

## **Community College of Baltimore County 2023 Institutional Performance Accountability Report**

The Community College of Baltimore County (CCBC) transforms lives by providing an accessible, affordable, and high-quality education that prepares students for transfer and career success, strengthens the regional workforce, and enriches our community.

### **INSTITUTIONAL ASSESSMENT**

The 2023 Performance Accountability Report (PAR) is the third report of a five-year reporting cycle. This performance accountability report addresses the three state goals included in the “2017-2021 State Plan for Postsecondary Education, Student Success with Less Debt” and includes content as prescribed by the Maryland Higher Education Commission (MHEC).

CCBC provides a multitude of educational services to a diverse student body. Understanding the unique characteristics of CCBC’s student body is vital to the college mission. The awareness of our students’ needs aids CCBC in working toward its benchmark goals and successfully meeting them by fiscal year 2025.

#### **Student Characteristics**

Consistent with trends seen at other Maryland Community Colleges and Community Colleges throughout the nation, there has been a decline in the Fall credit unduplicated headcount since Fall 2019. The headcount in Fall 2022 was 15,376 (Indicator A). The expansion of the Baltimore County and Maryland Community College Promise scholarships and the Maryland Blueprint, are expected to lead to increases in student headcount. Our enrollment numbers for Fall 2023 are already trending up (+2 percentage points) compared to Fall 2022. Scholarships through the Promise programs can be awarded to students pursuing credit programs as well as students pursuing Continuing Education workforce development programs. This could translate into increases in several indicators related to Access.

The majority (73.6%) of CCBC’s student population this year attended part time (Ind. Aa). A similar proportion required at least one developmental education course (74.1%) (Ind. B). The racial and ethnic distribution of the credit student population remained relatively stable from Fall 2021 (Ind. H) where the largest share of students identified as Black/African American (38.0%), followed by those identifying as White (35.0%). The percentage of Hispanic/Latino students increased slightly to 7.0% and Asians to 6.4%. Students from indigenous groups represented less than 1.0% of CCBC’s credit student population. At CCBC, as well as other community colleges in Maryland and nationwide, it is common for students taking Continuing Education courses to be older than students enrolled in credit courses and programs. In Fall 2022, 38.9% of credit students were 25 years old or older, compared to 85.8% of Continuing Education program students (Ind. F).

CCBC serves students from several special populations, including first-generation students, English language learners, and students with financial need. CCBC’s percentage of first-generation college students taking credit courses (27.3%) declined 8.2 percentage points since

FY 2021 (Ind. C), but the number of students enrolled in credit and Continuing Education English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) courses increased 39% from FY 2021 to 1,477 students after declining from 2,574 in FY 2019 (Ind. D). A larger share of CCBC's credit students received loans, scholarships and/or need-based financial aid in FY 2022 than in FY 2021 (up 13.1 percentage points) (Ind. Ea). The percentage of students receiving Pell Grants increased by 1.5 percentage points from FY 2021 (Ind. Eb).

In Fall 2022 the number of CCBC credit students enrolled exclusively in distance education rose to one-third (33.5%) compared to the pre-pandemic rate of 14.7% in Fall 2019 (Ind. Ia). Most courses were taught in a remote format after the onset of the pandemic in March 2020. In Fall 2020, 73.9% of credit students took all their courses online. In Fall 2021, CCBC began offering more courses on-campus and the rate dropped to 39.9%. This decline is an artifact of pandemic scheduling and masks the growth of CCBC's online enrollment.

### **State Plan Goal 1: Access**

CCBC is committed to providing an accessible, affordable, and high-quality education that prepares our students for transfer and career success. CCBC is an open access institution with a 100% acceptance rate for applicants. Through a pay-per-credit tuition model, rolling admissions, multiple term lengths, and multiple instructional modalities, CCBC makes higher education more affordable and convenient for a variety of students for whom full-time, full semester courses are not feasible. CCBC is focused on expanding CCBC Online now that we have emerged from the COVID-19 pandemic. CCBC Online offers a wide range of online courses and more than 60 online degree and certificate options with thousands of online courses, rolling admissions, and multiple start-dates.

CCBC provides access to credit bearing courses as quickly as possible for students who place into developmental education. Upon entrance to the college, degree and certificate-seeking students take placement tests which are used to determine which courses are appropriate for their skill level. Students have access to a Self-Directed Placement process whereby they can place directly into credit bearing English. Students who place below "college ready" through this or other placement processes take developmental courses in academic literacy or math. CCBC pioneered an accelerated approach to developmental education that allows students to access credit courses while simultaneously completing developmental education requirements. This leads to better retention and faster progress toward degree completion than completing all developmental education requirements prior to gaining access to the credit curriculum. The negative impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on high school students' educational progress makes the availability of accelerated options even more important over the next few years.

The academic ESOL program opens doors to opportunities such as improved language skills, associate degrees, professional certificates, transfer opportunities, and career advancement. Innovative teaching techniques help ESOL students to reach their goals through theme-based instruction, accelerated learning program, learning communities, online blended courses, and educational technology. The Continuing Education community based ESOL program offers classes to help non-native speakers learn English for community and workplace settings.

CCBC is meeting and/or exceeding the benchmarks for several indicators that fall under the Access goal of the State Plan. These are: high school student enrollment, annual enrollment in online/hybrid courses for credit and continuing education, percent of tuition/fees at MD public four-year institutions, at least one ESL educational functioning level for adult education student achievement, and percent nonwhite enrollment for credit and continuing education students.

CCBC continues to have success in granting high school students access to higher education. In Fall 2022, there were 1,814 credit students who were concurrently enrolled in high school and CCBC exceeding the Fall 2025 benchmark of 1,800 (Ind. 5). It is expected that the number of high school students will continue to increase due to the partnership between Baltimore County Public Schools (BCPS) and CCBC that allows high school students to take an unlimited number of courses (credit and continuing education), with the cost of tuition, fees, and books covered.

CCBC's annual tuition and fees for full-time students was \$5,016 in FY 2022 (Ind. 7a). CCBC has not raised annual tuition and fees since FY 2021. CCBC tuition and fees, as a percentage of Maryland public four-year institution tuition and fees, decreased from 51.1% to 49.9% (Ind. 7b).

Continuing Education headcount and course enrollment in community service and lifelong learning is moving towards meeting the benchmarks set for FY 2025 (Ind. 8a, b) Headcount and course enrollments in basic skills and literacy courses also increased in FY 2022 (Ind. 9a, b).

CCBC is making progress toward the Access goal of the State Plan in several other areas but is facing some challenges related to annual unduplicated headcount of credit students, market share of first-time, full-time students, market share of recent, college-bound high school graduates and at least one ABE functioning level for adult education student achievement.

## **State Plan Goal 2: Success**

CCBC offers programs to provide full-service student support, including academic advising, transfer counseling, tutoring, and other resources. College efforts are enhanced by federally funded TRIO programs targeted to serve first-generation, low-income students, and individuals with disabilities to progress through the academic pipeline from middle school to post baccalaureate programs. These programs are outreach and student service programs that are designed to identify and provide services for individuals from disadvantaged backgrounds.

There are a few indicators where we have remained stable and or increased slightly, but overall, CCBC has had a challenging year making progress on indicators that align towards the Success goal of the State Plan.

Student retention is an important measure of engagement and strongly linked to success and graduation. The fall-to-fall retention of first-time students decreased by 0.9 percentage points from the previous cohort (Ind. 14a). Fall-to-fall retention for first-time students with a Pell Grant decreased 1.2 percentage points from the Fall 2020 cohort (Ind. 14b). The fall-to-fall retention for first-time students identified as needing developmental work decreased by 2.3 percentage points and the retention for college-ready students increased by 2.1 percentage points from the previous cohort (Ind. 14c,d). CCBC is striving to increase retention for all students and will work

towards meeting the Fall 2024 Cohort benchmarks. CCBC is implementing a Holistic Student Support model to provide students with proactive advising and connect them to services that will help them remain in school and progress toward completion of their educational goals. For the Fall 2018 cohort, 39.6% of developmental students completed within four years of their entry (Ind. 15), moving closer to meeting the set benchmark.

The percentage of students successfully persisting after four years decreased for college-ready students from 78.5% to 78.2%, from 81.4% to 78.9% for developmental completers, from 34.7% to 31.3% for developmental non-completers and from 66.7% to 64.8% for all students in the cohort (Ind. 16a,b,c,d). CCBC has committed to implementing measures that help students complete their educational goals successfully and will strive towards meeting the benchmarks set for the Fall 2021 cohort.

The rate of white students and black/African American students successfully persisting has decreased from the previous cohort (Ind. 17a,b). The volatility of successful-persister rates for Asian and Hispanic/Latino students may, in part, be driven by the small size of their respective cohorts; both cohorts have fewer than 215 students each (Ind. 17c,d).

The percentage of college-ready students who graduated and/or transferred after four years is down 2.9 percentage points compared to the prior cohort and stands at 59.0% for the Fall 2018 cohort (Ind. 18a). The percentage of developmental completers graduating or transferring after four years and the percentage of developmental non-completers increased from the Fall 2017 cohort (Ind. 18b,c). The graduation-transfer percentage of all students in the Fall 2018 cohort remained stable from the previous cohort (Ind.18d). The college is committed to assisting students on their path to graduation and transfer and has established goals and initiatives to help us increase the number of students who graduate and/or transfer and will strive towards meeting the benchmarks set for the Fall 2021 cohort. CCBC groups incoming CCBC degree, certificate, and workforce training students into one of nine Pathways, based on the student's declared major or main area of interest. Students receive assistance in course selection as well as student success supports and activities geared toward successful degree and certificate completion, transfer and career success.

The graduation-transfer rates increased from the Fall 2017 cohort for white students (3.6 percentage points), and for Asian students (1.4 percentage points) and decreased from the Fall 2017 cohort for black/African American students (-3.6 percentage points), and Hispanic/Latino students (-3.0 percentage points) (Ind. 19a, b, c, d). CCBC continues to expand services to ensure completion and transfer opportunities for all CCBC students. The Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Advisory Council has also been charged with reviewing the data that shows the equity gaps in academic performance and completion of particular subsets of students and to develop active retention and completion initiatives to close those gaps.

In FY 2022, CCBC granted 2,520 credit awards to 2,412 graduates (Ind. 20a, d). Career degrees increased from FY 2021 by 9 awards (Ind. 20b) and transfer degrees decreased from FY 2021 by 203 awards (Ind. 20c). CCBC issued fewer credit certificates in FY 2022 than the number of credit certificates awarded in FY 2021 (Ind. 20d). CCBC is committed to moving towards the FY

2025 benchmark of 3,200 total awards by increasing student completion through various initiatives.

For AY 2021-2022, the percentage of CCBC students who transferred to a Maryland public four-year college/university and earned a GPA of 2.0 or above at the transfer institution was 83.9% which is moving towards the 85% benchmark set for AY 2024-2025 (Ind. 21).

The percentage of transfer program associate degree and certificate graduates who enrolled in a four-year college or university within a year after graduation from CCBC was 56.9%, a decrease of 4.0 percentage points from the previous fiscal year graduates (Ind. 22).

### **State Plan Goal 3: Innovation**

CCBC made progress towards the Innovation goal of the State Plan in the areas of graduates employed within one year, income growth of career program graduates, headcount and course enrollments for workforce development courses, professional education leading to certification or licensure, and in contract courses. CCBC faced challenges related to credit program pass rates in licensure/certification examinations required for employment.

CCBC offers 14 credit academic programs requiring external licensing and/or certification upon completion of the program. Pass rates declined for most programs between FY 2020 and FY 2021 but rebounded in FY 2022. Program completers continue to perform well on the external testing as evident in Indicator 23. Three programs are currently meeting or exceeding the benchmarks that have been set (Ind. 23e,f,j). The programs within the School of Health Professions strive to ensure all students are prepared to take required licensure examinations following completion of the program. Advising, mentoring, and career counseling services are provided to students in the School of Health Professions to ensure high licensure pass rates and occupational success. In previous years, this was an indicator that CCBC was meeting and/or exceeding the benchmarks in for most of the credit academic programs requiring external licensing and/or certification. CCBC will strive to meet benchmarks for more of the programs in the upcoming years.

Per data reported by the Maryland Longitudinal Data System (MLDS) Center, 86.4% of CCBC's FY 2021 graduates were employed in Maryland in the year after their graduation (Ind. 24). FY 2019 graduates from CCBC were earning a median income of \$26,304 one year prior to graduation and a median income of \$63,400 three years after graduation (Ind.25a,b).

CCBC is exceeding the benchmarks for annual course enrollments in continuing education workforce development courses and for annual headcount and annual course enrollments in continuing professional education leading to government or industry-required certification or licensure (Ind. 26b, 27a,b). CCBC is moving towards meeting the benchmarks for headcount in workforce development courses and for headcount and course enrollment for contract training courses. (Ind. 26a, 28a,b). CCBC offers a variety of Workforce Training Certificate programs that allow students to develop the knowledge and competencies that lead to job entry, industry credentials, and career advancement. Continuing education has rebounded from the COVID-19 pandemic and is well on its way to achieving the FY 2025 benchmarks.

## Response to Commission's Prompts

**Commission Prompt:** What are the largest long-term equity gaps that exist in student access, success, and innovation in your institution? How are these equity gaps uncovered/discovered/identified at your institution and how are they shared with your community? What interventions have been implemented to eliminate these gaps?

Two of the largest long-term equity gaps at CCBC relate to student success by race/ethnicity (all minoritized groups) and to student success by race/ethnicity and gender (particularly African American/Black males). These gaps are evident in relation to retention, course success, and completion/graduation going back as far as 2010 (in the case of course grades).

Equity gaps are identified through regular disaggregation of student outcome data. Our assessment activities at the program level, course level, and general education level also examine equity gaps and most college-wide initiatives, such as High Impact Practices (HIPs) implementations examine impact on student outcomes with attention to equity gaps. In addition, we examine Performance Accountability Report indicators related to student success for equity gaps and implement college-wide responses to address gaps.

Information on equity gaps is shared with the community via the college website and SharePoint. Information on retention and student success is also presented to the college community at mandatory events such as the annual Fall Focus meeting and the spring Professional Development Conference. Additional sharing takes place at the Teaching and Learning Roundtable Fair and the General Education/Developmental Education Symposium. At each of these events, CCBC faculty and staff also showcase efforts they have made to close equity gaps.

Key interventions we have implemented to eliminate equity gaps include:

- Offering placement reform and accelerated models of developmental education completion that reduce time spent in non-credit-bearing courses and promote faster progress toward program completion, particularly for students in minoritized groups who place into developmental education at higher rates
- Providing training in Culturally Responsive Teaching and Learning to help faculty and staff reduce barriers to success for students in racially minoritized groups
- Reinvigorating the Male Student Success Initiative (MSSI) to provide intensive support to male students of color
- Deploying High Impact Practices in several highly enrolled general education courses to promote student engagement and expose more students of color to these practices
- Launching a Student Achievement and Success initiative that produced a Holistic Student Support model that promotes achievement of early momentum metrics and program completion for all students, and

- Launching the Equity Gap Roundtable of the President’s Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Advisory Council to lead college-wide efforts to investigate and address outcome disparities.
- Including intervention plans that target specific modifications to help address equity gaps into Program Outcome Assessment Projects (POAPs), general education assessment projects, and course-level assessment projects (LOAs).

**Commission Prompt:** How has your institution used disaggregated data to identify equity gaps in students’ educational opportunities and outcomes? What stakeholder engagement (students, faculty, staff, etc.) is used to collect and review this data? Does your institution set goals/benchmarks in regard to the elimination of equity gaps? If so, what steps does your institution take to ensure accountability in meeting the established goals/benchmarks of equity?

CCBC has used disaggregated data to identify equity issues related to placement into developmental education, course success, retention to the next semester and next year, and completion/transfer. Disaggregated data are also examined during the Program Review process which every program goes through every five years. Gaps related to enrollment, retention, course success and completion are reviewed at the program level and program leaders are tasked with implementing projects to close identified gaps.

Stakeholders who engage in the collection and review of disaggregated data include faculty and staff serving in a variety of capacities. The Office of Planning, Research and Evaluation collects and shares college-wide data on retention, course success, and assessment outcomes. Faculty serve on teams for general education assessment and learning outcomes assessment projects in courses where they design, administer, and score assessments, then review results to identify opportunities for intervention. Faculty and staff serve together on committees such as the Student Achievement and Success Steering Committee (and its work groups), the Equity Gap Roundtable, the High Impact Practices Committee, and the Program Review Committee. Staff of specific projects such as the Male Student Success Initiative also review disaggregated data and implement plans to address outcome disparities

CCBC has not set goals or benchmarks for eliminating equity gaps but aims to make continuous progress toward closing gaps by implementing innovative strategies, evaluating their outcomes, and scaling up those that have a positive impact.

## **Community Outreach and Impact**

CCBC focuses on creating long term partnerships with business, community leaders, civic organizations, and other county institutions such as hospitals, government agencies, and public schools. CCBC places a strong emphasis on supporting and engaging with the communities it serves, as well as establishing partnerships within the greater Baltimore region. CCBC has a significant impact within each of the local communities it serves and within Baltimore County as a whole. The college president and the leadership team at CCBC, as well as campus and extension center directors, promote CCBC’s presence within Baltimore County and surrounding areas from their positions on local and regional boards, chambers of commerce, committees, and

associations. The three main campuses and the three extension centers are strategically placed to make a huge impact on Baltimore County both culturally and economically.

CCBC's Male Student Success Initiative (MSSI) hosted an internship exploration experience on the Dundalk campus that brought male students of color together with local businesses to learn about summer internships and the application process. Those attending, participated in networking, panel discussions, and breakout sessions with representatives from Whiting-Turner Contracting HQ, Xometry, MyBGE, CareFirst BlueCross BlueShield, Medstar Health, Comcast, Jovian Concepts, and other businesses. In preparation for the event, students attended a resume-writing workshop and received a free haircut.

CCBC's Center for Business Innovation hosted its 10<sup>th</sup> Annual Business Plan Competition Virtual Awards Banquet. The event featured the top 10 pitches from aspiring entrepreneurs, all of whom are CCBC students or alumni. The winners shared a total of \$62,500 in seed money to be used as start-up capital for their new or growing business.

CCBC hosted campers from Baltimore City as part of the BWI Thurgood Marshall Airport Summer Youth Initiative in August 2022. This Summer Youth Initiative introduces students to a wide range of career opportunities in aviation. Campers participated in flight simulator activities, drone activities, and an Environmental program, and visited CCBC's Benjamin Banneker Planetarium.

The B&O Railroad Museum and CCBC partnered to create a unique workforce training program called Restore Baltimore. Participants enroll as Continuing Education students at CCBC and work full-time at the B&O Railroad Museum for six months. This unique opportunity provides students with the opportunity to gain hands-on experience in tool and equipment usage, construction skills, and building maintenance and preservation. They also gain knowledge on rail safety, inspection, and operation while working on the rail lines. Participants are paid an hourly wage while they work at the museum.

During the Fall and Spring semesters, the office of College and Community Outreach Services holds an Awareness Fair bringing local organizations from the community onto each campus to share their resources with CCBC students, faculty, and staff. Hungry Harvest markets are also held each Fall and Spring semester on the three main campuses. These markets sell affordable produce to CCBC students, staff, and local communities. These markets are designed to sell affordable produce in areas that otherwise may not have access to fresh fruits and vegetables. Surplus produce that was not sold was donated to local community organizations.

CCBC's Office of Community Relations holds several events throughout the year that raise money to support scholarships and programs held at CCBC. There are two annual golf tournaments that raise money for emergency assistance and scholarships. A Fall Classic Raffle is held annually raising \$12,000 for scholarships and programs. CCBC also hosts an annual Bull roast and Gala to raise money for our students. Community members are encouraged to participate in these events.