout multi-lamily
	maintenance sector, desire for maintenance technician to be upskilled in
	THREATS. There is no direct threat to a program running at its surrent
	conscitu
	ι ταματιτή.

Program Coordinator:	David Frey
Program Director:	
Program Assistant Dean:	Jay Bouis
-------------------------	-------------------------
Dean:	Louise Slezak
Additional Staff:	Margie Ann Bonnett, ASA

# The Community College of Baltimore County School of Continuing Education Program Review for:

Center for Adult and Family Literacy ESOL Program

## Contents

- 1. Program Information Sheet
- 2. Review Committee Narrative and Recommendations

## Supplemental

- A. Curriculum Outlines (Syllabus) for Program Courses see Student Welcome Packet
- B. CC10s for Program Courses

**Program Name**: English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL), Continuing Education (CE) **Program Review Period:** FY21, FY22, FY23

# Program Review Date: January 16, 2024

Name	Title	
Dean CE and Workforce Development	Louise Slezak	
CE Assistant Dean Workforce and Literacy	Matt Bernardy	
CE Assistant Dean Applied Technology and	Jay Bouis	
Logistics		
CE Assistant Dean Health and Business Services	Lynette Higgins	
CE Senior Director of Compliance & Outcomes	Don Elliott	
CE Director of Instruction & Learning Outcomes	Jack Boeve	
CE Director of Budget & Finance	Paul Blair	
Industry or Faculty SME	On-hold until more programs in content area to	
	review	
LOAAB Member #1	Lynn Mason	
LOAAB Member #2	Sara Young	
CCBC Online Senior Instructional Designer	Eileen Hardin	

Submitted by:	Title	Date
Kimberly Sansone	Director, Literacy Programs	12/8/23
Reviewed and approved by:	Title	Date
Matthew Bernardy	Assistant Dean	

Program Title	English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL), Continuing Education
	(CE)
Program Description	CCBC's Center for Adult and Family Literacy ESOL is a Title II WIOA
Describe the program,	(Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act) grant-funded program in
including a focus on	partnership with Maryland Department of Labor (MD Labor). ESOL offers
student outcomes, and	courses with instruction in six English language skill areas (listening,
how the program	speaking, reading, writing, pronunciation, grammar) and numeracy to
contributes to the public or	non-English proficient or limited English proficient adults. Class content
private good.	helps students learn English for community and workplace settings; skills
	needed to succeed in work, school, and everyday life. By achieving a
	certain education level on the given standardized test, CASAS
	(Comprehensive Adult Student Assessment Systems), students may 'test
	out' of programming, but do not earn any credentials or certificates upon
	course completion. Upon completion, students will have basic fluency of
	speech and can understand and communicate in a variety of contexts
	related to daily life and work. They should be able to read moderately
	complex text related to life roles as well as descriptions and narratives
	from materials with familiar subject matter. An Individual can also write
	multi-paragraph text (e.g., organizes and develops ideas with clear
	introduction, body, and conclusion), using some complex grammar and a
	variety of sentence structures using a range of vocabulary. Students who
	operate at this level (test out) are given resources for employment and
	continuing their education in workforce and/or academic programs at the
	post-secondary level.
	In a typical year, on average, about 1,300 students from nearly 80
	different countries enroll to learn English in this CE program. Students have many personal goals and reasons for enrolling in ESOL to learn
	English: to function in life's everyday activities, to become a more
	engaged member of their community, for an employment necessity, or
	to continue their education, to name a few. ESOL aims to meet students
	where they are in terms of culture, background knowledge, and
	language skills. Instruction is offered at all educational functioning levels,
	ESL (English as Second Language) Beginning Literacy through ESL
	Advanced.
	Research emphasizes the importance of initial contact with students, so
	much consideration is given to the intake and assessment process. The
	program uses a managed enrollment strategy where interested students
	must attend a scheduled intake session with ESOL staff prior to
	enrollment. Students do not need to set an appointment to attend;
	sessions are walk-in, first-come, first served. These sessions take place
	throughout the year to allow for multiple entry points. This process
	includes assessments carefully chosen to accurately place learners into
	appropriate levels, and personal advising for each student. The ESOL
	team meets the unique needs of students by including multilingual ESOL
	faculty at all intake sessions. In addition to utilizing CASAS Reading tests,

	ESOL uses additional means to assess listening, speaking, and writing skills to guide placement. The Coordinator of Student Support Services privately assesses students needing disability support services. All programs and services are designed to be accessible to international populations and community members throughout Baltimore County, with programming offered at the three main CCBC campuses (Catonsville, Dundalk, and Essex), and the Extension Center at Owings Mills. Classes are scheduled morning, afternoon, and evening at varying levels of intensity, in three terms (fall, spring, and summer) per year. Class size
	There is no cost for these grants funded classes; however, students may be required to purchase a book/workbook package which is typically around \$35.00-\$50.00.
<b>Credential(s) Offered</b> (include CE Workforce Development Certificate, and credentials from any certifying organizations)	Students will have access to a Continuing Education academic record (transcript). Students may earn an 'Award of Recognition' for 80% attendance and a <i>completion based on competency</i> (CC) grade for each class.
External Review/Accountability (Accreditation, advisory board, etc.)	As the grant funder, MD Labor provides oversight and structured program guidelines for student eligibility, testing, documentation, budgeting, curriculum standards, personnel requirements, professional development, and reporting, among other items.
	Evidence-based theories and standards form the basis of ESOL's programming. Course content is aligned with foundational educational theories, such as the Adult Learning Theory of Malcolm Knowles, and state-adopted standards including the Maryland Content Standards for Adult ESL/ESOL, the College and Career Readiness Standards for Adult Education, the Maryland Digital Literacy Framework for Adult Learners, English Language Proficiency Standards for Adult Education, CASAS Standards and Competencies, Professional Standards for Teachers in Adult Education, and the National Reporting System (NRS) level descriptors.
Program Hours	ESOL is not a linear program. Students enter the program at different education levels and may repeat classes. Therefore, students take different lengths of time to complete the program. However, for those that complete, on average a student will take three ESOL classes before program completion.
	Classes are 60 hours each. There are six levels of classes: Intro, Level 1, Level 2, Level 3, Level 4, Level 5 • Standard: 10 weeks; 2 classes per week (3 hours per class) • Intensive: 5 weeks; 4 classes per week (3 hours per class) Level 4 and 5 students have the option of enrolling in two additional

	courses: Expanded Reading and Writing Skills, and Transition Reading				
	<ul> <li>Saturday morning only: 15 weeks (4 hours per class)</li> </ul>				
	Saturday morning only: 15 weeks (4 hours per class)				
Program Format(s)	Classroom 80%				
(classroom, online,	Remote Classroom (Zoom) 20%				
blended)	Blended 0%				
	Online Institutional 0%				
	Online Vendor 0%				
	Other 0%				
Application Process and	Open				
Results	Provisional X				
	1. Minimum 18 years of age.				
	2. Not enrolled in secondary school under MD State law.				
	3. Students with an F-1 or J-1 visa are <b>not</b> eligible for grant funded				
	classes.				
	4. Citizenship status documentation is <b>not</b> required.				
	5. All prospective students are required to attend a registration				
	session facilitated by CE ESOL staff. New students must be				
	assessed to determine their skill levels in reading, writing,				
	listening, and speaking.				
Program Outcomes	ESOL outcome goals are set annually by our state funding partner, MD Labor, Goals include academic level completion rates (which change				
	every year) as well as assessment post-test match rates (which remains				
	constant at 70%). See included PDF. <i>CAFL FSOL Goals FY21-FY23</i> for				
	goals and outcomes.				
	For CE ESOL, 'completion' is achieved when a student makes a gain into a				
	higher NRS functioning level on their CASAS post-assessment. Guidelines				
	state that students can be post-tested after a minimum of 40 instruction				
	hours. See included PDF, NRS.CASAS Level Descriptors, for NRS Levels				
	with CASAS scale scores and level descriptions used to determine class				
	placement, gains, and completion.				
	Course Objectives and Outcomes – Grant Funded Courses				
	Level Intro – Life Skills: Very low beginning students will learn basic				
	English for life and work.				
	Level I - Life Skills: Low beginning students will learn simple English for life				
	and work.				
	Level 2 - Life Skills: High beginning students will improve their simple				
	English skills for life and work.				
	Level 3 - Language/EL Civics: Low intermediate students will develop				
	English language skills and be introduced to civics concepts.				
	Level 4 - Language/EL Civics: Intermediate students will continue to				
	develop English language skills and build on civics concepts.				
	Level 5- Language/EL Civics: High intermediate students will continue to				
	develop English language skills and extend civics concepts to civic				

	engagement.			
	Expanded Reading and Writing Skills: Upper-intermediate students will			
	move beyond life skills reading and writing.			
	Transition Reading and Writing: Upper-intermediate will learn strategies			
	to approach academic reading and writing tasks to better prepare for			
	transition.			
Summary of Outcomes	CE ESOL did exceptionally well, meeting and exceeding nearly all MD Labor			
Achievement	goals ('targets') for the last three fiscal years. To ensure ESOL meets			
(outcomes assessment,	program goals, a continued emphasis on community building was			
completions,	encouraged and engaging instruction was implemented. CASAS test prep			
certifications, licenses)	was incorporated into instruction and in person pre- and post-testing was			
	administered. MD Labor pre/post-test match target goal is 70%, and the			
	CCBC ESOL program achieved an 81%-82% pre/post-test match rate in			
	FY21, FY22, and FY23. All ESOL pre/post-testing is done in person,			
	regardless of the class format, whether in-person or online. Post-testing			
	takes place during the last class session.			
	The included PDF, CAFL ESOL Goals FY21-FY23, shows that the program			
	successfully met or exceeded overall goals for the last two fiscal years.			
	The program's actual completion rate for FY21 was one percentage point			
	lower than the target. The charts contain MD Labor target goals			
	compared to <i>actual</i> numbers CE ESOL met.			
O*Net Code	N/A			
CIP Code	N/A			
Career Forecast/Analysis	N/A			
Curriculum Summary:	Text used is <i>Future</i> series. Scope and Sequence/Curriculum maps for the six			
, (Highlights, attach	levels of <i>Future</i> and the Reading/Writing classes are attached.			
Acalog page as				
addendum A				
curriculum map may be				
required.)				
Alignment to CCBC	Credit and Continuing Education Integration			
Strategic Directions	• There is ongoing discussion and sharing between both programs			
	regarding curricular choices, rationale, and a more seamless transition			
	from CE to Credit programming. The two departments meet quarterly to			
	discuss program updates, and student transitions and referrals. In Spring			
	2024, they will pilot an effort to better understand the education levels			
	of students who 'test out' of CE ESOL in relation to the placement			
	requirements for Credit ESOL. This will be done by administering the			
	Credit placement tool to CE ESOL student volunteers. Staff will use the			
	information to target CE referrals to Credit programming and identify			
	potential curriculum gaps and/or overlapping points between the two			
	departments.			
	Transformational Academics/Economic Prosperity			
	• ESOL program curriculum supports an equity agenda. In particular, it			
	engenders respect among the multilingual, multi-cultural, and multi-			
	ethnic students the program supports. Further, since employment is a			

	goal of the grant-funders, the curriculum is strongly infused with					
	language relate	d to the workplace and assists students with the language				
	and culturally related soft skills that help them become more employable					
	in this country.					
	The Student Experience/Enrollment Growth					
	• Word of mouth is a primary "publicity" channel for the ESOL program.					
	Students continually express satisfaction with the curriculum since it					
	supports their practical language learning needs and goals. This					
	satisfaction is o	satisfaction is objectively evidenced in the student evaluation responses,				
	the high retention rates in classes which are free/funded, etc. Satisfied					
Alignment of Ducquer	students are th	e best advertisement for the pi	rogram.			
Alignment of Program	The ESOL curriculur	n supports the students needs	and is aligned with the			
with CCBC Pathways	grant-lunders requi	rements and goals for the class	es the funding supports.			
and Credit Programs	The curriculum prov	Ades contextualized English lan	guage acquisition for file,			
	future transition to	the Academic ESOL program or	call support a student for			
	them in obtaining a	high school diploma. The reach	programming to assist			
	supports student tr	ansition into workforce/pathwa	av programs that do not			
	require above an 8t	h grade level of common/socia	l English language			
	proficiency. The exception for workforce/nathway programs is when a student					
	has prior knowledge of the program's content due to prior education or work					
	experience. Prior knowledge and experience can make otherwise inaccessible					
	programs much more accessible to limited English language speakers. There					
	is not yet a direct tr	ansition from this ESOL program	n to the credit Academic			
	ESOL program; how	ever, ESOL program staff from I	both Credit and CE meet			
	regularly to discuss	how to make a more seamless	transition and, as			
	mentioned earlier, v	vill take a fresh look at placeme	ent tools to further identify			
	ways to support students.					
Summary of Changes to	In Fall of 2021, the 2 <sup>nd</sup> edition of the six-level <i>Future</i> series (Intro, 1, 2,					
Curriculum During	3, 4, Advanced) was adopted. This original edition of this series has been					
Review Period	the central curricular support since 2010 and the 2 <sup>nd</sup> edition, with its					
	updated content and inclusion of digital literacy, will continue to do so.					
Performance Indicators						
Program Enrollment		Duplicated	Unduplicated			
Last Year (FY23)		2,013	1,313			
Two Years Prior (FY22)		1,510	979			
Ihree Years Prior (FY21)		1,094	634			
Program Revenue		Budgeted	Actual			
Last fear (FY23)			N/A			
Two Years Prior (FY22)			N/A			
Sections Offered		IN/A Bon	N/A Concelled			
Jact Voor (FV22)						
Last iedi (FYZS)		160 (70%)	/4 (23.0%) 115 (10.6%)			
		127 (50 59.3)	124 (40.0%)			
Open Eprollmont Versus	Contract Training	137 (JU.J%)				
	Contract training	Open Enrollment				
Last iedi (FIZS)			100%			

Two Years Prior (FY22	<u>2)</u>					100%
Three Years Prior (FY21)				100%		
FTE		Open Enrollment		Contract		
Last Year (FY23)						322
Two Years Prior (FY22	2)					242
Three Years Prior (FY	21)					175
Program Completers			Open En	rollment		Contract
Last Year (FY23)			-			1,152 (44%)
Two Years Prior (FY22	2)					877 (48%)
Three Years Prior (FY	21)					544 (42%)
Prior Learning Assess	ment					
Total program hours	available for prior learning	Ţ	N/A			
waiver.		,	,			
Number of hours wa	ived.		N/A			
Updated (If	Established by program	funder	· · ·			
needed)	71 0					
Program Outcomes						
3-Year Projected	Proiected Enroll	ment		Projected F	TE	Projected Revenue
Enrollment, FTE,				,		
and Revenue						
FY24	2.300			370		N/A
FY25	2,500			400		N/A
FY26	2,300			434		N/A
Promotion	ESOL staff works with CCBC Marketing and Communications to produce		to produce program			
Strategy and	flyers for distribution and social media posts. ESOL registration information is					
Costs	included in the CE course catalog (known as the Elevi) distributed to Baltimore					
00010.	County residents three times a year for Winter/Spring Summer and Fall					
	semesters. CE ESOL is the premier literacy provider in Baltimore County and all					
	core County WIOA partners, make direct referrals for participants who have					
	basic literacy needs				purcier	
	There is no cost for these strategies					
Delivery Costs						
(supplies, space						
rental. lab costs)						
Retention and	Team communication is paramount for student retention. There is solid					
Completion	communication between ESOL program staff, instructors, transition specialists					
Strategy:	and site coordinators regarding program logistics, student needs uncoming					
	events, etc. There is an emphasis on community building and providing engaging					
	instruction in the classroom which motivates students to stay connected. In terms					
	of completion (making a gain into a higher NRS functioning level on their CASAS					
	post-assessment). CASAS test prep is incorporated into instruction, and both in-					
	person and computerized pre- and post-testing is administered to increase					
	student engagement.					
Program	ESOL offers in-person cla	isses fo	or all leve	els and online cl	asses f	for class levels 2-5,
Delivery	with the last day of class being in-person for CASAS post-testing. Flexibility in					
Strategy	programing, instructor support, student communication, and technology					
(physical sites,	support were key elements in our success. In FY22, 68.75% of courses were in-					

online):	person and 31.25% of courses were online.			
Partnerships with	Regular meetings focus on the student populations CE and Credit generally serve,			
Credit:	the goals of each program, how they align and differ, and where crossover can			
	happen. In Spring 2024, they will pilot an effort to better understand the			
	education levels of students who 'test out' of CE ESOL in relation to the			
	placement requirements for Credit ESOL. This will be done by administering the			
	Credit placement tool to CE ESOL student volunteers. Staff will use the			
	information to target CE referrals to Credit programming and identify potential			
	curriculum gaps and/or overlapping points between the two departments.			
List Competitors –	There are no other providers in Baltimore County offering ESOL classes for work			
pricing,	and life skills. In downtown Baltimore City, Baltimore City Community College			
location, etc.	(BCCC) and Esperanza Center offer this type of ESOL programming.			
Identify	Strengths:			
Strengths,	<ul> <li>ESOL strengthens the local community and workforce. There is a direct</li> </ul>			
Weaknesses,	correlation between higher English proficiency. full-time employment.			
Opportunities,	and higher wages.			
and Threats.	<ul> <li>Ability to meet and exceed goals set by funding partner</li> </ul>			
Include needed	<ul> <li>Staff and Instructors for ESOL have appropriate background in TESOL</li> </ul>			
resources (staff,	(Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages) many with an MA			
technology,	in TESOL and Adult Education			
facilities)	Strong instructor rotantian rate 77% of ESOL instructors have been			
	<ul> <li>Scioling instructor recention rate. 77% of ESOL instructors have been togshing with CAEL for five years or more, with 40% of all instructors</li> </ul>			
	having taught with CAFL for tan years or more			
	Taking taught with CAFLIOI tell years of more.			
	Iechnology integration included Zoom platform use on laptop or desktop			
	computers for students in online classes. Both online and face-to-face			
	classes had a marked increase in the use of hand-heid devices after			
	Instructors viewed Using Smartphones to Enhance Classroom Activities (MD			
	Labor Virtual fraining institute December 2019 archive) as a part of the			
	prior year's Digital Literacy Training. Instructors continued to plan/deliver			
	needs-based digital literacy activities as a routine part of instruction.			
	• Average class sizes have increased in the last three fiscal years (8 in FY21; 9			
	in FY22, 11 in FY23).			
	Chamenges/opportunities:			
	<ul> <li>Sniπing student demographics and language levels makes class scheduling</li> <li>(sin levels) method of delivery devices and language levels makes class scheduling</li> </ul>			
	(six ievels) method of delivery, dates, times, and campus locations a			
	challenge.			
	Unpredictable high volumes of students during the walk-in intake are taxing			
	on staff; registration may last 3 or 4 hours, and students may have to be put			
	on a wait list (it classes are full) or turned away if it is too late in the			
	evening.			
	<ul> <li>It is possible to split up daytime/evening registration on different days,</li> </ul>			
	staff may look into this.			
	• ESOL students not being able to find their way on a CCBC campus. Many			
	can't read a map or signs, or ask questions to find a particular location, due			
	to limited English skills. It is draining on CCBC staff when students walk into			

	any building trying to find the ESOL registration session and/or class		
	<ul> <li>Having a consistent CE ESOL location or a 'hub' at each campus would be beneficial for everyone.</li> </ul>		
	Better internal communication to know when and where the ESOL		
	registration events/class starts take place		
	<ul> <li>All planning must be done a year in advance: registration dates, times, room availability and location, team member availability due to long hours and number of registrations.</li> </ul>		
	<ul> <li>Average class size may decrease as funding increases. Each ESOL level has an optimal class size for learning, per the grant funding partner MD Labor. Running fewer classes due to budget constraints means exceeding those optimal levels. With the ability to run more classes, staff can adhere to the optimal class sizes, listed:         <ul> <li>ESL Level 1; 8 learners maximum</li> <li>ESL Levels 2-3; 10 learners maximum</li> <li>ESL Levels 4-5; 12 learners maximum</li> <li>ESL Level 6; 15 learners maximum</li> </ul> </li> <li>Hiring instructors last minute (if class is added or contracted instructor cannot teach) is challenging due to length of time it takes to process hire</li> </ul>		
	paperwork.		
Program Coordinator:	Marcia Merriman		
Program Director:	Kimberly Sansone		
Program Assistant Dea	an: Matthew Bernardy		
Dean: Louise Slezak			
Additional Staff:	Ever Autumn, Coordinator of Intake and Assessment		
	Jeny Jones, PT Coordinator Intake and Assessment		
	Noemi Molnar, Management Information Specialist		
	Suzanne Monti, Coordinator of Instructional Support		
	Lonnie Mullins, Administrative Support Assistant II		
	Dominic Notaro, Fiscal Support Specialist		
	Judy Walsh, Student Support Coordinator		
	Judy White, Administrative Support Assistant II		

# The Community College of Baltimore County School of Continuing Education FY24 Program Review for: Entry Level Bookkeeper

## Continuing Education Workforce Development Certificate Program

#### Contents

1. Program Information Sheet

2. Review Committee Narrative and Recommendations

### Supplemental

A. Curriculum Outlines (Syllabus) for Program Courses

B. CC10s for Program Courses

Program Name: Bookkeeper- Entry Level Program Review Period: FY21, FY22, FY23

# Program Review Date: February 8, 2024

Name	Title	
Dean CE and Workforce Development	Louise Slezak	
CE Assistant Dean Workforce and Literacy	Matt Bernardy	
CE Assistant Dean Applied Technology and	Jay Bouis	
Logistics		
CE Assistant Dean Health and Business Services	Lynette Higgins	
CE Senior Director of Compliance & Outcomes	Don Elliott	
CE Director of Instruction & Learning Outcomes	Jack Boeve	
CE Director of Budget & Finance	Paul Blair	
Industry or Faculty SME	On-hold until more programs in content area to	
	review	
LOAAB Member #1	Lynn Mason	
LOAAB Member #2	Sara Young	
CCBC Online Senior Instructional Designer	Eileen Hardin	

Submitted by:	Title	Date
Julie Woo	Coordinator	01/04/2024
Reviewed and approved by:	Title	Date
Moire Riley	Director	01/04/2024

Program Title:	Bookkeeper - Entry Level
Program Description:	Bookkeepers play a crucial role in maintaining accurate financial records by
Describe the program,	computing, classifying, and recording numerical data. They undertake
including a focus on	various routine tasks, including calculations, postings, and verification, to
student outcomes, and	ensure the completeness and accuracy of financial records. This program is
how the program	designed to equip students with essential entry-level skills required for a
contributes to the	career as a bookkeeper.
public or private good.	
	The curriculum covers fundamental accounting concepts and relevant
	terminology within the context of bookkeeping. Additionally, students
	Preceive training in essential software tools like Microsoft Excel and
	QuickBooks, enhancing their proficiency in bookkeeping tasks.
	Students entering this program should have a strong sense of self-discipline,
	basic math and computer skills, and be detail oriented.
	Bookkeeping jobs are at several profit and non-profit organizations.
	Additional career information may be found in Career Coach:
	https://ccbcmd.ems
Credential(s) Offered:	Students will be awarded a Continuing Education Workforce Certificate and
(include CE Workforce	will have access to a Continuing Education academic record (transcript).
Development	Please note that this is an entry-level certificate and should not be confused
Certificate, and	with the Certified Bookkeeper status offered by the American Institute of
credentials from any	Professional Bookkeepers (AIPB).
certifying	
organizations)	
External	N/A
Review/Accountability:	
(Accreditation, advisory	
board, etc.)	
Program Hours:	Total 52.25 Hours
	PCA 832 Excel for Bookkeepers, 12 Hours
	ACC006 Accounting/Bookkeeping I, 15.75 Hours
	ACC007 Accounting/Bookkeeping II, 12.50 Hours
	PCA836 QuickBooks for Bookkeepers, 15 Hours
Program Format(s)	Classroom 20%
(classroom, online,	Remote Classroom (Zoom) 40%
blended)	Blended
	Online Institutional 40%
	Online Vendor
	Other
Application Process and	Open X
Results	Provisional
	Selective
Program Outcomes	1. Apply the knowledge and skills to function effectively as an entry-level
	bookkeeper;

	2. Define and apply basic accounting principles;
	3. Analyze business transactions and apply the mechanics of double-entry
	bookkeeping;
	4. Identify and create a basic set of financial statements: income statement,
	statement of owner's equity, balance sheet and statement of cash flows;
	5. Use essential software tools proficiently, including Microsoft Excel and
	QuickBooks;
	6. Prepare to gain employment as a bookkeeper; and
	7. Assume responsibility for continued professional and personal
	development through continuing education.
Summary of Outcomes	Continuing Education Workforce Certificate
Achievement	
(outcomes assessment.	
completions.	
certifications. licenses)	
O*Net Code:	43-3031.00
Career	According to the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics, the employment of
Forecast/Analysis	bookkeeping, accounting, and auditing clerks is projected to decline by 6
	percent from 2022 to 2032. * In the Baltimore-Columbia-Towson MD area
	this field is not as prominent with 12 917 employees whereas the national
	average for an area of this size is 15 527 employees. **
	Despite this downward trend, it is crucial to recognize the vital role that
	hookkeepers play in maintaining accurate financial records and transactions
	across various sectors. The demand for their services remains consistently
	high Bookkeeping accounting and auditing clorks continue to be among
	the top 25 posted occupations in the Baltimore Columbia Towcop region
	* https://www.bls.gov/ooh/office-and-administrative-support/bookkeeping
	accounting-and-auditing-clerks htm
	** Occupation Overview by Lightcast / *** Job Posting Analytics by Lightcast
Curriculum Summany	This Program features courses that will provide the entry lovel dills peeded
See Addendum A and B	to start out as a bookkeeper. Accounting concents and terminology in the
Highlights attach	context of hookkeeping are introduced, as well as training on evenenting
	context of bookkeeping are introduced, as well as training on supporting
addendum	DCA222 Event for Bookkonners. In this class, students learn key introductory
	Even skills Introductory topics include identifying parts of the Office was
curriculum may be	interfaces entering editing and formatting entries extention - "
required.)	interrace, entering, eutling, and iormatting entries; selecting cells and
	ranges, creating and mounying basic formulas; inserting charts and tables;
	Creating a template; and sorting and filtering data.
	Accourd Accounting/ Bookkeeping I: In this class, students will learn the basic
	principles of the double entry system, the accounting equation, apply the
	accounting equation to transactions, prepare adjusting journal entries,
	compute depreciation and prepare an adjusted and unadjusted trial balance.
	students will also begin to identify the four basic financial statements.
	ACCUU/ Accounting/Bookkeeping II: In this class, students will continue to
	learn the basic principles of the double entry system of accounting,
	preparation of a bank reconciliation, adjusting entries, closing entries, post-

	closing trial balance, accounts receivable, payroll, special journals, statement		
	of cash flows, and financial statement ratio analysis.		
	PCA836 QuickBooks for Bookkeepers: In this class, students will learn about		
	QuickBooks Online web-based and cloud-based accounting software.		
	Students will learn how it may assist them to organize and monitor all areas		
	of the company's business finances.		
	Refer to Addendur	m A and B for details.	
Alignment to CCBC	Transformatio	nal Academics: We try to reduce	the barriers that interfere
Strategic Directions	with student s	uccess and make education more	e accessible by offering
	multiple moda	lities for learners: online, remote	e, and in-person. We work
	to increase pro	ogram retention by communicati	ng proactively with
	students abou	t their progress toward program	completion.
	Economic Pros	sperity: This career-focused prog	ram and curriculum
	prepares stude	ents for employment in 6 months	5.
	Credit and Cor	ntinuing Education Integration: W	/e work closely with
	credit; the pro	gram was revised in 2019 with th	ne help of a credit
	accounting pro	ofessor, and we provide opportu	nities for credit instructors
	to teach in the	e program. A crosswalk with credi	t has been mapped out.
Alignment of Program	Aligns with the Bus	siness pathway. Crosswalk of Ent	ry Level Bookkeeper
with CCBC Pathways	courses has been r	mapped out.	
and Credit Programs:	Refer to Addendum C and D for details.		
Summary of Changes	N/A		
to Curriculum During			
Review Period:			
Performance Indicators			
Program Enrollment	nt Duplicated Unduplicated		
Last Year (FY23)	166 82		82
Two Years Prior (FY22)	22) 212 87		87
Three Years Prior (FY21)	r (FY21) 154 62		62
Program Revenue	venue Budgeted Actual		Actual
Last Year (FY23)	\$21,227 \$31,494		\$31,494
Two Years Prior (FY22)		\$41,301	\$40,068
Three Years Prior (FY21)         \$9,232         \$29,30		\$29,306	
Sections Offered Ran Cancelled		Cancelled	
Last Year (FY23) 17 (70%) 8 (30%)			8 (30%)
Two Years Prior (FY 22)         20 (90%)         2(10%)		2(10%)	
Three Years Prior (FY21)         18 (64%)         10(36%)		10(36%)	
Open Enrollment Versus Contract Training		Open Enrollment	Contract
Last Year (FY23)		17	-
Two Years Prior (FY 22)		20	-
Three Years Prior (FY21)		18	-
FTE		Open Enrollment	Contract
Last Year (FY23)		6.2	-
Two Years Prior (FY 22)		7.8	-
Three Years Prior (FY21)		5.8	-
Program Completers		Open Enrollment	Contract
Last Year (FY23)		16 *(28 as of July 2023)	-

Two Years Prior (FY22)	37	-
Three Years Prior (FY21)	20	-

Prior Learning Assessment	
Total program hours available for prior learning	41
waiver	
Number of hours actually waived	Not yet available
Updated (If Needed) Program Outcomes	

3-Year Projected	Projected Enrollment	Projected FTE	Projected Revenue
Enrollment, FTE, Revenue			
FY24	140	5.16	\$26,460
FY25	144	5.30	\$29,376*
			*Pricing increase
FY26	148	5.45	\$30,192

Promotion Strategy and	We leverage CCBC resources, such as Flexi, SNS posting and Email Blast,	
Costs.		
Delivery Costs (supplies,	The course's primary direct cost is the instructor's pay, estimated at	
space rental, lab costs)	about \$3,000 per program.	
Retention and Completion	We work to increase program retention by communicating proactively	
Strategy	with students about their progress toward program completion by	
	sending reminder emails.	
Program Delivery Strategy	We try to reduce the barriers that interfere with student success and	
(physical sites, online):	make education more accessible by offering multiple modalities for	
	learners: online, remote, and in-person (Essex and Owings Mills).	
Partnerships with Credit:	The credit instructor has updated the curriculum, in 2019, for an online	
	asynchronous class and has been teaching this curriculum.	
List Competitors – pricing,	CCBC is the only local college providing a range of Continuing Education	
location, etc.	bookkeeping classes, offering flexibility with options for both on-campus	
	and online instruction. The comprehensive program costs approximately	
	\$800, with an additional about \$200 for the required textbook.	
	In contrast, several other community colleges, including Anne Arundel	
	Community College Montgomery College Howard Community College	
	and Carroll Community College, provide an asynchronous Ed2Go	
	Brofessional Bookkeeping with QuickBooks Course at prices ranging from	
	32,333 to $32,033$ .	
	when conducting a Google search for local bookkeeping courses, the top	
	search results feature online vendors such as Coursera and Udemy,	
	alongside CCBC's Entry-Level Bookkeeper course. For instance,	
	Coursera.Org offers the Intuit Academy Bookkeeping Professional	
	Certificate, which consists of four modules and is priced at \$49 USD per	
	month, with a free 7-day trial. Udemy.com has various online	
	bookkeeping classes with prices ranging from \$14.99 to \$139.00. Temple	
	University offers an asynchronous Online LERN/UGotClass Certificate in	
	Bookkeeping at a cost of \$495.00 USD.	

Identify Strengths,	Strengths		
Weaknesses,	• This program does not necessitate higher education; it is easily		
Opportunities, and	accessible.		
Threats. Include needed	• In as little as 5 months, students can obtain the CCBC Continuing		
resources (staff,	Education Workforce Entry Bookkeeper certificate and become		
technology, facilities)	career ready.		
	• We provide both synchronous on-campus and online classes, as well		
	as asynchronous online classes to accommodate a range of		
	scheduling needs.		
	Weaknesses		
	• Some students may find the cost of continuing education classes to		
	be prohibitive, especially with the ongoing rise in textbook expenses.		
	• Challenge to find highly qualified instructor who is a good fit for		
	program.		
	<ul> <li>Currently, we lack any data on participants after they complete the</li> </ul>		
	program. Implementing a system to track and follow up with		
	completers would be valuable.		
	Opportunities		
	<ul> <li>Bookkeeping is an essential skill in the business world: there is a</li> </ul>		
	consistent demand for gualified bookkeepers. This ensures constant		
	flow of potential students.		
	<ul> <li>Although the regional iob market for bookkeeping is slightly lower</li> </ul>		
	than the national average, the potential for remote work		
	opportunities, especially with online bookkeeping firms like		
	Intuit.com, could open new avenues for our program completers		
	and helps stabilize our enrollment.		
	<ul> <li>CCBC is the only community college offering instructor-led</li> </ul>		
	synchronous Accounting continuing education courses in the area.		
	Threats		
	Rise of free/low-cost online education platforms threatens attracting		
	students.		
	Increasing use of accounting software and automation tools may reduce		
	demand for manual bookkeeping skills. impacting enrollment.		
Notes and Comments	N/A		
Notes and Comments	N/A		

Program Coordinator:	Julie Woo
Program Director:	Moire Riley
Program Assistant Dean:	Lynette Higgins
Dean:	Louise Slezak
Additional Staff:	Sarah Moore

# The Community College of Baltimore County School of Continuing Education FY24 Program Review for: Network+ Certified Technician

Continuing Education Workforce Development Certificate Program

## Contents

- 1. Program Information Sheet
- 2. Review Committee Narrative and Recommendations

## Supplemental

- A. Curriculum Outlines (Syllabus) for Program Courses
- B. CC10s for Program Courses

# Program Name: Network+ Certified Technician Program Review Period: FY21-FY23

# Program Review Date: February 8, 2024

Name	Title
Dean CE and Workforce Development	Louise Slezak
CE Assistant Dean Workforce and Literacy	Matt Bernardy
CE Assistant Dean Applied Technology and	Jay Bouis
Logistics	
CE Assistant Dean Health and Business Services	Lynette Higgins
CE Senior Director of Compliance & Outcomes	Don Elliott
CE Director of Instruction & Learning Outcomes	Jack Boeve
CE Director of Budget & Finance	Paul Blair
Industry or Faculty SME	On-hold until more programs in content area to
	review
LOAAB Member #1	Lynn Mason
LOAAB Member #2	Sara Young
CCBC Online Senior Instructional Designer	Eileen Hardin

Submitted by:	Title	Date
Steve Ricketts	Coordinator, Tech. Training	12/01/2023
Reviewed and approved by:	Title	Date
Jay Bouis	Assistant Dean	1/2/2024

Program Title:	Network+ Certified Technician			
Program Description:	Possible career opportunities for those with a CompTIA <sup>®</sup> Network+			
Describe the program,	certification include Computer Network Support Specialist, Network			
including a focus on	Administrator, Network Engineer, Network Specialist, Network Technician,			
student outcomes, and	and System Administrator. This career requires continued training and			
how the program	education. Tasks associated with these positions include back up network			
contributes to the	data, configure security settings or access permissions, use diagnostic testing			
public or private good.	software and equipment to identify and troubleshoot network or			
	connectivity problems, install and configure networking hardware and			
	software, perform routine maintenance or standard repairs to networking			
	components, and install or repair network cables.			
	This program prepares students to take the CompTIA® Network+			
	Certification evam and for a career in computer network support learn how			
	to plan install configure and troubleshoot a computer network Develop			
	the skills to install and configure network operating systems and network			
	hardware Implement wireless networks, install and configure TCD/ID			
	perform diagnostic procedures to troubleshoot network malfunctions, and			
	implement/manage network security			
	Successful candidates must be self-motivated and independent learners			
	baye strong analytical skills, the ability to take direction, and the ability to			
	work both independently and as a team member			
Cradential(a) Offered	CCPC Credential Students will be awarded a Continuing Education			
Credential(s) Offered:	Workforce Cartificate and will have access to a Continuing Education			
(Include CE Workforce	Workforce Certificate and will have access to a Continuing Education			
Development	academic record (transcript).			
Certificate, and	External Credential: Students will be prepared to take the CompTIA®			
credentials from any	Network+ certification exam.			
certifying	Certifying Organization: Computing Technology Industry Association (Comp			
organizations)	IIA®) www.comptia.org			
External	No specialized program accreditation.			
Review/Accountability				
(Accreditation, advisory				
board, etc.)				
Program Hours	187.5 hrs. including prerequisites			
	<u>Prerequisites</u>			
	A+ Certification PC Technician Module 1 (50 hrs.)			
	A+ Certification PC Technician Module 2 (50 hrs.)			
	<u>Course Series</u>			
	Networking and Data Communications (37.5 hrs.)			
	Network+ Technician Certification (50 hrs.)			
Program Format(s)	Classroom 15%			
(classroom, online,	Remote Classroom (Zoom) 15%			
blended)	Blended 25%			
	Online Institutional 45%			
	Online Vendor			

	Other		
Application Process and	Open X		
Results	Provisional		
	Selective		
Program Outcomes	1.prepare to pass the CompTIA Network+ certification exam;		
	2. perform the various responsibilities and tasks required of a network		
	technician;		
	3. design and implement functional networks;		
	4. configure, manage, and maintain essential network devices;		
	5. implement network security, standards, and protocols; and		
	6. troubleshoot network problems.		

Summary of Outcomes	Continuing Education Workforce Certificate			
Achievement:	Prepared to take the CompTIA Network+ exam			
(outcomes assessment,				
completions,				
certifications, licenses)				
O*Net Code:	15-1231.00			
CIP Code:	11.0901			
Career Forecast/Analysis:	According to U.S. Department of Labor, overall employment of computer			
	network support specialists is projected to grow 11% from 2020 to 2030 in			
	Maryland. Projected annual job openings in Maryland are 700. Median			
	wages in Maryland are \$83,200.			
	O*Net suggests a "Bright Outlook" as this field is expected to grow rapidly			
	in the next several years, will have large numbers of job openings, or are			
	new and emerging occupations.			
Curriculum Summary	The Network+ Certified Technician program consists of 2 prerequisite			
(highlights, attach	courses and 2 program courses.			
Acalog page as	Prerequisites			
addendum A curriculum	A+ Certification PC Technician Module 1			
map may be required.)	A+ Certification PC Technician Module 2			
	<u>Course Series</u>			
	Networking and Data Communications			
	Network+ Technician Certification			
Alignment to CCBC	Enrollment Growth:			
Strategic Directions	Student events (Cybersecurity Institute Relaunch Event, CCBC student			
	& industry partner networking events, Tech nights).			
	<ul> <li>Accommodating schedule – day, evening, weekend.</li> </ul>			
	<ul> <li>Affordable pricing and financial aid opportunities.</li> </ul>			
	Economic Prosperity			
	Employer partnership (internships, apprenticeships)			
	Credit and Continuing Education Integration:			
	Shared courses			
	Prior learning			

	Stackable credentials			
	Iransformational Academics			
Alignment of Program	<ul> <li>Variety of instructional formats (classroom, online, remote, blended)</li> <li>Technology and Engineering Bathway</li> </ul>			
with CCBC Pathways and	lechnology and Engineering Pathway Shared Courses			
Credit Programs	Credit by Certification			
Summary of Changes to				
Curriculum During	None			
Review Period:				
Performance Indicators				
Program Enrollment		Duplicated	Unduplicated	
Last Year (FY23)		22	18	
Two Years Prior (FY22)		84	68	
Three Years Prior (FY21)		27	23	
Program Revenue		Budgeted	Actual	
Last Year (FY23)		•	\$13,158	
Two Years Prior (FY22)			\$77,301	
Three Years Prior (FY21)			\$16,003	
Sections Offered		Ran	Cancelled	
Last Year (FY23)		11 (35%)	20 (65%)	
Two Years Prior (FY22)		21 (55%)	17 (45%)	
Three Years Prior (FY21)		14 (52%)	13 (48%)	
Open Enrollment Versus Contract Training		Open Enrollment	Contract	
Last Year (FY23)		31		
Two Years Prior (FY22)		35	3	
Three Years Prior (FY21)		27		
FTE		Open Enrollment	Contract	
Last Year (FY23)		2.33		
Two Years Prior (FY22)		4.41	5.97	
Three Years Prior (FY21)		2.83		
Program Completers		Open Enrollment	Contract	
Last Year (FY23)		3		
Two Years Prior (FY22)		21		
Three Years Prior (FY21)		2		
Prior Learning Assessment	I			
Total program hours available for prior learning		137.5 incl. prereqs		
waiver.				
Number of hours actually waived. (data not yet		Not yet available		
available)				
Updated (If Needed)	eded) N/A			
Program Outcomes				
3-Year Projected	Projected Enrollment	Projected FTE	Projected Revenue	
Enrollment, FTE,				
Kevenue	22	2.22	640.450	
FY24	22	2.33	Ş13,158	

FY25	29	3.96	\$22,244		
FY26	36	5.59	\$31,330		
Promotion Strategy and	Flexi, website, email blast, social media – no cost				
Costs:					
Delivery Costs (supplies,	Shared Course: None, instructors are paid by Credit and students purchase				
space rental, lab costs)	books and exams.				
	Contract Course:- Approximately \$745 per student (instructor, books,				
	exams).				
Retention and	Instructor and/or Coordinator Support. Goal oriented approach for				
Completion Strategy:	certification. Student events.				
Program Delivery	On-site at Essex and Catonsville, Remote, Blended, & Online options				
Strategy (physical sites,	available.				
online):					
Partnerships with Credit:	Shared courses, Credit by certification, SOBTL Advisory Board.				
List Competitors –	AACC: \$1,460 / online synchronous				
pricing, location, etc.	Harford CC: \$1,423 / classroom				
	UMBC: \$2,295 / online synchronous				
	CompTIA: \$2,299 / online	synchronous			
	Learning Tree: \$2,590 / on	line synchronous			
	Ed2go-\$135:\$175 / online asynchronous				
Identify Strengths,	STRENGTHS- Pricing, financial aid, scheduling, instructional formats				
Weaknesses,	WEAKNESSES - Vacant coordinator position. Perception of community				
Opportunities, and	colleges for IT courses				
Threats. Include needed	OPPORTUNITIES – CE course offerings, short term classes, offer as a single				
resources (staff,	course				
technology, facilities)	THREATS- Online training vendors, changing technology				
Notes and Comments	FT Coordinator for IT Care	er programs is vacant.			
Program Coordinator:	Vacant				
Program Director:	Steve Ricketts (Supervisor)				
Program Assistant Dean:	Jay Bouis				
Dean:	Louise Slezak				
Additional Staff:	Danielle Bennett, ASA				

# The Community College of Baltimore County School of Continuing Education FY24 Program Review for: Pharmacy Technician

Continuing Education Workforce Development Certificate Program

## Contents

- 1. Program Information Sheet
- 2. Review Committee Narrative and Recommendations

## Supplemental

- A. Curriculum Outlines (Syllabus) for Program Courses
- B. CC10s for Program Courses

**Program Name**: Pharmacy Technician **Program Review Period:** FY21, FY22, FY23

# Program Review Date: February 8, 2024

Name	Title	
Dean CE and Workforce Development	Louise Slezak	
CE Assistant Dean Workforce and Literacy	Matt Bernardy	
CE Assistant Dean Applied Technology and	Jay Bouis	
Logistics		
CE Assistant Dean Health and Business Services	Lynette Higgins	
CE Senior Director of Compliance & Outcomes	Don Elliott	
CE Director of Instruction & Learning Outcomes	Jack Boeve	
CE Director of Budget & Finance	Paul Blair	
Industry or Faculty SME	On-hold until more programs in content area to	
	review	
LOAAB Member #1	Lynn Mason	
LOAAB Member #2	Sara Young	
CCBC Online Senior Instructional Designer	Eileen Hardin	

Submitted by:	Title	Date
Lauren Perrera	Coordinator, HHS	
Reviewed and approved by:	Title	Date
Lynette Higgins	Assistant Dean	

Program Title:	Pharmacy Technician		
Program Description	The Certified Pharmacy Technician typically assists pharmacists and		
Describe the program,	completes various tasks in a pharmaceutical environment. They can be		
including a focus on	employed in various settings including retail, hospital, and long-term care		
student outcomes, and	and government facilities. They are typically involved in customer		
how the program	interactions, insurance claim processing, maintaining inventories, and filling		
contributes to the public	prescriptions.		
or private good.			
	The curriculum is based on the current Pharmacy Technician Certification Board exam and prepares students to become a nationally certified Pharmacy Technician (CPhT) through a series of three courses. Students receive training in drug terminology and classifications, responsibilities, and work settings, and interpreting prescriptions and basic pharmacological calculations		
	Students entering this program must have the ability to communicate with patients, family, and health care providers concerning inventory, insurance, medications, and the human body. Efficient computer, basic math, study skills, and test taking skills are desirable. Being multi-lingual is useful.		
Credential(s) Offered	Upon completion of the program students will be awarded a Continuing		
(include CE Workforce	Education Workforce Certificate and have access to a Continuing Education		
Development Certificate,	academic record (transcript).		
and credentials from any			
certifying organizations)	Students will be eligible to take the national certification exam through the Pharmacy Technician Certification Board to become a Certified Pharmacy Technician (CPhT). Upon passing the exam, students can register with the Maryland Board of Pharmacy as a Certified Pharmacy Technician (CPhT).		
External	N/A		
Review/Accountability			
(Accreditation, advisorv			
board, etc.)			
Program Hours	Total 145 hours		
	Prerequisite AHL217/WOS064 Basic Math: 10 hours		
	AHE 739 Pharmacy Technician I: 60 hours		
	AHE740 Pharmacy Technician II: 60 hours		
	AHL 913 PTCB Review: 15 hours		
Program Format(s)	Classroom		
(classroom, online,	Remote Classroom (Zoom)		
blended)	Blended 100%		
	Online Institutional		
	Online Vendor		
	Other: Combination of zoom and face to face class session along with online		
	course work.		
Application Process and	Open X		
Results	Provisional		
	Selective		

Program Outcomes:	1. Identify and review the top 200 prescription drugs for indications,				
	contraindications, and drug class and dosage forms.				
	2. Review and practice mathematical calculations commonly performed				
	by a prial flack technician.				
	3. Identify and explain proper procedures for inventory management,				
	arug storage, disposal, and nandling of controlled substances.				
	4. Define commonly used appreviations in reading medication prescriptions.				
	5. Explain appropriate ways to avoid medication errors.				
	6. Understand and adhere to the laws regulating the scope of practice for a pharmacy technician				
	7 Identify strategies for passing multiple choice exams such as the PTCB				
	8. Complete a sample Pharmacy Technician Certification Board exam.				
	9. Apply to take the Pharmacy Technician Certification Board exam.				
	10. Register with the Maryland Board of Pharmacy.				
Summary of Outcomes	Continuing Education Workforce Certificate				
Achievement	National Certification: Pharmacy Technician Certification Board				
(outcomes assessment,	exam				
completions,	Registration with Maryland Board of Pharmacy				
certifications, licenses)					
O*Net Code:	29-2052.00				
CIP Code:	51.0805				
Career	According to the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics, the field of Pharmacy				
Forecast/Analysis:	Technician is projected to grow by 6 percent from 2022-2032. In the State				
	of Maryland there is a 12 percent projected growth in the field from 2020-				
	2030, with 700 projected annual job openings in the state.				
	In a retail pharmacy setting, Pharmacy Technicians can advance through				
	various levels of responsibility that vary by employer. In an institutional				
	pharmacy setting, Pharmacy Technicians can be selected for additional				
	training in specialized areas such as medication history reconciliation or				
	compounding sterile preparations.				
	Maryland source: Projections Central <u>2020-2030 long-term projections</u>				
	United States source: Bureau of Labor Statistics <u>2022-2032 employment</u>				
	projections				
	The surriculum is based on the surrent DTCD. Dharmany Technician				
	Cortifying even and property students to become a notionally cortified				
	Certifying exam and prepares students to become a nationally certified				
addendum A curriculum	training on drug terminology and classifications, responsibilities, and work				

(mynnynns, uttuch	Certifying exam and prepares students to become a nationally certified
Acalog page as	Pharmacy Technician through a series of three courses. Students receive
addendum A curriculum	training on drug terminology and classifications, responsibilities, and work
map may be required.)	settings, interpreting prescriptions and basic pharmacological calculations.
	Prerequisite: AHI 217/WOS064 Basic Math: This course is designed to
	review basic math skills directly used in the healthcare field. Topics include
	basic properties of math. fractions and decimals, ratios, rates, proportions
	and percentages. Students will learn how to use the metric system and how
	to set up basic algebraic equations to solve healthcare problems (e.g.,
	medication dosages).

Alignment to CCBC Strategic Directions	<ul> <li>settings. This is the first of three courses leading to preparation for taking the PTCB national certification exam, registration with the Maryland Board of Pharmacy and employment as a Pharmacy Technician. Topics include the roles, responsibilities and work settings of the pharmacy technician, drug terminology and classifications, the history of drugs in the US, legal and ethical issues surrounding drugs and medications, interpreting prescriptions and basic pharmacological calculations.</li> <li><u>AHE740 Pharmacy Technician II</u>: Students continue to prepare for the role of the Pharmacy Technician in a variety of employment settings. This is the second of two courses leading to national certification as a Pharmacy Technician through the PTCB and Maryland Board of Pharmacy (MBOP). Topics include pharmacy calculations, drug classification, dosages, routes of administration, parenteral, compounding, biopharmaceutics, pharmacy business issues, preparation for the national certification examination and registration with the state board of pharmacy.</li> <li><u>AHL 913 PTCB Review</u>: This course is designed to assist students preparing to take the PTCB Pharmacy Technician national certification examination. Content of the national exam, test-taking strategies, application for the PTCB examination, registration with the Maryland Board of Pharmacy and seeking employment as a Pharmacy Technician are discussed. Topics include pharmacy calculations, brand, and generic medications, interpreting prescriptions and laws pertaining to pharmacy technicians.</li> <li><u>Enrollment Growth</u>: explore opportunities for additional apprenticeship training to replace our previous agreement with CVS.</li> <li><u>Credit/Continuing Education Integration</u>: meet with Deb Graber to explore ways to promote the AAS degree for Allied Health to Pharmacy students. <u>Transformational Academics</u>: continue to leverage technology and enhance the online learning experience for Pharmacy students (virtual labs, interactive tools)</li></ul>		
	interactive tools)		
Alignment of Program	I ne program is aligi Health A.A.S.degree	ned with the Health Profession e permits students who have ac	s Pathway. The Allied
Credit Programs	certificates in the health field (i.e., pharmacy technician) an avenue to		
	receive both credit for prior learning and an associate degree with no		
	duplication of prior learning content.		
Summary of Changes to	None		
Curriculum During Review Period			
Program Enrollment		Dunlicated	Undunlicated
Last Year (FY23)		177	65
Two Years Prior (FY22)		295	155
Three Years Prior (FY21)		212	105
Program Revenue		Budgeted	Actual
Last Year (FY23)		\$133,835	\$162,166.00

Two Years Prior (FY22)	\$98,832	\$382,793.00
Three Years Prior (FY21)	N/A	\$224,068.00
Sections Offered	Ran	Cancelled
Last Year (FY23)	28 (93%)	2 (7%)
Two Years Prior (FY 22)	34 (82%)	7 (17%)
Three Years Prior (FY21)	28 (100%)	0
Open Enrollment Versus Contract Training	Open Enrollment	Contract
Last Year (FY23)	17	11
Two Years Prior (FY 22)	14	20
Three Years Prior (FY21)	17	11
FTE	Open Enrollment	Contract
Last Year (FY23)	13.9	8.
Two Years Prior (FY 22)	21	20.6
Three Years Prior (FY21)	20.8	7.5
Program Completers	Open Enrollment	Contract
Last Year (FY23)	Total 41	-
Two Years Prior (FY22)	Total 33	-
Three Years Prior (FY21)	Total 23	-

Prior Learning Assessment	
Total program hours available for prior learning	60 hours
waiver.	
Number of hours actually waived. (data not yet	Not yet available
available)	
Updated (If Needed) Program Outcomes:	

3-Year Projected	Projected Enrollment	Projected FTE	Projected Revenue
Enrollment, FTE, Revenue			
FY24	120	15	\$113,245
FY25	170	22	\$166,299
FY26	175	24	\$171,288

Promotion Strategy	The Flexi and CCBC website are utilized to promote the program without any
and Costs	additional costs. We also leverage Baltimore County Public school relationships
	to promote Pharmacy to ECAP students.
Delivery Costs	The first PTCB exam attempt (\$129) and book bundles (\$205.57) are included
(supplies, space	in the price of the program. Instructor costs are often the primary expenditure
rental, lab costs)	since we often use Pharmacist's as adjunct faculty.
Retention and	Developing a comprehensive onboarding to be delivered at an orientation
Completion Strategy	before the program starts. This will give students clear expectations prior to
	beginning the program. Maintain communication between the students and
	the adjunct faculty throughout the course especially if the course is being
	delivered via zoom.
Program Delivery	The program is offered in multiple formats to align with the needs of students.
Strategy (physical	The courses are offered online with zoom component, and in-person with
sites, online)	

	additional online course work required. Essex and Randallstown are equipped
	with Pharmacy labs.
Partnerships with	AAS Degree Allied Health
Credit	
List Competitors –	1. Chesapeake College – Ed2Go course (\$1,299) PTCB Exam not included
pricing, location, etc.	2. College of Southern MD- \$5,200 (\$500 books), PTCB Exam not included
	3. Carroll Community College \$1,500
	4. Offered at Allegany and Prince George no pricing listed
	5. Offered at Fortis and All-State no pricing listed
Identify Strengths,	<u>Strengths</u>
Weaknesses,	Multiple course delivery methods (combination of Remote, Online
Opportunities, and	Asynchronous, in-person)
Threats. Include	• Adjunct faculty are proficient in the subject matter and often still work in
needed resources	the field of pharmacy
(staff, technology,	• Individuals can obtain Pharmacy certification and employment within 6
jacilities)	months
	Weaknesses
	Limited financial aid resources available
	<ul> <li>Difficulty with advanced math for students contributes to low completion</li> </ul>
	rates
	Opportunities
	Offer optional externship to students
	<ul> <li>Become certified to offer the Maryland State Board Exam</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>Explore new apprenticeship partners</li> </ul>
	Threats
	• Inexpensive online options such as Ed2Go available at other Institutions
	• On the job training with employer: often pharmacies will train within and
	are approved by MSBOP
Notes and Comments	
Program Coordinator:	Lauren Perrera
Program Director:	Denise Lindley
Program Assistant Dear	n: Lynette Higgins
Dean:	Louise Slezak
Additional Staff:	

# The Community College of Baltimore County School of Continuing Education FY24 Program Review for: Special Police Officer

Continuing Education Workforce Development Certificate Program

## Contents

- 1. Program Information Sheet
- 2. Review Committee Narrative and Recommendations

## Supplemental

- A. Curriculum Outlines (Syllabus) for Program Courses
- B. CC10s for Program Courses

# Program Name: Special Police Officer Program Review Period:

# Program Review Date: February 8, 2024

Name	Title
Dean CE and Workforce Development	Louise Slezak
CE Assistant Dean Workforce and Literacy	Matt Bernardy
CE Assistant Dean Applied Technology and	Jay Bouis
Logistics	
CE Assistant Dean Health and Business Services	Lynette Higgins
CE Senior Director of Compliance & Outcomes	Don Elliott
CE Director of Instruction & Learning Outcomes	Jack Boeve
CE Director of Budget & Finance	Paul Blair
Industry or Faculty SME	On-hold until more programs in content area to
	review
LOAAB Member #1	Lynn Mason
LOAAB Member #2	Sara Young
CCBC Online Senior Instructional Designer	Eileen Hardin

Submitted by:	Title	Date
Greg Zuest	Coordinator, Public Service Academies	12/15/2023
Reviewed and approved by:	Title	Date
Lynette Higgins	Assistant Dean	

Program Title	Special Police Officer Initial Training
Program Description	The Special Police Officer (SPO) initial training is designed to provide the
Describe the program,	required 80 hours of instruction and addresses the 61 SPO training
including a focus on	objectives as approved by the Secretary of the Maryland State Police. (At
student outcomes, and	CCBC, we provide 84 hours of instruction due to our Public Safety Officers'
how the program	work schedules.) Participants who satisfactorily complete the certificate
contributes to the	program may apply through their employer for a Special Police Officer
public or private good.	Commission issued by the Governor of the State of Maryland.
	The certificate program covers aspects of policing such as criminal and
	constitutional law, crime prevention, report writing, court procedures,
	interpersonal interactions and de-escalation techniques, defensive tactics,
	and first aid/ CPR.
	Individuals who hold a Special Police Officer Commission have policing
	powers such as the ability to detain and arrest suspects and search vehicles
	but only on the property of their employer (and, in very limited situations, on
	property immediately adjacent to their employer's property such as when
	directing traffic in an emergency).
	Special Police Officers are hired by both private and public entities. Local
	private employers are diverse and include hospital systems such as MedStar,
	Stevenson University and the Rosedale Baptist Church. Public employers
	include the Maryland Court System, the Enoch Pratt Free Library System,
	CCBC, Anne Arundel Community College and the Cecil County Sheriff's
	Office.
Credential(s) Offered	
(include CE Workforce	
Development	
Certificate, and	
credentials from any	
certifying	
organizations)	
External	Curriculum and instructors approved through the Maryland Police and
Review/Accountability	Correctional Training Commissions (MPCTC) which falls under the State of
(Accreditation, advisory	Maryland Department of Public Safety and Correctional Services.
board, etc.)	
Program Hours	84 (80 hours is the minimum requirement for program approval through the
	Maryland Police and Correctional Training Commission)
Program Format(s)	Classroom 100%
(classroom, online,	Kemote Classroom (Zoom)
biended)	Rieuaea
	Online Institutional
	Online Vendor
	Other

Open X
Provisional
Selective
1. Apply the knowledge and skills to function effectively to protect
businesses, guests, and assets as appropriate;
2. Meet education requirements set by Maryland State Police for an SPO
commission
3. Prepare to gain employment as a Special Police Officer
Students who successfully complete the SPO Initial Training earn a
Workforce Training Certificate which their employer will submit to the
Maryland State Police for commissioning. The training course must be
approved by the Secretary of the Maryland State Police in consultation with
the Maryland Police Training and Standards Commission consisting of at
least 80-hours of instruction, including instruction on (i) criminal law; (ii)
constitutional procedural requirements related to search, seizure, and
arrest; and (iii) the appropriate use of force. (MD. Public Safety Code § 3-303
(2022))
43.0107
There are no forecasted numbers specifically for the Special Police Officer
occupation. However, according to the Bureau of Labor Statistics (BOL),
overall employment of law enforcement officers (police and detectives) is
projected to grow at 3 percent from 2022 to 2032. In addition, the BOL
projects a 3.4% employment growth for security guards between 2021 and
2031. Anecdotally, numerous agencies which employ Special Police Officers
(including CCBC) are finding it difficult to hire, and retain, officers. This
creates a need for the training of new officers who enter the profession to
fill these vacancies.

Curriculum Summary	See attached Addendum B which includes the list of topics covered and
(Highlights, attach	which learning objectives are associated with each topic.
Acalog page as	
addendum A curriculum	
map may be required.)	
Alignment to CCBC	The SPO initial training aligns with the CCBC strategic directions through the
Strategic Directions	integration of credit and continuing education. In addition to credit faculty
	assisting in the development of the SPO and teaching in the training (see
	below), credit and non-credit market programs together, and the
	Coordinator for Public Service Academies sits on the BCPS Homeland
	Security and CCBC Criminal Justice Studies Advisory Board.
Alignment of Program	The Special Police Officer (SPO) training aligns with the Criminal Justice (CJ)
with CCBC Pathways	and Law pathway. During the SPO initial training's creation, CE worked with
and Credit Programs	CJ faculty to develop the program, the lesson plans and program learning
	materials. In addition, Criminal Justice department faculty members teach in
	the SPO initial training program and students who complete the SPO training
	can be awarded 6 credit hours of PLA through an industry articulation
	agreement. SPO completers may receive 3 credit hours for CRJU 201:

	1
	Criminal Justice Seminar; and 3 credit hours of CRJU 273: Criminal Justice
	Internship.
	Also, Continuing Education and credit have collaborated to develop a brochure titled "Thinking about a Career in Criminal Justice?" which outlines four (4) educational pathways (2 credit, 2 CE) at CCBC that can lead to careers in criminal justice including the Special Police Officer training. We also invite all students (Con Ed and credit) to the criminal justice and law pathway events such as career fairs, field trips and in-house events.
Summary of Changes to	The review period coincided with our offering the SPO for the first time
Curriculum During	while heing fully staffed. This afforded us the opportunity to observe most
Roviow Poriod	days of the course, discuss the classes with various instructors and
	determine areas for improvement
	determine areas for improvement.
	During this review, we found several areas which needed attention. Some issues were addressed during the October 2023 course offering and others will be addressed in the upcoming spring 2024 offering. For example, after speaking with our Defensive Tactics instructors, we decided to move part of the defensive tactics course into a classroom to allow for a presentation regarding the recently updated Maryland Use of Force statute. This topic had been covered previously; however, this time we used a new two-hour presentation with a much more in-depth look into the topic. Aside from putting together the presentation, the instructors also created a new assessment.
	Most objectives were covered very well, and many objectives were reinforced under multiple topical areas allowing the students to "connect the dots" between the various areas of policing. Several objectives, however, were not covered as thoroughly as they should be. Therefore, prior to the next offering, we will be working with several instructors to revise their topical areas to better address the objectives, and we will restructure several of the topical areas altogether. For example, the standalone Bomb Threats topic will be eliminated in the spring and the materials incorporated into the Emergency Preparedness course (which includes topics such as active shooters and weather-related emergencies). This will free up time which can be used on a topic such as SPOs intervening in interpersonal conflicts (Obj 38) or procedures that an SPO should/may employ when encountering an individual with a disability (Obj 43) which need additional coverage.
	As this is an iterative process, we will continue to monitor topics, teaching materials, instructors, student assessments and course evaluations to make refinements as necessary.

Performance Indicators		
Program Enrollment	Duplicated	Unduplicated
Last Year (FY23)	24	24

Two Years Prior (FY22)	45	45
Three Years Prior (FY21)	22	22
Program Revenue	Budgeted	Actual
Last Year (FY23)	\$15,282	\$16,131
Two Years Prior (FY22)	\$26,319	\$30,564
Three Years Prior (FY21)	\$6.760	\$17,829
Sections Offered	Ran	Cancelled
Last Year (FY23)	4 (66%)	2 (34%)
Two Years Prior (FY22)	7 (78%)	2 (22%)
Three Years Prior (FY21)	6 (86%)	1 (14%)
Open Enrollment Versus Contract Training	Open Enrollment	Contract
Last Year (FY23)	2	2
Two Years Prior (FY22)	3	4
Three Years Prior (FY21)	3	3
FTE	Open Enrollment	Contract
Last Year (FY23)	1.12	3.14
Two Years Prior (FY22)	4.03	4.03
Three Years Prior (FY21)	1 57	2.17
	1.57	3.17
Program Completers	Open Enrollment	Contract
Program Completers Last Year (FY23)	Open Enrollment	3.17 Contract 14 (+ 5 CCBC)*
Program Completers       Last Year (FY23)       Two Years Prior (FY22)	1.57           Open Enrollment           5           18	3.17 Contract 14 (+ 5 CCBC)* 18 (+9 CCBC)*

Note: \*CCBC Public Safety Officers are trained in this course to earn their SPO commission. As these are CCBC employees, we do not charge tuition/fees, and we do not earn FTE for them

Prior Learning Assessment	
Total program hours available for prior	N/A
learning waiver.	
Number of hours waived. (data not yet	N/A
available)	
Updated (If Needed) Program Outcomes	

3-Year Projected Enrollment, FTE, and Revenue	Projected Enrollment	Projected FTE	Projected Revenue
FY24	20	4.48	\$16,980
FY25	24	5.38	\$20,376
FY26	25	5.6	\$21,225

Promotion Strategy	Each offering is advertised in the CCBC flexi and a flyer is created and
and Costs	distributed to client organizations and individuals interested in taking the SPO
	training. In addition, the SPO is advertised at criminal justice and law career
	fairs. Recently, we have been working with veterans' service organizations to
	keep them aware of the offerings.
Delivery Costs	The bulk of the cost of the program are instructor costs- approximately, \$4,500
(supplies, space	depending on the number of students (more than 9 participants requires a
rental, lab costs)	second Defensive Tactics instructor for some activities) Other costs are \$6 per

	participant for the Digest of Criminal Laws, \$5.50 per participant for ECSI first
	aid and CPR card, and other miscellaneous materials (binders, name tags, etc.)
Retention and	As this is a 12-day course with mandatory attendance, ensuring that students
Completion Strategy	are aware of the attendance/participation requirements before arriving on the
	first day is imperative. Therefore, a week prior to the start of class each student
	is sent a "welcome" email with important information such as the class
	schedule, attendance requirement, and appropriate attire. The class
	attendance/ participation rules are reiterated on the first morning of class and
	each student signs an acknowledgement form stating that they understand the
	requirements indicated in the syllabus and on the Rules and Regulations
	document provided to them. In terms of academics, help is available if a
	student struggles with any of the materials while they are in the class.
Program Delivery	The program is delivered in-person on the Dundalk campus and utilizes both
Strategy (physical	classrooms and the gymnasium for defensive tactics training.
sites, online)	
Partnerships with	Over the next three years, we will continue to work with our credit partners to
Credit:	further integrate Criminal Justice faculty members into teaching roles and
	providing curriculum development. For example, prior to the next offering of
	the SPO, we will be working with two Criminal Justice faculty members to
	revamp 3 areas of the SPO (approx. 1/4 of the total SPO) to better separate
	(chunk) the materials, provide clearer PowerPoints and learning activities and
	create better assessments. In addition, we will continue to work with our credit
	partners in the marketing and advertising of the SPO course to prospective
	students.
List Competitors –	Using the list of MPCTC approved 80-hour Special Police Officer training
pricing, location, etc.	programs, only two other providers appear to be actively holding classes which
	individuals may enroll in:
	Montgomery College- \$850.00 (non-MD residents add \$400). Consists of 11
	eight-hour sessions in a combination of face-to-face (on the Rockville Campus)
	and online through Zoom.
	Security Training Academy- Pasadena, MD. Classes \$750. All completed virtually
	except two days of in-person training.
	Several providers appear to only train their own employees such as the District
	Court of Maryland. Others appear to only work with organizations to supply
	contract training. But information on pricing, location, and method of
	instruction is not shown on their websites.
Identify Strengths,	Strengths:
Weaknesses,	<ul> <li>Use of in-house faculty and staff for instruction</li> </ul>
Opportunities, and	<ul> <li>MDTA and BCPA instructors in proximity</li> </ul>
Threats. Include	<ul> <li>Exceptional name recognition and historical client satisfaction</li> </ul>
needed resources	Good facilities with ready access
(staff, technology,	High number of clients in proximity
facilities)	• Good relationships with law enforcement agencies in area for help in
	finding expert instructors
	Weaknesses:
	• Few instructors (who are currently MPCTC approved) are available to teach
	certain courses (i.e. verbal judo, defensive tactics, gangs)

	<ul> <li>7 hour per day schedule which results in training being two weeks and tw days vs. 2 weeks of 8-hour days</li> </ul>			
	Opportunities:			
	icational providers in the area (i.e. Anne Arundel Community em to have stopped offering SPO classes (unsure of the reasons			
	<ul> <li>Entities finding the need to add Special Police Officers to their staff (i.e. Baltimore City Department of Parks and Recreation)</li> </ul>			
	• The utilizati	The utilization of additional CCBC Public Safety Officers as instructors		
	Threats:	źs:		
	• Loss of spe	Loss of specialized instructors due to Academy schedules and/or physical		
	location ch	location changes of Academy staff		
	• Difficulty f	officulty finding students- open enrollment students dropping prior to		
Notos on d	Start and C	start and continued diriculty of clients to hire/retain employees		
Notes and				
Comments				
Program Coordinator:	Greg Z	Zuest		
Program Director:	Moire	Riley		
Program Assistant Dea	n: Lynett	e Higgins		
Dean:	Louise	Slezak		
Additional Staff:				

## INSTITUTIONAL OUTCOMES ASSESSMENT

Glenda Breaux Ph.D. Senior Director, Planning, Research and Development

#### July 2024

The FY 2024-2026 Strategic Plan's key elements are embedded in its four primary strategic priorities: Enrollment Growth, Economic Prosperity, Credit and Continuing Education Integration, and Transformational Academics. Transformational Academics involves providing instruction and support that promotes students' success, which includes promoting achievement of early momentum metrics, long-term retention, and program completion. To assess achievement of these institutional learning outcome goals, CCBC conducts regular internal analyses and engages with external organizations such as the Voluntary Framework Accountability (VFA), Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System (IPEDS), and the Federal Reserve Bank of Richmond to track progress towards achievement of success metrics. This year's annual report provides trend data from these sources as they relate to the Credit student population (unless otherwise indicated).

## Early Momentum Metrics: Voluntary Framework Accountability (VFA)

For each early momentum metric, attainment rates across cohorts were relatively stable between 2019 and 2021. Most metrics varied no more than three percentage points across years. Exceptions included the percentage of students passing college English in year 1, which declined five percentage points between 2019 and 2021, and Fall to Spring retention which declined four percentage points between 2019 and 2020. Metrics for the 2021 cohort were all within three percentage points of those for the 2020 cohort.

VFA Early Momentum Metrics	Fall 2019 Cohort	Fall 2020 Cohort	Fall 2021 Cohort
Earned 6+ credits first term	48%	45%	45%
Earned 12+ credits first term	18%	17%	17%
Earned 15+ credits first year	30%	30%	29%
Earned 24+ credits first year	13%	13%	13%
Earned 30+ credits first year	4%	4%	4%
Passed college English in year 1	43%	39%	38%
Passed college math in year 1	19%	21%	18%
Passed college English & math in year 1	13%	14%	13%
Fall to Spring retention	63%	59%	61%
Credit success rate	70%	64%	62%

#### Table 1: VFA Early Momentum Metrics

#### CCBC's Internal Early Momentum Metric Analysis

Using internal data, we find higher rates of first year credit cumulation at the 24-credit threshold in each Fall cohort for 2019-2021. This is likely because our internal analysis focuses on full-time students, while VFA calculates the percentage of both full- and part-time students who reach the threshold.

Table 2: Credit Accumulation in Year 1

Early Momentum Metric	Fall 2019 Cohort	Fall 2020 Cohort	Fall 2021 Cohort	Fall 2022 Cohort
Part-Time Students (12+ credits)	25%	27%	27%	27%
Full Time Students (24+ credits)	26%	31%	33%	31%

Gateway course completion is also higher in the internal data than the VFA results show, but the decline in English course completion is larger between 2019 and 2021 (eight percentage points) in the internal data. One reason for the discrepancy between VFA values and CCBC values may relate to CCBC counting gateway English and math courses that students transferred in, while the data set for VFA only include courses completed at CCBC.

In Table 3 we see our first disaggregation by race/ethnicity. Over half of students in each cohort completed a credit English course in their first year at CCBC. Rates vary by race/ethnicity, with African American/Black students tending to have lower completion rates than other groups. The completion rate is similar for the 2022 cohort as for the 2019 cohort for most groups, indicating a recovery from pandemic-era declines. Note that small groups such as American Indian/Alaska Native and Native Hawaiian and other Pacific Islanders have volatile values where a change of one student can lead to changes that are over thirty percentage points. At CCBC, these groups typically have fewer than 10 students per cohort and are sometimes suppressed or combined in the data.

Early Momentum Metric	2019	2020	2021	2022
	Cohort	Cohort	Cohort	Cohort
Passed college English in year 1	61%	55%	53%	60%
African American/Black	54%	49%	45%	51%
Amer Indian/Alaska Native	90%	22%	42%	80%
Asian	66%	70%	63%	68%
Hispanic/Latino	65%	57%	56%	61%
Multiple Races	65%	55%	54%	57%
Native Hawaiian or Other Pl	60%	100%	75%	33%
No Information	42%	50%	32%	65%
White	69%	62%	63%	69%

Table 3. English Completion in Year 1

As also seen in the VFA results, outcomes for math are less positive than those for English in terms of completion rate. Here we see less than one-third of students in each cohort completing Math in their first year. Unlike in English, there was higher attainment during the height of the pandemic than for the 2022 cohort whose completion rate is also similar to the 2019 cohort. Rates vary considerably by race/ethnicity. Asian and White students tend to have substantially higher math completion rates than other groups, with all cohorts at 30% or higher.
Table 4. Math Completion in Year 1

Farly Momentum Metric	2019	2020	2021	2022
	Cohort	Cohort	Cohort	Cohort
Passed college math in year 1	26%	30%	27%	23%
African American/Black	17%	23%	18%	16%
Amer Indian/Alaska Native	20%	11%	8%	0%
Asian	39%	51%	48%	38%
Hispanic/Latino	24%	28%	27%	20%
Multiple Races	35%	30%	32%	28%
Native Hawaiian or Other Pl	0%	25%	0%	33%
No Information	17%	31%	20%	25%
White	35%	35%	36%	30%

About one-quarter of students complete both English and math in their first year at CCBC. Rates vary considerably by race/ethnicity. Patterns across racial/ethnic groups are similar to those reported above.

Table 5. English and Math Completion in Year 1

Early Momentum Metric	2019 Cohort	2020 Cohort	2021 Cohort	2022 Cohort
Passed college English & math in year 1	23%	26%	24%	21%
African American/Black	15%	20%	16%	14%
Amer Indian/Alaska Native	20%	0%	8%	0%
Asian	36%	46%	42%	34%
Hispanic/Latino	22%	25%	24%	19%
Multiple Races	33%	28%	27%	25%
Native Hawaiian or Other PI	0%	25%	0%	33%
No Information	15%	31%	18%	24%
White	31%	31%	33%	28%

When we examine course pass rates using all CCBC courses and include all credit students, we see higher pass rates than the VFA data. Course pass rates declined during the height of the pandemic when most classes were online (asynchronous) or remote (synchronous) but began to rebound in Fall 2022 as on-site courses increased. This is consistent with other internal data showing that on-site classes tend to have higher pass rates than online or remote classes. However, pass rates are still lower overall and for most racial/ethnic groups in the Fall 2023 population than in Fall 2019. Table 6. Course Pass Rates

Course Pass Rate	Fall 2019	Fall 2020	Fall 2021	Fall 2022	Fall 2023
Overall	76%	67%	71%	73%	74%
African American/Black	69%	59%	62%	66%	65%
Amer Indian/Alaska Native	81%	63%	64%	71%	50%
Asian	83%	75%	78%	78%	82%
Hispanic/Latino	75%	65%	69%	71%	70%
Multiple Races	59%	85%	79%	64%	80%
Native Hawaiian or Other PI	79%	69%	66%	76%	80%
No Information	74%	62%	68%	67%	65%
White	82%	75%	80%	81%	80%

The retention values we get when we include new students to CCBC (new first time and transfer) who attended in the fall semester and returned in the spring vary somewhat from the values when only students who are in their first year are included. CCBC's internal analysis shows a similar retention pattern of where next semester retention was at 62% for Fall 2019 students and declined in the pandemic years. Retention began to rebound in Fall 2022 but has not yet recovered fully, particularly for African American/Black and Hispanic/Latino students.

Table 7. Next Semester Retention: Students new to CCBC

Race/Ethnicity	F19-S20	F20-S21	F21-S22	F22-S23	F23-S24
Overall	62%	58%	59%	61%	59%
African American/Black	58%	51%	53%	57%	54%
Asian	75%	74%	72%	73%	75%
Hispanic/Latino	69%	63%	62%	63%	59%
White	64%	63%	65%	63%	63%
All other races	56%	52%	55%	59%	59%

One-year retention rates have remained in the low 40% range for the past four years. The pandemic effect was not as substantial overall or within racial/ethnic groups. Most groups' rates vary by only a few percentage points between Fall 2019 and Fall 2020.

Table 8. One-Year Retention: Students new to CCBC

Race/Ethnicity	F19-F20	F20-F21	F21-F22	F22-F23
Overall	44%	41%	40%	43%
African American/Black	39%	36%	33%	37%
Asian	61%	63%	54%	59%
Hispanic/Latino	48%	45%	42%	49%
White	45%	45%	47%	47%
All other races	43%	32%	37%	42%

## Completion: Multiple Sources, Multiple Values

The tables below show the completion rates at 2 years, 3 years, and 4 years. In the context of full-time enrollment, these are considered the "on-time", "time and a half or 150%", and "double time or 200%" completion rates. The data show a relatively stable overall completion rate at each time point, but a progressively higher rate as more time progresses. Part time enrollment contributes greatly to this trend. Many of the two-year colleges against which we are benchmarked have much lower part-time student populations and tend to have two-year completion rates that mirror CCBC's four-year rate. With less than half of our students earning six or more credits in their first term, if that trend continues, we need a 6-year metric to capture the maximum completion rate with respect to time.

The data below shows 2-year completion rates below 15%, 3-year rates below 20%, and 4-year rates near 25%. The VFA calculated a 6-year completion rate for the Fall 2016 cohort finding a rate of 30%. There are substantial differences between racial/ethnic groups that tend to get larger as time progresses. The rate at which students transfer and the number of credits completed prior to transfer may be contributing to these gaps.

VEA Completion Data	F18	F19	F20
VPA completion bata	Cohort	Cohort	Cohort
Two-Year Completion Rate	13%	13%	13%
African American/Black	10%	11%	10%
Amer Indian/Alaska Native	31%	11%	33%
Asian	8%	10%	11%
Hispanic/Latino	12%	13%	8%
Multiple Races	16%	16%	10%
Native Hawaiian or Other PI	25%	0%	0%
No Information	15%	11%	23%
White	14%	16%	18%

Table 9. VFA: Two-year Completion Rate

Table 10. IPEDS: Two-Year Completion Rate

IPEDS Completion Data	F18 Cohort	F19 Cobort	F20 Cobort
Three-Year Completion Rate	8%	8%	9%
African American/Black	6%	4%	5%
Amer Indian/Alaska Native	33%	0%	25%
Asian	7%	9%	11%
Hispanic/Latino	8%	9%	7%
Multiple Races	13%	7%	8%
Native Hawaiian or Other PI	0%	0%	0%
No Information	11%	10%	21%
White	12%	11%	14%

Note: Includes only first-time students who were full time in their first term

Table 11. IPEDS: Three-Year Completion Rate

IPEDS Completion Data	F18	F19	F20
IF LDS Completion Data	Cohort	Cohort	Cohort
Three-Year Completion Rate	16%	16%	16%
African American/Black	10%	9%	9%
Amer Indian/Alaska Native	33%	0%	25%
Asian	16%	18%	18%
Hispanic/Latino	16%	16%	13%
Multiple Races	24%	17%	14%
Native Hawaiian or Other PI	0%	20%	0%
No Information	33%	24%	21%
White	23%	26%	24%

Note: Includes only first-time students who were full time in their first term

Table 12. CCBC Four-Year Completion Rate

PAR Completion Data	F17	F18	F19
PAR Completion Data	Cohort	Cohort	Cohort
Four-Year Completion Rate	22%	23%	24%
African American/Black	14%	15%	15%
Asian	27%	25%	31%
Hispanic/Latino	24%	22%	22%
White	31%	32%	33%

Note: Includes only students who completed at least 18 credits in their first year

Table 13. Federal Reserve or Richmond Four-Year Completion Rate

IPEDS Completion Data	Credit	Continuing Education	Total
Four-Year Completion Rate	15%	10%	13%
African American/Black	10%	12%	11%
Amer Indian/Alaska Native	33%	17%	26%
Asian	19%	16%	18%
Hispanic/Latino	14%	16%	15%
Multiple Races	18%	N/A	18%
Native Hawaiian or Other PI	6%	0%	4%
No Information	16%	8%	10%
White	19%	8%	15%

In an effort to generate a consistent source of information with stable cohort definitions and calculation procedures over time, CCBC is creating a student progress tracking process that will use internal data updated at least annually and tracking cohorts for up to six years. This student progress

data will be shared in a Power BI report that allows for disaggregation by a variety of student characteristics. We expect to launch this report by the end of Fall 2024. This will support the subsequent creation of an outcome gap report in Power BI that will track the size of outcome gaps and trends in gap closure over time.

#### 2023-2024 TEACHING & LEARNING/CENTER FOR PROFESSIONAL & ORGANIZATIONAL LEARNING

Dallas Dolan Ph.D., Dean of Teaching & Learning Robin Minor Ph.D., Director of the Center for Professional & Organizational Learning

#### June 2024

## Overview

This year has been one of substantial growth and change as the organization formerly known as the Center for Excellence in Teaching & Learning became part of a larger organization known as the **Institute for Transformational Teaching, Learning & Leadership (ITTLL)**. This new organization was created to bring together under one umbrella programs and services that serve faculty, staff and students but have historically been spread across academic and student affairs areas. This new structure was intentionally designed to bridge historic silos at CCBC between academic and student affairs. ITTLL is jointly led by the Dean of College Life and the Dean of Teaching & Learning, and when fully scaled will encompass four centers, each with a director. Those centers are **Professional and Organizational Learning**, **Transformational Pedagogies, Civic Engagement and Co-Curricular Learning** and **Diversity, Equity, Inclusion and Belonging**.

With this shift in organizational structure, this year's end of year report will focus on the first center listed above, the Center for Professional & Organizational Learning (CPOL). CPOL encompasses much of the work of the previous Center for Excellence in Teaching & Learning, which is now led by a full-time director Robin Minor. We expect to have a Director of Transformational Pedagogies by the start of the fall, 2024 semester. Some programs housed in Transformational Pedagogies are included in this report. The report covers AY2023-2024.

# By the Numbers

This year, the number of professional development courses and programs and attendees increased significantly. In 2022-23 we reported 1,669 participants in CETL offerings; in 2023-2024, that number increased by over 1,000 participants to 2,841 participants. These numbers are inclusive of duplicates in registration, in that one faculty member may be enrolled in several professional development activities during the year. This represents a year-over-year increase of 70%. While some of that can be attributed to better record keeping, there was clearly an increase in the number and variety of courses being offered and the number of participants per course.

# Highlighted Programs for 2023-2024

There are many different programs and training events that fall under this report. In past years we have chosen just a few to highlight, and we will continue that tradition here. This year we will highlight our work with the American Council on Education (ACUE) to provide online asynchronous professional development focused on evidence-based practices that contribute to student success. We will also report on a Faculty Learning Community called Connections: A community of teaching & learning scholars which focused on artificial intelligence, and on our Culturally Responsive Teaching & Learning program, which has experienced a great deal of growth this year.

# Association of College and University Educators (ACUE) Courses at CCBC

During AY23-24 CCBC expanded its ACUE offerings from 1 to 3 different types of courses to faculty and staff: 1) Fostering a Culture of Belonging for staff and faculty; 2) blocks of modules in the Effective Teaching Practices course for adjunct faculty; and 3) the yearlong Effective Teaching Practices course for

full-time faculty. Only Effective Teaching Practices had been run before. Each course was provided fully online in an asynchronous modality, and successful completion resulted in a certificate of completion.

## Fostering a Culture of Belonging (FCB)

This was the first year that CCBC contracted with ACUE to offer the FCB course, and the intent was to focus on staff who interact with students outside of the classroom. Information about the course was sent to supervisors in student support services, athletics, and public safety to recruit participants. Three cohorts starting in October, January, and March have been offered this year with 61 CCBC members enrolling in the courses and 49 (80%) of them completing the course requirements to earn the certificate. A fourth cohort is currently running with a completion date in late July, so the numbers will increase. All completers received/will receive digital certificates from ACUE, and some proud completers like the Navigator Ryan Wright have applied the digital badge to their email signature line.

This course is unique among the other ACUE courses CCBC offers in that the material is slightly flexible, allowing different populations to take the same course together. In other words, even among a cohort of participants, the individuals can choose slightly different content to engage with that is most relevant to the role at the college. For example, during the second module on Reducing Microaggressions, the instructional videos are divided into groups by role (e.g. Admissions, Campus Safety, Instructors, Leadership, Marketing) that are available for all to watch yet allow single course takers to focus on their role only if they desire. Some of the videos overlap roles, but not all. This allows for diverse employees to engage in the FCB course as a single cohort with a shared overall theme and yet have content tailored to their needs. They also access a single discussion thread and interact with each other across their disciplines to reflect on prompts during each of the four (4) content modules.

ACUE course completers receive certificates digitally by ACUE, but we also wanted to recognize the completers on campus. We organized a commemorative "ACUE Soiree" on May 30, 2024. It was a lighthearted celebration that all ACUE course takers could attend, and even George Yang, an ACUE sales representative, flew in from Los Angeles to attend in person. Among the event's activities, attendees were asked to provide some comments about their ACUE experience. Ten individuals completed the survey anonymously, and all 10 respondents indicated that they would sign up for the course again after having taken it. Two respondents wrote further comments, one saying "Everyone should take this course. Also, any faculty member who doesn't think they need it" and the other specifying that "anyone in senior staff if they have not participated" should take the FCB course.

# Adjunct Effective Teaching Practices (ETP)

This was the first year that CCBC extended ACUE course offerings to adjunct faculty members. A block of modules from the yearlong ETP course was offered in fall 2023, where adjunct faculty could earn a micro credential in Promoting Active Learning. In spring 2024, adjunct faculty completed the micro credential in Designing Learning-Centered and Equitable Courses. Twenty-eight of 33 adjuncts (85%) completed the fall micro credential, and 17 of 24 (71%) completed the spring micro credential. There are 8 adjuncts who completed both courses and may continue to complete the two (2) future adjunct micro credentials in ETP to earn the full certification.

Adjunct faculty ACUE completers were also invited to the Soiree in May to be celebrated. Four individuals completed the survey, and all four said that they would take the course again. They also reported that the potential for the course to impact teaching and learning at CCBC was a unanimous 5 on a 5-point scale. Two adjuncts have emailed the Director of CPOL since the soiree to express their eagerness to enroll in the next mini course already.

## Effective Teaching Practices (ETP)

This was the second year that CCBC ran the yearlong ETP course for full-time faculty at CCBC. This cohort ran over 25 weeks from September 2023 through May 2024, and course takers complete four (4) mini courses to earn a certificate that has been valued at three (3) graduate credits and recognized in the faculty equivalency process as such. Most of their work is completed asynchronously and independently online. To foster their sense of group belonging CPOL hosted in-person discussions at each main campus throughout the year, with one at the Dundalk Campus in the fall where 4 course takers met, one at Catonsville in the winter where 9 participated, and one at Essex in the spring with 11 classmates meeting. These events were valuable because it was the first time some course takers had ever met each other, and it helped put faces to names that they see in the online discussion boards. Twenty-two (71%) of 31 enrolled participants earned the full certificate at the end of the year.

The ACUE Soiree was really created with the yearlong ETP participants in mind; they are given a lapel pin from ACUE as another token of their completion. Fourteen completers attended the event and responded to the survey, and unanimously they indicated that they would take the course again after having been through it. Several eagerly nominated other faculty they think would benefit from the class, and several of those have since been contacted and enrolled in the course that will start next academic year.

## Connections: A Community of Teaching and Learning Scholars (Artificial Intelligence)

Faculty Learning Communities are a powerful professional learning opportunity for faculty members at CCBC. While Connections groups have been popular offerings since 2009 at CCBC, we were unable to run them during COVID. This year's topic for Connections was artificial intelligence (AI). We asked two full-time faculty members who were interested and well-versed in AI to design a curriculum for a Connections group with a focus on AI. Connections groups are usually capped at 10 faculty members, however, we had 14 apply for the group and we decided to accept all 14. The co-facilitators were Mary Jo Richards (English) and Lex Brown (Information Technology). The group met monthly for two hours and had a variety of both hands-on activities, presentations and discussions. Each member of the group undertook a project to include AI in their classes and report on their findings. In addition to these reports, the co-facilitators asked for input into an end-of-year feedback survey.

#### Culturally Responsive Teaching & Learning

The 2023-2024 academic year has been a period of significant growth and transformation for the Culturally Responsive Teaching and Learning (CRTL) program. Led by Maura Hill (English), Andre Ifill (Wellness), and Denise Parker (English), the program has expanded its initiatives and deepened its impact on both students and faculty at the Community College of Baltimore County (CCBC).

One of the key developments this year was the refinement and delivery of training modules tailored for diverse audiences. With a focus on inclusivity and cultural competence, the leadership team introduced new student training and faculty workshops, ensuring that the content was relevant and accessible to all participants.

In response to student feedback from winter workshops, the CRTL program enhanced its outreach by conducting classroom visits and virtual workshops. This approach allowed for the modification of existing modules to fit within standard class periods and ensured that the content was directly applicable to students' experiences. The program's efforts reached 18 different classes across multiple campuses and included five virtual workshops, reflecting a dynamic and adaptive strategy in delivering culturally responsive education.

The feedback collected from students highlighted the relevance of the CRTL modules to their personal lives and educational experiences, prompting the team to develop a conference presentation titled "What do Students Say?" This presentation, along with other keynotes and breakout sessions at the 9th Annual CRTL Conference, underscored the program's commitment to social justice education.

Throughout the year, the CRTL team continued to engage with faculty and staff through workshops offered by Human Resources and the Center for Organizational and Professional Learning. The program's presence at various conferences further amplified its reach, showcasing the importance of culturally responsive pedagogy in different educational settings.

Notably, the CRTL program reached a significant milestone by engaging 850 faculty, staff and students in workshops and events throughout the year. This impressive participation reflects the community's commitment to fostering an environment of equity and inclusion.

As we look forward to the upcoming summer seminars and the introduction of the CRTL 2.0 Faculty Alumni Workshop, the program remains dedicated to fostering an environment of equity, inclusion, and transformative education at CCBC. This year-end report encapsulates the milestones achieved and sets the stage for continued innovation and impact in the years to come.

#### Summary

The 2023-2024 academic year was marked by significant growth and transformation for the Center for Professional and Organizational Learning (CPOL) at CCBC, as it became part of the newly formed Institute for Transformational Teaching, Learning & Leadership (ITTLL). CPOL saw a substantial increase in professional development participation, with attendees rising by 70% from the previous year. Key initiatives included collaboration with the American Council on Education (ACUE) to enhance teaching practices, the "Connections" Faculty Learning Community focused on artificial intelligence, and the expansion of the Culturally Responsive Teaching & Learning program, which engaged 850 faculty, staff, and students. These efforts reflect a strong commitment to providing faculty, staff and students with professional learning committed to the success of all students.